

Generic Identity Theory for the Twenty-first Century: Towards grand unified approaches in identity formation, identity transformation and identity dilution or neutralization

Sujay Rao Mandavilli

Elk Asia Pacific Journal of Social Sciences Volume 5, Issue 3, 2019

Abstract

This paper proposes a generalized and a universal approach towards collective and individual identity formation, and one which is expected to work in practically every conceivable scenario across cultures. Our approach also has at its core, the concept of the 'Psychic unity of mankind' which implies that human thought processes, urges and impulses are essentially the same in all cultures and societies, though the nature of enculturation may vary from context to context. This approach works in globalized scenarios as well, and includes pro-active approaches for meaningful identity modulation. It also discusses the importance of identity dilution and neutralization to the extent it is realistically possible and desirable, and discusses the dangers of Identity polarization, while introducing several new concepts in this context. This approach is also linked with other frameworks such as Anthropological Pedagogy, the Sociology of Science, the latest theories in Cognitive Psychology and Human growth and development, and all the other concepts of the Symbiotic Approach to Socio-cultural change i.e., the Theory of Cultural and Societal orientations, the Theory of Mind-orientation, the Ethnography of Mindspace, the Ethnography of Enculturation and Acculturation. More importantly, our approach is consistent with our philosophy of the 'Globalization of Science', and discourages intellectual elitism and ivory-tower scholarship though Ethnographic fieldwork in diverse, representative contexts. This approach has been developed after analyzing different subjects and case studies from varied contexts, and comprises many recommendations such as ethnographic fieldwork in diverse contexts and pedagogical reform to modulate identity for better ethnic and communal harmony.

Introduction

The term 'society' can be traced to the Latin term 'socius' which means companionship or friendship. Different Anthropologists and Sociologists have ruminated over the meaning of society at different points in time. Anthropologists and Sociologists such as George Simmel, August Comte, G H Mead, Emil Durkheim, Morris Ginsberg, Frank Henry Giddings, Stephen Cole, John F. Cuber, Robert Morrison Maclver and Talcott Parsons have written on the characteristics of society from time to time. According to them, a society takes birth due to man's characteristics as a social animal. It comprises of a complex, multi-layered web of human relationships that are symbiotic and mutually interdependent. Societies are often analysed and studied functionally or structurally. A functional analysis encompasses an analysis of mutually dependant functions, while a structural analysis divides society into mores, folkways, institutions, habits, sentiments, and ideals. A society typically includes commonalities, differences, functions, and well-defined attributes. Many different definitions have been proposed for the term society. According to the eminent Psychology Professor Ian Robertson, "A society is a group of interacting individuals sharing the same territory and participating in a common culture." According to Robert Morrison Maclver and Charles H. Page, "Society is a system of usages and procedures, of authority and mutual aid, and many groupings and divisions, of controls of human behaviour, and of liberties. This ever-changing, complex system, we call society." According to H.M. Johnson, "Society is a group of groups. People collect together to form groups. A group of groups is a society".^{1 2}

From an Anthropological perspective, every society has a culture, or one or more cultures, which vary in character and complexity. Culture is unique to humans, is a by-product of intellect, and varies widely from society to society. Culture is non-biological and non-genetic, and cultures have similarities as well as differences between them. Among the earliest definitions of culture was given by EB Tylor in his book 'Primitive Culture' in 1871, in which he stated, "Culture or civilization is that complex whole which includes knowledge, beliefs, arts, morals, law, customs, capabilities and habits acquired by man as a member of society. Similar definitions were also provided by Bronislaw Malinowski, Melville J. Herskovitz, and others. According to the neo-evolutionist Leslie A. White, who proposed a taxonomical definition of culture, "Culture is dependent upon symboling... culture consists of tools, implements, utensils, clothing, ornaments, customs, institutions, beliefs, rituals, games, works of art, language etc". Materialist Marvin Harris stated, "A culture is the total socially acquired life-way or life-style of a group of people. It consists of the patterned, repetitive ways of thinking, feeling, and acting that are characteristic of the members of society or a particular segment of society." American Anthropologist Clifford Geertz preferred an interpretivist approach, and spoke about symbols, motivations, moods and thoughts forming a part of culture. According to him, culture was a system of inherited conceptions

¹ Society: A brief introduction by Ian Robertson, Worth Publishers, 1988

² Society: an introductory analysis, R.M Maclver and Charles H. Page, Holt, Rinehart and Winston, New York, 1949

expressed in symbolic forms by means of which we communicate, perpetuate, and develop their knowledge about, and attitudes towards life.”³

According to Anthropologist John H Bodley, culture is comprised of what people think, what they do, and the material products they produce. American Anthropologist A.L Kroeber categorized aspects of culture into two broad categories i.e. ethos and eidos. Ethos refers to the values of a culture such as aspirations and beliefs, and these must also be included in an analysis. Eidos is the cognitive part of culture, and is the underlying philosophy between all thought and action. Clyde Kluckhohn also differentiated between the explicit and implicit values of a culture. Explicit values of a culture were those that could be easily perceived, expressed, and identified by sensory organs. However, implicit values included elements such as motivations and impulses.

A culture has many characteristics: it is learned, it is transmitted from generation, it is shared among members of society, and it is often comprised of integrated systems with values, sanctions and belief systems. A culture also comprises of universals which are common to every culture, though they also comprise attributes that vary from culture to culture. British Anthropologist Siegfried Fredrick Nadel stresses the importance of differentiating between culture and society. According to him, culture is the way of life of a set of people, while society is an organized, interacting aggregate of individuals who follow a given way of life. Society is therefore, an aggregation of individuals, while the way they behave is culture. (Nadel, 2006) Thus, society is a collection of individual members pursuing their interests in the context of formal rules administered by specialists, and implemented by the state, and culture is produced with the context of that society and its socio-economic structure. (Pertierra, 2004) (Herawati, 2006)

The concept of Social organization is another important concept which is used to describe the sum total of activities performed in the context of a given culture. This concept also takes into consideration the different roles played by individuals in society, and in relation to one another in society. This idea was first proposed and refined by Herbert Spencer, Emile Durkheim and others, and Bronislaw Malinowski and Radcliffe Brown used it to explain the idea of functionalism. The idea of social structure and social relationships has also been expanded upon in more recent times by Claude Levi Strauss, Murdock, Edmund Leach, S F Nadel, Rodney Needham and Raymond Firth, and the idea of individuation and identity-formation must be understood in the context of social relations as well. (Murdock 1949) (Firth (1951))

Cultures may also comprise of multiple social groups. According to Anderson and Parker (1966), “Groups are units of two or more people meeting in the same environment, or overcoming distance by some means of communication, which also influence each other psychologically. The distinctive bond of the group is reciprocal interaction. Friends in conversation, a committee in action, and children playing together are examples.” Members of different social groups usually share similar socio-economic variables and may have similar education levels, and occupation patterns. In a strictly geographical

³ Anthropology Carol R.Ember, Melwin Ember, Peter N. Peregrine, 12th Edition, Pearson Education Inc. 2008

sense, this may be referred to as a neighbourhood. Thus, members of different social groups are exposed to different sets of ideas, and this impacts their process of identity formation.

There are many different theories of cultural change. One is the unilinear school of cultural change, proposed by EB Tylor which is now outdated. Other models such as multi-linear evolution (Julian Steward, Leslie White, Marshall Sahlins, Elman Service), Historical Particularism (Franz Boas), and Culture and Personality school (Ruth Benedict, Margaret Mead, Abram Kardiner, Ralph Linton, Geoffrey Gorer), Functionalism (Bronislaw Malinowski) and Structuralism (Claude Levi Strauss) have also been proposed. In a previous set of papers, we had introduced the Symbiotic School of socio-cultural change, which we believed was more appropriate for the rapidly globalizing framework of the twenty-first century. Needless to say, this changed scenario is likely to impinge of identity formation as well.

A change is an alteration that takes place in an object, or organism, or environment over time. Social change, cultural change and socio-cultural change are co-related and can be used interchangeably. Kingsley Davies defines social change as follows: "By social change is meant only such alterations as occur in social organizations, that is, structure and functions of society." According to a definition provided by MacIver and Page, "Social change refers to a process responsive to many types of changes; to changes in the manmade conditions of life; to changes in the attitudes and beliefs of men, and to the changes that go beyond the human control to the biological and physical nature of things." Thus, cultural and social change is universal and takes place in societies throughout the world, but to varying degrees and varying rates. It is also a continuous process, though the rates of change may vary across time. According to John Lewis Gillin & John Phillip Gillin (1948), "Social changes are variations from the accepted modes of life; whether due to alteration in geographical conditions, in cultural equipment, composition of the population, or ideologies and whether brought about by diffusion or inventions within the group." Social changes also be imposed from outside, generated from within, driven by elites, or may be as a result of grassroots movements. They may also be slow or rapid.

The idea of a personal identity is inexorably tied as much to social and cultural norms, as it is to the idea of individuation based on the uniqueness of every individual, and is often a chief source of meaning and experience (Castells 2010). It is also tied to the idea of enculturation which happens in every culture or society. Enculturation may be defined as the gradual acquisition, particularly during childhood and adolescence of the characteristics and norms of a culture or a person. This may be his native culture or another culture he is exposed to or is a resident in. According to Conrad Phillip Kottak, "Enculturation is the process where the culture that is currently established teaches an individual the accepted norms of the culture or society where the individual lives. The individual can become an accepted member, and fulfil the needs, functions and roles of the group, and learns what behaviour is acceptable in the group."

In certain cases, the word acculturation is also used where two cultures are involved, and adaptation to the new culture is needed. (We also prefer the term 'co-enculturation' for truly multi-cultural contexts) in addition, two or more cultures can influence each other either peripherally or to a significant degree, even though they are not in direct contact, and this is indeed one of the hallmarks of a post-globalized age. Researchers have also attempted to study different aspects of enculturation in a wide variety of contexts. These include Sigmund Freud, Claude Levi-Strauss, and Jean Piaget. Of late, there have been

attempts to link these to standard theories of human growth and development and a study of variation among cultures.

The term 'identity' stems from the Latin word *idem* which means same. The idea of identity stems from society or culture and may also be defined at a social group or an individual level: The former particularly influences the latter, but there is always a multi-layered differentiation. Thus, the idea of categorization is at the core of identity studies. (Jackson 2002) Theories and concepts in identity formation are widely used by anthropologists, sociologists, psychologists and philosophers in their research. Identity formation may be collective or individual, and the latter are particularly influenced by the former. Individual identities also reflect an individual's own ambitions, urges and aspirations as shaped by society and yet are seldom fixed or permanent; they constantly evolve due to an individual's interactions with society. The relationship is usually bi-directional because a society produces individuals and individuals in turn shape society to varying degrees. Thus, an individual's personality is shaped by complex forces which include geography, physical environment, cultural factors and unique personal experiences. Socially-shaped forces may be over-ridden by an individual's unique experiences in most cases, producing a wide range of permutations and combinations, and leading to outliers and mavericks.

The issues of self and identity are often used in Symbolic-interactionist theories which were first formulated by sociologist such as Herbert Blumer, G H Mead and C H Cooley and based on ground work carried out by the American psychologist John Dewey. According to such theories, 'self reflects society' or 'society shapes self' and this in turn shapes social behaviour. This school of thought postulates that human behaviour must be understood in relation to the environment and may therefore be referred to as a bi-directional approach. Berger and Gluckmann have called this relationship a "dialectic operation" (1967). Cooley also spoke about "Looking glass self" (Individual shaped by his views about himself) and through his interactions with Social groups such as Primary and Secondary groups, a concept he proposed in 1909 in his book 'Social Organization: Human Nature and Social Order'. (Cooley 1909; Mead 1934; Blumer 1969) However, society itself is highly differentiated on the basis of social class, gender, ethnicity, age, religion etc. Thus, all these dimensions may impact a person's identity to varying degrees.

4

Identity formation is also based on a persisting entity known as personal continuity. The Personal Continuity theory states that there is a gradual build-up in a person's ideas since birth, and that the build up of ideas is more or less a continuous or a gradual process. This is akin to a *tabula rasa* or a blank slate. A human comes into this world with nothing and is neutral to all ideas, with the possible exception to some basic notions of right or wrong. Thoughts are then accumulated and built on and form the basis of new thoughts received. Thus, the sum total of thoughts and ideas of different individuals become unique over time. This process is typically understood in diachronic or synchronic terms, or a combination of the two. According to Daniel Shapiro, identity may not be static, but continuously changing and evolving. Likewise, according to Malcolm David Eckel, the self changes at every moment, and has no static identity. Thus, identity is continuously reinterpreted through the process of interaction

with the society and world at large. Influencing factors include the hierarchy of the society, caste, religion, class etc, and the relationship with the world at large. It is therefore, a complex process through which the individual and collective identity gets reconstructed, reformed and rejuvenated constantly. Another related approach, The 'Narrative psychology' approach also views the development of the self as a continuous process of life-story construction. People create scripts, and live out their lives in accordance with this script which rarely changes. The identity process model of Susan Krauss Whitbourne (1987) attempts to explain how identity changes and is based on work by Erikson, James Marcia and Piaget. Whitbourne views identity as an organizing schema through which an individual's experiences are interpreted. (Whitbourne and Conolly 1999) Identity is determined by the accumulated perceptions of the self, both conscious and sub-conscious. Thus, perceived personality traits, physical characteristics and cognitive abilities determine the identity schema. According to Hall (Hall 1990), cultural identity is formed and redefined continuously as a result of complex and ever-changing patterns of interaction between the afore-mentioned elements. Thus, the process of identity-building is largely socio-cognitive, and one of the pillars of identity formation is resultantly social identity theory which also emphasizes contextual responsiveness, group behaviour and intergroup relations and was first developed by John Turner and Henri Tajfel in 1979. Thus new patterns of identity are constantly produced, and there is an element of plasticity in the process of identity formation. (Barker and Galasinki (2001)). Gerontologists also believe there is a desire to maintain a sense of continuity till death.⁵

There are two primary identity styles. As per the assimilating identity style, new experiences are fitted into existing schema, while as per the accommodative identity style, the schema is adjusted to fit the new experience. In between the two, there can exist a balanced identity style which is desirable in most cases. The process of identity formation also changes with age, and old people may be more balanced and experimentative in their pursuits.

Identity is also shaped by self-perception and an internalization of a culture's attributes, and both these factors are subject to constant change producing new paradigms constantly. Furio Cerutti believes that identity is primarily shaped by self-perception and self-awareness. (Ceruti 2001) Others such as Howson (2004) believe that an individual's identity is also largely shaped by others perceptions of him. These are therefore inter-individual processes of how reflected appraisals from others contribute to a definition of the self. According to the American Sociologist Manuel Castells (Castells 1997), identities may provide meanings and expressions to individuals themselves and are bi-directionally related to the ethos of a society. The process of identity formation is now also inevitably and inexorably tied to twenty-first century realities such as globalization and the gradual move towards a homogenized culture and the coming together of new thoughts and ideas to produce altogether new paradigms. This may never be realized completely, and there are opposing forces such as glocalization, and the persistence of individual cultures and identities.^{6 7 8}

⁵ Cultural Anthropology: Appreciating Cultural Diversity, Conrad Phillip Kottak, Fifteenth edition, McGraw Hill International Edition

⁶ Blumer, Herbert. 1969. *Symbolic Interactionism: Perspective and Method*. Englewood Cliffs, NJ: Prentice-Hall.

Identity theory also owes a great deal to structural symbolic interactionism which is a sociological theory that discusses people's ability to develop images in social and cultural contexts, and often in relation to one another. (Stryker 1980) (Tajfel 1978) Theories on Social Categorization, which classify individuals based on attributes into groups and their identification or association with such groups, also plays an important role. This has also led to studies on ethnocentrism (Grant and Brown 1995), group polarization (Wetherell 1987), and group cohesiveness (Hogg 1987) based on self-esteem, a feel-good factor, association, conscious or sub-conscious comparison, self-categorization and differentiation. Another important determinant is the Social role theory which analyzes what roles individuals play in societies – these may be ascribed, prescribed or assumed roles. All these theories and ideas developed more or less independently, but subsequently cross-influenced each other. Thus, identity theories may be broadly classified into two groups – the first group analyzes identity formation from a perceptive and a cognitive approach, and the second from a group dynamics approach.⁹

Questions about identity are also very common in popular culture: The 2002 film, 'The Bourne Identity', based on Robert Ludlum's film of the same name, and Czech-born French writer Milan Kundera's book 'Identity' from 1999, largely deal with identity-based themes. Countless popular films and books across the world, deal with the topic of identity either directly or indirectly as this is a topic of great interest to the general laity.

The process of identity formation is almost exclusively non-biological and non-genetic except where a superiority, inferiority or a persecution complex arising from ethno-biological identity is a contributor. An example of this is awareness of one's skin colour in contrast to that of the population which leads to differentiation and identity formation. This is however, expected to be a peripheral factor in a vast majority of cases.¹⁰

Many different approaches have been proposed to study the process of identity formation. According to John Locke, personal identity is founded on consciousness or memory, not on the soul or the body. Other popular theories of Identity formation include psychological-based theories such as Erik Erikson's theory of psychosocial development and James Marcia's identity status theory, and a summary of these theories is provided below, to show the diversity of theories currently available in the field.¹¹

According to Erikson's line of reasoning, each person may experience different kinds of internal or external conflicts and crises at various stages of his life irrespective of his cultural background. Each of the conflicts must be resolved to proceed to the next stage. The stage most crucial to identity formation occurs during adolescence, as is referred to as "Identity versus Role Confusion." In the "Identity versus Role Confusion" stage, adolescents try to determine who they are in order to chalk out a basic identity for life. This crisis is usually resolved slowly and culminates in identity resolution which is arrived at after

⁷ Castells, M., 2010. The Information Age: Economy, Society and Culture Volume 1: The Rise of the Network Society. 2nd ed. Oxford: Wiley Blackwell.

⁸ Cooley C H, 1909 Social Organization: Human Nature and Social order, New York, Charles Scribner's sons

⁹ IDENTITY THEORY AND SOCIAL IDENTITY THEORY Peter J. Burke, Jan E. Stets, Washington State University

¹⁰ Group identity and Social Preferences, by Yan Chen and Sherry Xin Li, American Economic Review 2009, 99:1, 431–457

¹¹ SELF AND SOCIAL IDENTITY, Naomi Ellemers, Russell Spears, and Bertjan Doosje, Annu. Rev. Psychol. 2002. 53:161–86

evaluating various goals and values. They then enter the next stage which is called "Intimacy versus Isolation" where they form friendships and bonds with others. If the "Identity versus Role Confusion" crisis is not solved, an adolescent will develop a confused identity and lack of role definition which may mar his future prospects considerably.

According to a theory furnished by James Marcia, adolescents can be classified into one of four statuses of identity such as Identity diffusion or Role Confusion (marked by a presence of identity crisis), Identity foreclosure (marked by unquestioned acceptance of societal norms), Identity Moratorium (deferment of achievement), Identity Achievement (Achievement by solving identity issues). The identity statuses are used to describe an adolescent's identity formation process on various core values such as norms and religion.¹²

Social movements and collective action also facilitate transformation of collective, and therefore personal identity. This may also lead to the transformation of serie or atomized individuals into groups of fusion (Sartre (1960)), or, in Marxist-speak, from class-in-itself, to class-for-itself. In the former stage, workers become aware of the mechanics of protest, and in the latter develop the awareness to form a proletariat as opposed to the bourgeoisie. These actions, in turn, lead to a change in individual identity. While collective actions are important, they are wholly random and irregular, and their manifestation and outcome cannot be predicted with any degree of precision. Collective movements have often remained latent for a long time due to lack of awareness or inaction, or have manifested themselves at irregular intervals, examples being the movement for Telangana statehood in India. Hence, an institutionalized approach is warranted. Although generational changes do occur as horizontal factors supersede or override vertical ones, such changes are bound to be slow and non-uniform, and hence scientifically-structured systems driven by ethnographic data are required.¹³

Our approaches lay emphasis on both a psychic unity of mankind, and a proactive approach to identity change and transformation towards an idealized goal. Thus, per our approach, identity formation is typically a universalized process, which can be generalized and codified, though the content and nature of enculturation and acculturation may vary in individual cases. Identity-neutralization to the extent possible- this is never completely possible- is another goal of our paper. This must be executed through a variety of approaches such as the 'Ethnography of Enculturation', the 'Ethnography of Education' and the 'Ethnography of Mindspace' ultimately culminating, among other things, in re-designed education systems. Anthropological Pedagogy is an exciting new field, and so is the Sociology of Science.¹⁴

Identity formation is also greatly impacted by Personality development and the most popular Personality development theories were provided by Sigmund Freud and Erik Ericson. Sigmund Freud proposed different stages in personality development such as the Oral stage, the Anal stage, the Phallic stage, the Latent period, and the Genital stage while Ericson divided the human lifespan into various

¹² Handbook of Self and Identity, Edited by Mark R. Leary June Price Tangney, THE GUILFORD PRESS, New York London

¹³ THE PAST, PRESENT, AND FUTURE OF AN IDENTITY THEORY, Sheldon Stryker Indiana University, Peter J. Burke, Washington State University

¹⁴ Identity Theory and Social Identity Theory Author(s): Jan E. Stets and Peter J. Burke Source: Social Psychology Quarterly, Vol. 63, No. 3 (Sep., 2000), pp. 224-237

buckets, proposing, unlike Freud, that Personality development was an ongoing process that continued until late in life. Freud also proposed that the human mind possessed a three-tier system consisting of superego (screening function), ego (mediation function) and id (identity maintenance function). Most psychoanalysts also agree that personality and temperament are determined very early in life, a few even holding that there are significant variations and type categorizations at birth. Most psychoanalysts also hold that personality types can only be changed with some amount of difficulty, and under the rarest of circumstances, while some others like Carl Jung even argue that this is highly unlikely in practical situations. The determination of personality traits at birth (To explain great men or geniuses in unlikely situations) however appears implausible or directly non-observable, but must be proven empirically through suitably-designed indirect techniques if the matter is to be satisfactorily resolved. The nature versus nurture debate (inborn characteristics versus experiential influences) has thus been a long-standing debate in psychology and human growth and development.

Culture also plays a major role in personality development. This has been reinforced through various studies. For example, parents interact with a child constantly from his infancy thus shaping his personality and worldviews from a young age. A child's personality is also formed by a peer-interaction process and one time or recurrent exposure to different types of situations. A famous school which tried to identify the interrelationship between personality and culture is the 'Culture and Personality' school which comprised a wide gamut of theories, but is now largely considered to be obsolete in its traditional form. This school evolved as a reaction to old-fashioned Unilinear theories of evolution and diffusionist theories. Leading proponents of this school were Ruth Benedict, Margaret Mead, Ralph Linton, Abram Kardiner and Cora du Bois, and this school of thought was heavily influenced by the theories of Sigmund Freud. Sigmund Freud was a controversial but influential western-oriented psychoanalyst who proposed bizarre ideas such as that of the "Oedipus complex" where a son developed a sexual attraction towards his mother. He also developed the Critical Periods Hypothesis in which he proposed that most personality traits were developed from a very young age.

Another advocate of Culture and Personality was Ralph Linton who developed the idea of Basic personality, Status personality, Inventors, achieved status, ascribed status etc. According to him, there were three types of culture i.e. real or actual culture, ideal culture or normative culture and cultural constructs or perceived culture. Basic personality was the most basic personality type while social inventors were rare. Status personality or ascribed status were not achieved due to self-effort, but were bestowed by society.

Another important concept is that of Group Personality which largely ignores individual variations and studies the personality of a group as a whole. Another view, known as the Two-systems view, was developed by Alex Inkeles, Levinson and Melford Spiro. According to this theory, culture and personality, including socio-cultural institutions interact with each other to balance each other. Each of the two components has interdependent parts and requirements for its maintenance. A certain degree of

stability is reached only when individuals satisfy their psychological needs and their socio-cultural expectations at the same time.^{15 16}

Edward Sapir, one of the eminent students of Franz Boas, investigated the relationship between language, personality and culture. He along with his student Benjamin Whorf, developed a theory in the 1920's which later came to be known as the Sapir-Whorf hypothesis or the Whorfian hypothesis. The roots of this theory can however be traced to the works of Johann Gottfried von Herder and Wilhelm von Humboldt in the Eighteenth Century. According to this theory, language can shape the world-views of people and in many cases help them grasp multiple concepts including abstract concepts and subtle differences in meaning. Thus, this theory constitutes a form of linguistic determinism, but weaker versions may be construed as linguistic relativism. An extension of this proposes that language shapes cultural world views of individuals as well.

According to Bronfenbrenner's Ecological System theory of Individual and Social Development, an individual may be shaped by his own attributes such as sexual orientation, and his continuous interaction with different layers of the environment. The environment may include the Microsystem (Family, peers, school, church), Mesosystem, Exosystem (Industry, neighbours, mass media, local politics, social services) and Macrosystem (Attitudes and ideologies of the culture). These interact in various ways to shape the identity of the individual.¹⁷

Other researchers have introduced concepts such as Primary socialization and Secondary socialization. In Primary socialization, identity of self is first conceived early in life, and reinforced by Secondary socialization. Secondary socialization starts when a child ventures out into the outside world and begins to interact with it. Thus, education is a part of Secondary socialization, though some consider primary education to be a part of both primary socialization and secondary socialization.¹⁸

A concept core to identity formation is the Theory of Associationism which explains how ideas combine in the mind to formulate fresh ideas and perspectives. Thus, a person may form an autobiographical memory, and consonant or dissonant self-perception and worldviews over a period in time, and these are shaped by culture, society, environment, and the person's unique personal experiences. We must reiterate that the process of identity formation may not be smooth. Ideas that are not compatible with each other or perceived to be incompatible with each other can be received either at the same time or sequentially.

This leads to what one calls 'Cognitive dissonance'. Cognitive dissonance is an outcome of a fallout of lack of consistence in real-world experience. This theory was famously propounded by Leon Festinger in 'A theory of Cognitive Dissonance (1957)'. A plethora of contradictory ideas and viewpoints often makes

¹⁵ Culture, Behavior and Personality, Robert A Levine 1982

¹⁶ Patterns of Culture, Ruth Benedict, 1934 Boston, Houghton Mifflin.

¹⁷ Social Identities, Group Formation, and the Analysis of Online Communities, Jillianne R. Code Simon Fraser University, Canada Nicholas E. Zaparyniuk Simon Fraser University, Canada

¹⁸ Loughborough University Institutional Repository, Social identity theory and self categorization theory.

a person uncomfortable, and he may undergo a great deal of stress as a result. This is based on the theory of consonant or consistent relationship between ideas, dissonant relationships, and irrelevant relationships. Cognitive Dissonance may also be spatial (arising due to interactions with society or the world at large), or temporal (thoughts or experiences misaligned with earlier thoughts or experiences). Cognitive Dissonance may arise within an individual, between individuals, between individuals and society, between society and the world at large, or between two different societies. However, in our view, cognitive dissonance is a part and parcel of daily life, and is not heeded to unless it crosses a certain threshold which may vary from individual to individual. For example, an individual may attend religious congregations and be a part of scientific forums at the same time, without feeling the slightest degree of discomfort or attempting a rationalization or a reconciliation between two apparently disparate worldviews. If it however crosses this threshold, it may lead to a critical and ground-up reassessment of a person's ideas, and may even shake up his value or belief systems to the point of no return. This may cause immeasurable trauma and agony, and may breed exaggerated reactions. This may be described as a yoyo pattern, and equilibrium may not come quickly or easily, with the new-found hostility being directly proportional to the strength of formerly held beliefs. This apparently happened in the case of Babasaheb Ambedkar, Dalit writer Kancha Ilaiah, Islamic apostates Ayaan Hirsi Ali, Wafa Sultan, and Pakistani-American writer Muhammed Syed, all of whom turned hostile towards their former ideologies.

Cognitive Dissonance may also be self-reinforcing. It may reinforce previously held views and entrench them ever more deeply, thus acting as an identity reinforcer. One example that we would like to present here is the treatment of Muslims in China by the Chinese Government. Their approach, conceived in Communist ideology, may be far from logical and may only serve to make matters worse, reinforcing the adherents' belief in Islam, instead of diluting it. Self-reinforcing Cognitive Dissonance may reinforce belief in an empirically provable fact. It may also reinforce belief in a falsehood that is believed to be true. In some cases, it may reinforce belief in an unproven fact or set of ideas, or fuzzy facts or fuzzy sets of ideas. The entire process itself may be referred to as fuzzy logic or fuzzy reasoning. This concept is loosely related to reinforcement, personalization and de-personalization in cognitive and social identity theory, but is by no means the same. Thus, there is a risk that Richard Dawkins' hard-nosed atheism, may boomerang and achieve exactly the opposite of what this gentleman is seeking to achieve: an enforced belief in God and religion. The ISIS's deviant ways have also instilled faith in Christianity among some sections of Muslims in the Middle East, particularly in formerly ISIS-held towns such as Kobani in Syria, and have greatly strengthened nascent Christian networks.^{19 20}

In addition, the following are the types of identity associated with Manuel Castell's framework, and this would have some bearing on the process of identity formation. Identity can also have a bearing on political movements, and most political movements have historically centered on the issue of identity and belonging (Calhoun 1994) (Yuval-Davis 2010). As Jeffrey Prager notes in this regard, "identity politics is a cognitive map for actor to orient themselves towards others." (Prager 2009):

¹⁹ Psychology and Life, Golden Edition, Phillip G. Zimbardo, Harper Collins, 1985

²⁰ The Information Age: Economy, Society or Culture, Manuel Castells, 1997

Legitimizing identity: This type of identity refers to the identity associated with a dominant group in a given society. These identities usually try to maintain religious, caste or communal harmony through implicit self or power or by maintaining their domination. However, such identities may be neutral to the feelings of resistance identities and may oppose project identities. In India, this identity may be associated with dominant caste groups, and may have produced movement such as the ongoing right-wing Hindutva movement. Such identities however sometimes produce effects that are beneficial to society and may be associated with the build-up of patriotic, religious or nationalistic sentiments given their general access to education, knowledge and technology vis-à-vis other social groups, and their propensity for homogenization.

Resistance identities: These types of identities are created by individuals who are devalued, stigmatized or shamed by a particular social order or hierarchy, and whose identity and ethnic or cultural pride has been suppressed. Such identities may actively rebel against the existing status quo, and seek to establish a new social order. This group may manifest popular discontentment and aggressiveness and rebelliousness. Examples of such identities were that of Dalits in India, and Blacks and coloreds in Apartheid-era South Africa, all of which produced popular emancipatory movements and a transformation from 'serie' to 'groups en fusion'. This is similar to the Marxist concept of 'class-in-itself' to 'class-for-itself'. Another case in point is the anti-Tamil pogrom of Sri Lanka of 1983 which led to the emergence of the LTTE under Velupillai Prabhakaran, and other similar militant groups: similar movements of this kind manifest themselves with unflinching regularity in different parts of the world. The latter is associated with indignation, action and change as opposed to resignation and the acceptance of status quo. Some such movements also attempt to restore a mythical lost world or a golden age of the past. Identities may sometimes begin as resistance identities or later transform into Legitimizing identities. (Castells, 1997) (Longman, 2010)

Project identities: This type of identity arises when a new kind of identity (which may also be arrived at due to popular resistance or a negotiated compromise) is sought to be forged. (Castells, 1997) This identity attempts, and in some cases, successfully achieves a change in social structure towards greater equality and freedom. These identities interface in networked societies to produce altogether new paradigms. In due course, such identities may lose their power or distinctive attributes, but this may not happen quickly or easily. One outcome may be a "Yoyo type change" which was discussed in our paper. For resistance identities, this may proceed from submissiveness to belligerence, and then stabilization. For legitimizing identities, it may proceed from dominance, resistance to change in status quo, acceptance of change, and readjustment.

Personality types

The term 'Personality' originated from the Latin word *persona* which referred to masks actors wore when they portrayed or depicted characters. Different psychologists have attempted different definitions of the term 'personality' at different points in time. In Watson's view, "Personality is the sum of activities that can be discovered by actual observations over a long period to give reliable information." (Watson, 1930) According to Morton Prince, "Personality is the sum total of all the

biological innate dispositions, impulses, tendencies, appetites and instincts of the individual and the disposition and tendencies acquired by experience". (Prince, 1929) E. A. Hoebel defined personality as follows, implying that culture shapes personality "Personality is the sum of integrated behavioural traits which are analogous to the culture of a society. The body constitution, the physical environment and the culture combine to produce the personality structure of an individual. Enculturation encompasses the whole universe of the individual, so that he learns to internalize the norms of that particular culture. The process involves selection as well as elimination of multiple kinds of behaviour that an individual indulges." According to a more recent definition, "Personality is the more or less stable and enduring organization of a person's character, organization, physique, intelligence and temperament which determines his unique adjustment to the environment (Eysenck, 1971) ²¹

A personality type refers to the psychological classification of individuals into different categories based their qualitative attributes such as rationality, extrovertness or introvertness, empathy, cognitive abilities, and emotional quotient.

Even though the idea of personality is too vague and misleading from our perspective, the school of 'Culture and Personality' as a distinct school in Cultural Anthropology once stood proud and tall, and was an important part of Anthropological studies in general. Ruth Benedict, a student of Franz Boas, and the author of the famous book 'Patterns of Culture' (1934), carried out a study on Native American studies, and her work opened new windows between culture, personality development and psychology. According to her, cultural patterns were formed when cultural traits and complexes became related to each other in functional roles. Likewise, many cultural patterns integrate themselves into a functional whole to form the blueprint of the culture as a whole. According to her, the 'special genius' of humans which could be either Apollonian or Dionysian, played an important role in bringing about this integration. The former was associated with peace, discipline and kindness, while the latter was associated with aggression. This approach was used by her in the study of the Zuni and Kwakiutl tribes, whose members presented a contrast in cultural attributes. The people of Zuni, for example, were subdued and mellow, while those of Kwakiutl were ambitious and radical. This was also reflected in the child-rearing practices of the two tribes which laid the foundations for their respective behaviours. ²²

Margaret Mead also studied the relationship between culture and personality in her book, 'Coming of age in Samoa' (1949), a study of Samoan adolescent girls, and her work was supported by Edward Sapir and others. She also studied the personal characteristics of the people of three different cultures, namely the Arapesh, the Mundugumor, and the Tschambuli which were found to be vastly different from one another. For example, the people of Mundugumor society were found to be aggressive and belligerent, while people in Arapesh society were submissive. Mead also studied the National Character of America, and argued that the early personality of Americans was similar to those of Japanese and Americans, but gradually branched off due to variations in enculturation. Abram Kardiner and Ralph Linton also developed the concept of "basic personality type" for different cultures in the book 'Psychological Frontiers of Society' (1945), and this work appears to have been influenced by Sigmund

²¹ E. A. Hoebel, *Man in the Primitive World: An introduction to Anthropology*, McGraw Hill, New York, 1958

²² *Cross cultural perspectives in Human development: Theory, research and application* Edited by T. S Saraswathi, Sage publications, New Delhi, 2003

Freud's work on childhood, personality and life experiences. This influenced the development of the idea of a 'Modal personality' in different societies, an idea that was proposed by Cora du Bois and reinforced through psychological tests. This was used by her in the study of the Alorese tribes who were seen to be violent, suspicious and jealous. This was attributed by her to working mothers and parental neglect. In the 1950's, a co-ordinated research project on child rearing practices was carried out by six teams in different parts of the world such as India, Mexico, Okinawa, the Philippines, New England, and East Africa, and child-rearing practices in these cultures were linked to personal attributes in adulthood.

In 1965, Walter Goldschmidt carried out a research project among four African groups, the Hehe, the Kamba, the Pokot, and the Sebei, and studied the cultural variation between the two groups which were significant. The Kambas had male dominance, fear of poverty and restrained emotions while the Hehe were aggressive and suspicious. In these cases, personality was shaped as much by economics and cultural background as it was by upbringing. Robert Edgerton, another researcher, gathered psychological data from pastoral and agricultural communities, and conducted interviews and tests to understand the differences between the two communities.

Marxists such as Claude Meillasoux and Maurice Godelier on the other hand, emphasize the role of material factors and social relationships in determining the direction of society, 'tertiary factors' such as kinship, and personality development, often to a fault. Marxist ideas also influenced Peter Worsley, Max Gluckmann and Julian Steward, who proposed the idea of core culture or techno-economic dimension of society, and relatively less important peripheral culture which formed the superstructure.

23

Theories on personality are also generally classified into:

Biological Theories: According to Biological theories, genes determine personality characteristics and traits. One of the most vocal proponents of this school was Hans Eysenck who attempted to link personality with biological processes.

Psychological Theories: Psychological theories emphasize childhood experiences and sub-conscious influences in determining personality types. Psychological theories were advanced by Sigmund Freud and Carl Jung. This is akin to a tabula rasa on which impressions are constantly ingrained and overridden to produce new synergies and meanings.

Behavioral Theories: Behavioral theorists such as B. F. Skinner and John B. Watson suggest that personality is primarily formed as a result of interaction between the individual and the environment. Behavioral theorists play down the role of internal thoughts and feelings in shaping human behavior.

²³ General Psychology Prof S. Dandapani, Neelkamal, New Delhi, 2007

Humanist Theories: Humanist theorists such as Carl Rogers and Abraham Maslow emphasize the importance of free will and individual experience including the process of self-actualization in the development of personality.

Trait Theories: According to trait theories, personality comprises several distinct traits which shape human behavior. Examples of trait-based theories include Eysenck's Three-dimension theory and the Five factor theory of personality.

An early form of personality classification was the Four Temperaments system of Galen propounded in *De temperamentis*, which was based on the Four Humours Model of the Greek physician Hippocrates (blood, yellow bile, black bile, and phlegm which influenced the human body and its emotions). According to the Four Temperaments System, which is a proto-psychological theory, there are four personality types i.e., Sanguine (Enthusiastic and Social), Choleric (Short-tempered and irritable), melancholic (analytical, wise and quiet), and phlegmatic (relaxed and peaceful). A more recent theory is the Five Temperaments system published in 1958, and this was based on the work of William Schutz and his FIRO-B programme. Other Personality theories were proposed by Avicenna, Nicholas Culpeper, Immanuel Kant, Rudolf Steiner, Eduard Spranger etc.^{24 25}

The German social psychologist Erich Fromm analyzed personality types on the basis of concepts and learnings in Anthropology, History and Psychology. According to him, every human has a need for orientation, and tries to find a meaning and value in existence. Orientation is achieved either through assimilation (relating to things) or socialization (relating to people). This could also be determined by existentialist needs such as relatedness (submission, power, love), rootedness (establishing roots), transcendence (overcoming the environment), and identity creation, and an interface between these factors led to unique human personality. According to a classification proposed by German psychotherapist Alfred Adler, the following were the four personality types: Ruling or dominant (High activity, low social interest), Learning type (Low activity, high social interest), Avoidance type (Low activity, Low social interest) and the Socially useful type. People belonging to the last category were always vibrant and full of energy. Adler also emphasized the role in inferiority complex and other factors in shaping personality.

The American psychologist William Moulton Marston on the other hand, identified four primary emotions namely Dominance (Activity in an antagonistic environment), Compliance (Passivity in an antagonistic environment), Inducement (Activity in a favourable environment), Submission (passivity in a favourable environment). Gordon Allport, who was a "trait psychologist", categorized personality traits on their basis of influence on a person into cardinal traits, central traits and core traits. To achieve this, he identified and categorized around four thousand five hundred traits. A similar hypothesis is the Fundamental Lexical hypothesis by the American psychologist Lewis Goldberg which states that traits most common to a culture will become that culture's defining traits and cultural determinants. In

²⁴ Jung, Carl Gustav (1971). "Psychological Types". *Collected Works of C.G. Jung*, [Princeton University Press](#)

²⁵ Goldberg, L. R. (1992). "The development of markers for the Big-Five factor structure". *Psychological Assessment*. 4: 26

addition to such models, specialized models are also available, and these include the EAS (Emotionality, activity and sociability) model which is used to assess temperament in children.

The DISC assessment system is a relatively more modern system proposed by W M Marston, Walter Clarke and John G. Geler in 1972 and comprises scales of Dominance, Influence, Steadiness and Conscientiousness which are then used to determine the specifics of personality. According to the relatively better-known Carl Jung's theory of Psychological types, people can be classified based on a combination of Introversion or Extraversion and Sensation, intuition, thinking or feeling to form a total of eight different combinations or orientations. Each human can be categorized into one of the eight types. This approach emphasized the role of the unconscious self in shaping human personality. The HEXACO Model of Personality Structure was proposed by Ashton and Lee and comprises six factors, or dimensions, which include Honesty-Humility (H), Emotionality (E), Extraversion (X), Agreeableness (A), Conscientiousness (C), and Openness to Experience (O). Each factor is composed of various traits and characteristics with high and low ratings for the factor. Another widely used mode is the five-factor model or OCEAN Model of personality which was based on research conducted by the US Air Force in the 1940's, consists of Openness to experience, Conscientiousness (Being organised or efficient), Extroversion, Agreeableness, and Neuroticism.

The better-known Myers-Briggs model is derived from the Swiss Psychiatrist Carl Jung's famous psychological classification and was jointly developed by Katherine Cook Briggs and Isabelle Briggs Myers. As per this model, personality is comprised of the following four dimensions:

1. Where a person focuses his attention – Extraversion or introversion
2. The way a person takes in information – Sensing or intuition
3. How a person makes decisions – Thinking or feeling
4. How a person deals with the world – Judgment or perception

This provides a total of sixteen different combinations, with each combination possessing its own characteristics.

The PEN model proposed by the English psychologist Hans Eysenck, on the other hand, is based on Psychophysiology: There are three superfactors of Psychoticism, Extraversion, and Neuroticism, and several other minor factors such as sociability and positive effect. Another rival approach is provided by the attachment theory which discusses people's relationships with other individuals across a gamut of roles throughout their life cycle.

In spite of a wide gamut of theories of personality development which we reviewed here, the relationship between personality types and culture is poorly understood, and is wide open to debate. We will argue that despite some leeway in frequency distributions, the above classifications are by and large culture-neutral meaning that they are less useful in identity studies and to the Social Anthropologist in general.

It may also be prudent to provide a brief overview of the psychology here, even though this is scarcely in our purview or domain. Wilhelm Wundt set up the first psychological laboratory in 1879 in Leipzig,

Germany, and is called the father of experimental psychology. One of Wundt's students, Stanley Hall, was responsible for the widespread growth of psychology in America. These perspectives were associated with the school of structuralism, which was soon replaced by the school of functionalism led by William James and others, and focussed on the consciousness of the mind. The school of Behaviourism was another perspective on psychology that was founded by John B. Watson in the early 1900's and others, and focussed on observable behaviour. In Germany, the school of psychoanalysis and Gestalt psychology also developed as independent schools of thought. An influential but controversial psychologist was Sigmund Freud who believed repressed sexual drives, and regressive drives along with conflicts between the id, the ego and the superego were responsible for personality development. Many psychologists such as Carl Jung, Alfred Adler, Karen Horney, Erik Erikson, and Harry Sullivan also developed their own perspectives on human behaviour. The Gestalt school of thought also emerged in Austria and Germany, and attempted a holistic perspective of behaviour. This approach is also related to the phenomenological perspective where interrelated perspectives form in the human mind. However, new schools have emerged in psychology, and these are the biological, cognitive, developmental, humanistic, socio-cultural and evolutionary perspectives. The humanists such as Carl Rogers maintain that human behaviour is determined by free will, self concept, and the freedom of choice. Cognitive psychology focuses on how people know, understand and focus on the world. The biological perspective explores the role of sensation, perception, learning, memory, language, sexual behaviours and schizophrenia. The development perspective studies psychological changes in individuals as the mature and grow. The evolutionary perspective studies how behaviour has evolved from primates, but is irrelevant to our perspective.^{26 27}

Definition of enculturation

Enculturation is the process by which an individual learns about his culture in a natural context or usually since infancy or childhood. Conrad Phillip Kottak provides the following definition of enculturation in his book, "Window on Humanity: concise introduction to Anthropology (2004)"²⁸

"Enculturation is the process where the culture that is currently established teaches an individual the accepted norms and values of the culture or society where the individual lives. The individual can become an accepted member and fulfil the needed functions and roles of the group. Most importantly the individual knows and establishes a context of boundaries and accepted behaviour that dictates what is acceptable and not acceptable within the framework of that society. It teaches the individual their role within society as well as what is accepted behaviour within that society and lifestyle."

Thus the process of enculturation teaches citizens how to function as responsible members of society, know what is expected of them and discharge all their duties towards the state and society. It also allows the state to function smoothly and without hindrance. It teaches individuals the norms and

²⁶ Psychology: Sandra K. Ciccarelli, J Noland White, Pearson, 2018

²⁷ General Psychology, Naima Khatoon, Pearson, 2012

²⁸ Window on Humanity: A concise introduction to Anthropology, Konrad Phillip Kottak (2004), MacGraw Hill Education

values of society through observation, emulation, rewards, reinforcement of good behaviour and retribution.

Theories of enculturation (Berry, 2011; Bornstein, 2010) were developed by looking for universals across cultures, and applying a combination of emic and etic approaches for research. All theories conclude that cultural transmission is the means by which we are encultured, and that this is a largely unconscious process of internalisation that shapes our attitudes, identity and behaviour. Examples of theories of enculturation are Bandura's social learning theory and social cognitive theory which are based on the earlier Social learning and imitation theory by Neal E. Miller, John Dollard and others, and state that learning generally happens in social and cultural contexts.

The term acculturation has a slightly different meaning and means adjusting or adopting to an alien culture. It usually involves assimilation, accommodation and cultural integration. This term can be traced to 1880 (Powell cited in Herkovits)

The earliest proper definition of acculturation was given by Redfield, Linton, and Herskovits in 1936:

"Acculturation comprehends those phenomena which result when groups of individuals having different cultures come into continuous first-hand contact, with subsequent changes in the original culture patterns of either or both groups".

The Social Science Research Council defines acculturation as "Culture change that is initiated by the conjunction of two or more autonomous cultural systems. Its dynamics can be seen as the selective adaptation of value systems, the processes of integration and differentiation, the generation of developmental sequences, and the operation of role determinants and personality factors".

This is usually a continuous, symbiotic and bi-directional process where both cultures i.e. the immigrant's culture and the host culture that are in contact can change to produce new equations. However, it is usually the immigrant's culture that changes the most. As Y. Y Kim (1982) who studied the communication patterns of foreign immigrants states: "The acculturation process, therefore, is an interactive and continuous process that evolves in, and through the communication of an immigrant with the new sociocultural environment. The acquired communication competence, in turn, reflects the degree of that immigrant's acculturation."

Thus, acculturation leads to a modification of cultures, and a healthy amalgam through cultural diffusion, a process which may manifest itself in many different contexts. This process is also sometimes known as transculturation (This term was coined by the Cuban Fernando Ortiz in 1940), and may sometimes lead to partial ethno-convergence (or pan-mixing) and some degree of homogenization, although this process has its obvious limits. Differences are bound to persist into eternity, as was

proposed by us in the Symbiotic approach to socio-cultural change, and as was argued by Michael Ignatieff and others.^{29 30 31 32}

International relations specialist Hedley Bull states in this context, “When two or more states have sufficient contact between them, and have sufficient impact on one another, it causes them to be have, at least in some measure, as parts of a whole.” This is what V S Naipaul called ‘Universal civilization’, and what Samuel P. Huntington referred to as ‘Davos culture’. This may exist only at elitist levels, and its roots may often be very shallow in most cultures. Another study has shown that the proportion of “cosmopolitans” or “citizens of the world” remains at thirteen percent, but even this figure may be skewed in favour of developed countries, and may be off the mark. Thus, if any ethno-convergence has to shift beyond an elitist layer, paradigm shifts in diverse areas of study such as Anthropology, Sociology, and Pedagogy may be required. Even this will have its limitations, as there are obvious limits to intellectualism.

The Psychic Unity of Mankind

The idea of the Psychic Unity of Mankind was first proposed by the German Anthropologist Adolf Bastian. He made early major contributions to Ethnography and Anthropology, and was influenced by the works of Johann Gottfried Herder and Alexander von Humboldt. He also greatly influenced Psychologists and Anthropologists such as Carl Jung, Frans Boas, Edward B. Tylor, Julian Steward, Radcliffe-Brown, Fredrick Barth and Maurice Godelier. His work had a great influence on a diverse set of theories such as the theory of Archetypes or prototypes and the theory of collective unconscious proposed by Carl Jung, the Totalist perspective of Culture, and on the work of comparative mythologist Joseph Campbell, besides influencing a wide variety of thinkers to this day. This theory is widely accepted today, except among a handful of racists or ethno-centrists.

This theory, which is one of the foundations of this paper, states that all humans, regardless of culture or ethno-biological identity, have the same cognitive or psychological set-up, and are driven by similar urges, proclivities and guiding principles. Even though there may be individual variations, these will be culture-neutral and neutral to ethno-biological identity. Thus, an East Indian boy, raised entirely in an American set-up, may behave exactly as an American does, though there can be a few exceptions as discussed in this paper. On the other hand, values, norms, institutions, and behaviours may vary widely from culture to culture, and these play a major role in personality-development and value formation. This will also naturally impact the way knowledge is acquired, stored, interpreted, and associated in different cultural contexts and is one of the premises of cognitivists, and also impact local processes and

²⁹ Acculturation: a Review of the Literature , Paul N. Lakey, Abilene Christian University, Intercultural Communication Studies XII-2 2003

³⁰ Acculturation and Enculturation: Ethnic Identity Socialisation Processes Julie Hakim-Larson University of Windsor Rosanne Menna University of Windsor, Psychology Publications, University of Windsor, 2016

³¹ ENCULTURATION AND ACCULTURATION OF TELEVISION USE AMONG ASIAN INDIANS IN THE U.S. Indira S. Somani, Doctor of Philosophy, 2008

³² The relevance of Culture and Personality Studies, National Character Studies, Cultural Determinism and Cultural Diffusion in Twenty-first Century Anthropology: An assessment of their compatibility with Symbiotic models of Socio-cultural change, ELK Asia Pacific Journal of Social Science Volume 4, Issue 2, 2018, Sujay Rao Mandavilli

reasoning ability. (Frake (1980)) (Atran (1993)) therefore, per our approach, human may acts differently not because they are biologically different, but because they value and cherish their identity. It is the loss of their cherished values and ideas, and those that they have held close to their heart since childhood that may compel them to act differently from others. It is certainly true that identities are associated with ideologies that may or may not be fully logical, but this can never render null and void humans' innate biological underpinnings and the psychic unity across the human species. This would also imply that morals, values and ethics are learnt only socially, and are not biological. Thus, concepts of "good" and "bad" have no biological foundation. The only exception could be temperament which is discussed elsewhere in this paper.

Symbiotic approaches to socio-cultural change

We had proposed a 'Symbiotic approach to socio-cultural change' in our earlier papers to take into account the changed realities of the Twenty-first century. We reproduce the highlights of this approach below as it would have some bearing on the process of identity formation by impacting interpretation and the association of ideas in the light of expanding information. This would naturally broaden a person's horizons over a period by exposing him to a plethora of new ideas. In other cases, it could trigger or induce cognitive dissonance if newly received ideas are in conflict with existing thought patterns. Thus, the greater and immediate socio-cultural impacts the process of ideation, formation of thought worlds, mind-orientation, individuation and identity formation to varying degrees, though the process of individuation and identity formation must be in consonance with theories on psychology and personality development.³³

This approach categorizes cultures into the following types

1. Dominant or influential cultural systems: Examples of such cultures could include the USA, which till date remains the most influential superpower. Factors impacting a culture's dominance include its technological superiority, cultural hegemony and soft power, economic influence, military influence, population and population growth.
2. Non-Dominant cultural systems: Examples of such systems could include China and India. Even though such cultures may possess desirable attributes or traits, their lack or dominance in the international arena due to an absence of hard power or soft power may prevent such traits from spreading.
3. Fringe or Marginal cultural systems: Examples of such systems could include Nigeria and Tanzania. Such countries are merely a speck in the international radar, and chances that such cultures can have an impact on the world at large are remote. However, they may imbibe traits from more influential cultures

³³ Articulating comprehensive frameworks on socio-cultural change: Perceptions of social and cultural change in contemporary Twenty-first century Anthropology from a 'Neo-centrist' perspective Published in ELK Asia Pacific Journal of Social Sciences Volume 3, Number 4 (July 2017 – September 2017)
Sujoy Rao Mandavilli

4. Closed or Autarchic cultural systems: Examples of such cultures are North Korea which have practically no cultural or economic connections with the rest of the world. These cultures may also be assessed based on their Degree of Autarchy

The process of symbiosis between these cultural systems would determine the global socio-cultural landscape. This draws inspiration from cybernetics or systems study approaches, and similar approaches are already in use in various sub-fields in Anthropology, examples being the Ecosystems approach proposed by Andrew P. Vayda and Roy Rappaport as a part of Ecological Anthropology.

Several factors can boost a culture's influence. These include a country's Technological superiority and Military hegemony, Cultural hegemony and soft power, Economic Influence, Population and population growth, among other factors.

The ability of a culture to absorb changes include technological superiority of an element, Perceived superiority, Allure or glitz, Ability to provide solutions to problems, Comparison with substitutes, Economy and value-proposition, Utility and practicality, Alteration or improvisation during diffusion and Cultural receptivity in general.

The process of symbiosis takes place over a series of stages such as the generation of awareness, change in popular or individual sentiment as a pre-requisite for cultural change, seeding of ideas through push mode, pull mode, push-pull mode, or sub-conscious adoption and acceptance, adoption and internalization of new traits or ideas. Propagation of ideas can happen in top-down mode (changes promoted by elites), horizontal mode (changes induced in parallel across segments and dimensions), spatial spread or spread across geographies from a core or an influential geography, or a bottom up mode (E.g. Fight by the Dalits or lower-caste Hindus for their rights). Some changes can be generational, and are introduced from younger generations; these are common in times of rapid, social, cultural or technological change. They can also be driven by one segment of society – age bracket, gender etc, a specific function of society, or through a multi-modal spread.

Cultural Macro-environment

Thus, the Cultural Macro-environment also keeps changing due to an interaction between various cultures. This transmission arises as a result of push factors, pull factors, push-pull factors, subconscious adoption, churn and feedback. This must be construed as a continuous and an iterative process through which different cultures undergo constant changes, and global pan-culture gradually emerges. This is a process by which cultures are partly homogenized, and global ethno-convergence takes place, but within limits. Thus, this is a combination of synchronic and diachronic approaches, and the nature of the former impacts changes that take place over time. In many cases, cultures may also undergo substantial modification, without convergence.

Another concept is that of Cultural Hybridity which arises due to an intermingling of two or more cultures within a cultural unit, as opposed to a more general symbiosis taking place across space and time. Hybridized cultures do possess their own attributes and traits, and may in turn contribute to the ongoing process of Cultural symbiosis and transculturation. Hybridized cultures have arisen, for example

due to the presence of Indian and Chinese diaspora in the USA, and their presence and influence has triggered important changes to American culture in various domains such as cuisine, art and literature with these changes gradually entering the mainstream due to ever-increasing popular acceptance.

Cultural or Societal Orientations

A culture or a society may also have several implicit orientations which constitute its general characteristics. Within a culture or society, these may vary by dimension or temporally, with innumerable possibilities for individual variation. The Seven Cultural or Societal Orientations as we proposed them are as follows, and these would impact the process of individuation and identity formation. Thus, the mechanics of individuation and identity formation would operate differently between two different countries such as the United States and India, though the underlying principles would still be the same:

Past-orientation versus future-orientation

Past-orientation and Future-orientation refers to the relative emphasis placed by a society or culture on its past or future. Future-orientation is not only associated with attributes such as planning, foresight, personality development but also impacts the process of rationalization and individuation. Past-orientation may impede cultural progress, and the healthy growth of individual thought patterns, but most people in conservative countries like India continue to be past-obsessed or past-absorbed to this day.

Inward-looking cultures versus outward cultures

Some cultures are undoubtedly more outward-looking than others, and many are internally-focussed or oriented. This may also be referred to as the internal or external orientation of society. The presence or absence of key political and cultural institutions as well as the level of physical, educational and social infrastructure and the general intellectualism play a role in determining the Internal or external orientation of society.

A Xenophobic culture is one that may have a deep-rooted suspicion towards other cultures. Xenophobia may arise due to several reasons, one of them being ethnocentrism, though there may be other causes such as autarchy, cultural isolation or ignorance. At the other end of the spectrum, xenocentrism may be observed, though this may not necessarily be accompanied with positive consequences.

Rigid versus flexible cultures

Cultures may also be classified into rigid and flexible. Flexible cultures are those with less cultural and intellectual baggage, and are open or amenable to change. Cultures which are flexible in some respects, may be rigid in some others and a change in orientation may only occur over a period in time.

Individualistic versus collective cultures

Some cultures like the USA may be more individualistic, while some others like the former USSR emphasized collectivism of thought, a brutal suppression of individuality and dissent, and statism. Most other cultures can be placed in a continuum between these two extremes, and each type of culture may be associated with its own merits and demerits.

Material and non-material orientation

Some cultures like the USA may be more materialistic with an emphasis of wealth acquisition and personal effects, while some other developed countries with a high per capita income like Japan, much less so. Most other cultures can be placed in a continuum between a material orientation and various non-material orientations such as religious or spiritual orientation, and each may be associated with its own merits and demerits.

Contentment versus innovation

Some cultures may not effect changes to the status quo due to a sense of timelessness and contentment, while some others pursue a relentless quest for perfection and a desire to bring about changes in the existing state of affairs. This metric would indicate a culture's appetite or desire for innovation, and would be commensurate with its innovation indices.

Rational-orientation versus Non Rational-orientation

In a rational society, less reliance is placed on myths, legends, superstitions etc, and a rational approach forms the basis of society, and of decision-making in all walks of life. It is expected that all non-rational societies will evolve into rational societies in due course keeping in mind the philosophies of Emile Durkheim, August Comte and others, and the Cultural Anthropologist has a core and a crucial role to play here.

However, other allied approaches such as Hofstede's cultural dimensions can also be used for a meaningful study of society. This approach involves a study of factors such as Power Distance Index, Individualism vs. collectivism, Uncertainty avoidance index, Masculinity vs. femininity, Long-term orientation vs. short-term orientation and Indulgence vs. Restraint of various societies. Shalom Schwartz, another Israeli researcher, proposes six cultural values in three pairs, which are Embeddedness (High value to tradition) versus Individual Autonomy, Mastery (success through individual action) versus Harmony (People ready to accept their place in the world) and Hierarchy (Emphasis on roles) versus Egalitarianism (Emphasis on equality).

The Theory of Mind-orientation

The theory of mind-orientation that we had proposed, could be an important way of assessing social and cultural orientation of individual's in a society. Mind-orientation connotes a person's thoughts, beliefs and values as shaped by society, and how he acts upon them to orient his attitudes and philosophy towards life. Even though each society may contain individuals with different mind-orientations, the percentages of individuals with different mind-orientations will vary widely from society to society, and each society can be expected to have modal mind-orientations in addition to less prevalent ones. For

example, Society A may have many social and technological innovators due to its over-arching techno-environmental framework, while society B which lacks such core or key institutions, may not. Thus, the collective and general mind-orientation of individuals and their constituent percentages will only change slowly, and may not usually change beyond a point, as determined by the limitations of ethno-convergence.

An individual's mind-orientation impacts many aspects of his life, such as his ability to acquire and retain language, his innovation, his creativity etc, and impact the process of individuation and identity formation as well. Even though there may be mavericks and non-conformities in different societies, the tolerance for, and acceptance for them may vary, and their acceptance of them may change slowly or rapidly. Mind-orientation is usually formed as a result of conscious and sub-conscious assessment or deliberation and will be in keeping in line with the expectations or prevailing norms of society, as well as what is practical or practicable. We had also suggested the 'mind-orientation' was a more reliable parameter and yardstick than 'personality', and had proposed a 'Culture and Mind-orientation school' and a 'Culture and thoughtworlds' school, in lieu of the old 'Culture and Personality School'. At the heart of the theory of mind-orientation is the idea that humans have a sense of purpose in life. This is accepted by most psychoanalysts barring the likes of L.L Bernard, who subscribe to mechanistic theories of human behaviour i.e., those that are not guided by any goal.³⁴

The diversity of mind-orientations or the tolerance and appetite for diverse mind-orientations can also be equated to societal complexity, and the diversity in mind-orientations will increase with the increasing complexity of society.

Types of Mind-orientation

The following are the basic Mind-orientation types. Each Mind-orientation type may be further subdivided into several subtypes, though the latter is left open-ended at this stage for further interpretation and elaboration.

- Family orientation: In this case, the individual's efforts are primarily geared towards the satisfaction of familial needs. This is perhaps the most common type of mind-orientation amongst a vast majority of people in different parts of the world, and particularly in traditional and conservative societies such as India. Individuals with familial orientation may be good at earning a living through various means, but these efforts are usually directed towards satisfying the needs of the family, and earning money is not a goal or an end by itself. Such individuals may also be often empathetic to the needs of others, often putting their own needs next or even last, and innovation and creativity may not be goals by themselves.

- Employment or Business orientation: In this case, the individual's efforts are primarily geared towards employment of business. I.e. satisfaction of livelihood needs, and all other efforts are subservient to these. Such orientations are common in many parts of the world, including developing and developed ones, and equate to a situation where livelihood is a passion or calling in life. Employment or Business orientation is very common among men, but not too uncommon among women, either. Employment

³⁴ How the mind works, Steven Pinker, Allen Lane, The Penguin press, London, 1997

orientation may be distinct from Business orientation, and the modal personal traits or attributes may vary in each case.

- Individual mind-orientation: In this case, the individual tends to be self-centric and individualistic in his pursuits. This type of orientation is characterized by a great emphasis on individual goals and aspirations. He may also attach a great deal of importance to his own personality or image. There may be several variations of the basic theme, and each is characterized by different personal traits or attributes. Variants may be the hedonistic personality type, the politician, the manipulator, and the introvert.

- Societal Orientation: This type of Mind-orientation tends to put the well-being and needs of society above individual and all other needs. This type of mind-orientation is relatively rare in most societies, in spite of the fact that has some tangible benefits to offer to society.

- Religious, spiritual or philosophical orientation: In this case, a great deal of importance is placed on religious, spiritual or philosophical needs often at the expense of all other needs. Religious, spiritual and philosophical orientation beyond a certain measure may be counter-productive and lower the overall well-being of society. Many societies have transformed from religious to modern scientific societies, while some have yet not. This may be described as a change from a Theological to positivistic outlook in the words of August Comte, or a transformation from Religious and militaristic societies to modern and industrial societies in the words of Herbert Spencer.

- Intellectual or creative orientation: In this type, a great deal of importance is placed on intellectual needs and creativity. A variant of this may be an Artistic Mind-orientation. This type of mind-orientation is relatively less common in traditional or conservative societies, and may even be the exception rather than the norm in most advanced societies where such individuals still may constitute a small percentage. The exact opposite of this kind of orientation is regimentation and adherence to bureaucracy or a procedural orientation, but this will stifle creativity and imagination in most cases.

- Militant-orientation: In this type of orientation, individuals are geared to fight and protect society from external threats and forces. This type of mind-orientation may also be present in advanced societies, but may be more common in tribal and feudal societies where warfare is common.

- The Anarchist or the queer man: This type of mind-orientation may not be a bona fide category by itself but a residual type and may be characterized by a partial or complete disorientation of personality. Many would not accept this as a mind-orientation and may be a result of unique personal experiences or a worldview shaped by a high degree of cognitive dissonance which has crossed a threshold. This may also happen if the process of identity-formation has been severely interfered with due to abnormal factors. Examples of the latter may include incest monster Josef Fritzl's children, the case of Victor, the wild boy of Aveyron (Frith (1989)) (Lane (1976)), or the mythical Rapunzel. Changes in psychology due to upbringing or harrowing incidents have also been reinforced by experiment such as that of Widdowson of Cambridge University, and a similar study by Tanner and Whitehouse.

- Other types of Basic mind-orientation: Other types of basic mind-orientation may also be defined with a proper justification, but most may be subservient to and slotted into the above categories.

It may also be necessary to plot an individual's primary as well as his secondary mind-orientation, and an individual's mind-orientation is usually composite. We may also define the "Natural Mind-orientation" of the individual versus his real-world mind-orientation, the difference between the two being mostly due to real-world exigencies and factors beyond his control such as cultural factors.

The inter-relationships between culture, mind-orientation and thought worlds are also deep-rooted, fundamental, comprehensive and multi-directional enough to be of great practical value. Thus, thought worlds, which cover the entire breadth of the human experience can be assessed rather efficiently on the field through suitably-designed questionnaires or interviews and suitable course corrections can then be recommended.³⁵

Cultural Sentiment

The concept of Cultural Sentiment is also worth mentioning here. Cultural Sentiment is the popular sentiment prevalent in a society or culture. The concept of Cultural Sentiment is also related to thought worlds but there are several fundamental differences between the two: Firstly, Culture Sentiment tends to operate more at the level of a society, culture or a sub-culture rather than at a level of an individual. Secondly, Cultural Sentiment is more abstract than that of thought worlds, can be gauged and assessed but not usually measured in quantifiable terms. Third, Cultural Sentiment changes much more slowly and only as a result to fundamental changes to society, and Anthropologists should ideally adopt a long-term perspective to study such changes, and changing Cultural sentiment would be a much more long-drawn-out exercise with its own unique challenges and limitations. This could also be of some use in Economics and other allied disciplines, and could manifest itself in the form of relatively more tangible cultural proclivities.

Cultural Mindset

The Cultural Mindset on the other hand, would commonly operate at the level of an individual, and yet would form a critical component of any assessment. The aggregation of Cultural Mindset including modal and non-modal ones (or typical or non-typical ones) in a given culture or society will constitute the Cultural Sentiment of a Society given the fact that most cultural elements would impinge on the human psyche and impact human behaviour, and that there would be some bi-directional relationship between the two. The concept of Cultural Mindset is somewhat more tangible than that of the concept of Cultural Sentiment, and can be expressed in layman's terms or compartmentalized into easily understandable categories.

Thought worlds

³⁵ Lynn, R. and Vanhanen, T. (2002). IQ and the wealth of nations. Westport, CT: Praeger

The multi-directional inter-relationships between culture, mind-orientation and thought worlds are also deep-rooted, fundamental, and comprehensive enough to be of great practical, real-world value. Thus, thought worlds, which can cover the entire breadth of the human experience, can be assessed rather effectively on the field through suitable questionnaires or interviews and the requisite course-corrections can be recommended and constituted.

Thought worlds must also necessarily be co-related with cultures, subcultures, cultural categories, cultural subcategories, individual elements, and also at the level of a cultural sub-group. The latter represents different dimensions such as age, gender or religious affiliation. The assessment and mapping of an individual's thought worlds must be comprehensive and complete and must always be presented in clear and unambiguous terms. People's ideas and thoughtworlds vary widely from context to context, and may shape identity, though it must be admitted that a convergence of ideas and thoughtworlds is rapidly taking place.

Identity impacts thoughtworlds greatly and therefore worldviews. For example, as per the Sapir-Whorf hypothesis, language impacts worldviews, but this may be a trifle and a bagatelle, and pale into insignificance when compared to the influence exerted by religion: this is a complex area of study and can be vindicated only through hermeneutical assessment.

Three-layer model for the study of thought worlds

We had also proposed the following three-layer model for the study of thought worlds either at an individual level or at the level of any group, and we believe that this is critical and crucial to theories of individuation and identity-formation:

The Inner Biological Layer: The innermost layer is the Biological layer, and this is by and large culture-neutral. However, biology may influence culture indirectly. This is not due to Biology itself, but a perceived differentiating factor which is essentially cultural, not biological, though influenced by Biology or quasi-biological factors such as ethnicity. For example, Blacks may want to retain their own cultural identity in the USA, and may wish to differentiate themselves from whites. Thus, a true cultural integration may never take place due to biological factors alone, and a Cultural Anthropologist must always keep this factor in mind. There may be other genetic factors impacting identity formation too, though they cannot be presently determined, and not certainly through our black box approach. In a sense, this would form a residual category from the point of view of our analysis. In addition, there is now evidence that hereditary factors determine conditions such as schizophrenia, alcoholism, depression in addition to social ones, and these in turn impact an individual's identity formation and mind-orientation.

The Middle Layer or the Cultural Layer: This is the layer at which thought worlds reside, and must be probed by the Cultural Anthropologist using in-depth techniques such as prolonged case studies and panel studies. This layer would, in most cases, be crucial for the process of individuation and identity-formation, and most of the functions of identity formation reside at this layer.

The Outer layer or the Superficial Layer: The outer layer determines how an individual attempts to interact with the world at large. The individual sub-consciously tries to keep his behaviour culture neutral in most cases, through a process of Cultural Adjustment. This is done usually to secure his cultural acceptability, and he therefore presents a neutral or an acceptable stance. This layer is meaningless for individuation or identity formation, and the Anthropologist must keep this in mind at all times. From the point of view of an Ethnographer, this is however extremely important because investigation needs to be carried out at the requisite level of depth. This may also be referred to as self-impersonation or exterior manifestation. This concept was also popularized by Wendy Doniger and others, who also argue that an individual's masks can easily be taken off to reveal his true identity. This idea is also akin to the concept of true and false performances proposed by the Canadian Sociologist Erving Goffman where individuals play both real and feigned roles in society.

Worldviews

Another interesting concept that we had proposed was that of a worldview. A worldview may be defined as a fundamental cognitive orientation of an individual or a group of individuals in a society or a society as a whole encompassing the whole of the individual's or society's knowledge and points of view. However, the concept of worldview is largely irrelevant for the purposes of our study, and is only mentioned in passing. This is because Worldviews are merely subsets of thought worlds as they incorporate elements of thought worlds with an external orientation, because Worldviews are shaped exclusively by thought worlds, and because changes that are effected to thought worlds will result in corresponding changes to worldviews making them as superfluous for our study.

Theory of Mindspace

We had introduced the concept of 'Mindspace' in an earlier paper, as a simple and effective tool for assessing and bringing about socio-cultural change. The idea of 'Mindspace' arises due to the fact that every individual only has limited time at his disposal, or a limited bandwidth to concentrate on multiple issues. He can devote his time and attention only to a limited number of activities, at a given point in time, or throughout his lifetime. Thus, if he spends inordinate time on a particular activity, this reduces his available time for other activities, making it a zero-sum equation. If an individual spends more time watching television, this reduces the time that he has for reading. Thus, the popularization of television has adversely impacted reading habits. Similarly, the advent of the internet has led to the decline of television or cinema as a means of entertainment. It has also led to the decline of reading as a habit, but has increased access and availability of information. Thus, the internet and the television have led to a decline in people's reading skills in general. However, this may have boosted the demand for basic, functional skills in English in India. However, desire to obtain a profound knowledge on any topic through a study of written material may have reduced. Thus, the advent of technology may always not be for the betterment of society and may even induce a shift from productive pastimes to less productive pastimes. This may impact many aspects such as linguistic skills, learning ability and consequently, even self-confidence or attitudes towards life. This not only changes individual mind-orientations, and cultural and societal orientations, but also affects the process of individuation and identity-formation, by impacting the forces he is exposed to.

Thus, mindspace shifts may be horizontal, where shifts are brought about through peer-interaction and changes in society, Generational where changes in mindspace are analyzed from generation to generation, individual-level temporal shift where changes occur in an individual over a period in time and group-level temporal shift where variations occur based on strata education, income level, socioeconomic parameters or any other suitable criteria. Mindspace shifts may also be triggered by 'Eureka points' at an individual level, and these are unanticipated or unexpected shifts brought about through the occurrence of specific events resulting in cognitive dissonance. These can often bring about mind-altering or permanent changes in an individual, and this is a critical part of individuation or identity-formation.

We had also discussed the concept of Bounded Mindspace and Non-bounded Mindspace at great length. This approach involves the compartmentalization of Mindspace into well-defined compartments, initially through ad hoc methods but eventually through careful long-term research and observation. To word it differently, students may have a well-defined Mindspace (which should translate into time allocation) for an activity such as sports, and they are unlikely to swap this time for language learning or spiritual pursuits. This rule may not apply for all activities. People may be willing, on the other hand, to swap indoors activities for outdoors activities, and to alter their linguistic Mindspace to make space for the learning of new languages. Between the two extremes lies the concept of semi-bounded Mindspace, whose boundaries are fuzzy and nebulous and can be altered through careful strategizing for optimal effect. One approach may be to introduce a topic in such a way that it reduces the time available for other less useful pursuits, often through suitably-designed pedagogical techniques.

These approaches, if properly applied and conceptualized, can lead to judicious changes in the socio-cultural ecosystem in the long-term. Understanding the key underlying concepts is extremely important. For example, teaching Electricity or magnetism may not impact students' belief in religion, while Anthropological Historiography may. This is something that may need to be researched in greater detail over the next couple of decades. This is something can only be identified through properly designed Ethnographic techniques and widely used research techniques in Social Sciences. This is not as easy as it may appear at first sight, and may warrant a wholly new field of study which we refer to as the 'Ethnography of Mindspace'. This should form the basis of education planning and cultural remediation among other things which will also lead to identity neutralization to a substantial degree.

Mindspace shifts may also be triggered by 'Eureka points' which we may refer to as unanticipated or unexpected shifts brought about through the occurrence of specific events or the introduction of specific themes in curricula, and the process of formation of 'Eureka points' needs to be studied as a part of the 'Ethnography of Mindspace', and used in future pedagogical theories. These can often bring about mind-altering or permanent changes in an individual. For example, knowledge of the true age of the earth at 4500 MYO, and the sheer size of the universe, and evolutionary biology among school students can act as a bulwark against religious obscurantism in a way that knowledge of the Atomic table cannot. But this alone may not be complete; the teaching of human values in schools as proposed

by the Dalai Lama and Sam Harris could constitute another vital component, though this must be substantiated through ethnographic research in diverse cultural contexts.^{36 37}

This approach not only allows us to analyse the underlying causes of change but also to predict cultural shifts due to disruptive technologies or other changes with greater precision. It also allows us to prepare a cause and effects diagram with a great degree of precision by analysing all downstream effects of any decision. Consequently, it also allows us to make course corrections wherever they are required in the interests of society by taking proactive measures. For this approach to be effective, it needs to be linked to cultural taxonomies, and an individual's thought worlds as well.

Identity in Mindspace

Identity and identity-related thoughts constitute a major component of Mindspace in most societies around the world, and only to varying degrees. A causal cursory glance at social media will demonstrate to what extent people are obsessed with their own identity (this manifests itself in some form either directly or indirectly), and this does not spare even better educated people. As a matter of fact, a major pre-occupation of people even today is the perpetuation of one's own identity, religious, cultural or linguistic. Even though literacy or quasi-literacy has become pervasive, this has done little to broaden people's horizons directly; even though it may have indirectly contributed to the acquisition of meaningful knowledge. A useful metric would be to identify how globalized or neutralized a person has become due to progressively higher levels of education, and how successfully he has been able to establish his posture in a complex, multi-dimensional world without infringing on the rights of any other group or identity. It would also serve to assess how an individual's horizons have broadened to include topics of interest to the betterment of mankind as a whole, or those that do not seek to perpetuate his own identity at the expense of others. This must be assessed through ethnographic methods and techniques, and implemented through robust and multi-dimensional pedagogical frameworks and techniques which do not in the least infringe upon other objectives and goals of education. This would be in addition to, and would often go hand in hand with, efforts to change societal orientation and mind orientation through the medium of robust pedagogical techniques.

This has often not been realized in many societies due to vested interests or political factors; and there are wide variations from context to context. With the exception of Ireland and Eastern Europe, religious affiliation is declining across Europe, but is unfortunately counterbalanced by the rise of Islamism in those countries. Belief in God plays a vital role in many countries particularly Islamic ones, and present systems of education, technology and globalization have only made matters worse, and may be due to what we call self-reinforcing cognitive dissonance. Thus, China's repression of Uighur Muslims may be a disaster waiting to happen as it cannot satisfy the theory of mindscape or cognitive dissonance to any degree. The rise of the Taliban and the Al-Qaida may be likened to the Moor's last sigh, but with so

³⁶ Beyond Religion: Ethics for a whole world, His Holiness the Dalai Lama, Houghton Mifflin Harcourt, Boston New York, 2011

³⁷ Waking up: A guide to spirituality without religion, Sam Harris, Simon and Schuster, 2011

many unresolved issues in science and policy, it is likely to precipitate many more disasters in the long-term.

Identity formation and Personality types

From our perspective, personality formation may happen in many different ways due to various lifecycle experiences mostly within the context of a culture resulting in different mind-orientations. This approach therefore does not categorize individuals into personality types per se, but seeks to categorize individuals on how their personality was formed i.e. the process of individuation or identity-formation itself:

- Standard personality: This denotes personality formation through subconscious assimilation of the standard culture. Standard personalities may have had relatively uneventful childhoods or upbringing reflective of the culture's standards. This type of personality is associated with mundane mind-orientations such as familial orientation or livelihood and business orientation, but the definition of 'standard' may vary from culture to culture.
- Ideal personality and near-ideal personality: This personality arises as a result of a formation of composite traits through observation, emulation, amalgamation and adaptation (Reconciliation of contradictory strains). This type of personality would normally be associated with a composite mind-orientation which is a combination of more common and relatively less common mind-orientations. The process of identity-formation and determination of mind-orientation is more conscious and explicit here, and usually involves emulation of role models and an individual's conscious desire to enhance desirable traits or develop himself as a role model.
- Original or genius personality: this is a rare type of personality born due to a synthesis of original ideas with standard ideas prevalent in the culture. This type of personality would stem from unique knowledge, exposure or high intelligence and cognitive ability, and lead to unique mind-orientations.
- Rebel personality: Personality formed by rebelling against existing ideas. This is commonly induced due to cognitive dissonance. Such individuals may evolve into geniuses as well, but this may require some amount of self-channelizing or direction by an external agency. A Cultural Anthropologist can play a role in identifying such individuals. An example here was Harilal Gandhi, Mahatma Gandhi's eldest son, whose personality development and mind-orientation was interfered with by his whimsical father. He became severely emotionally disturbed as a result, turned out to be a rebel, but could not make anything of himself. He ultimately became a vagabond and a destitute, dying a miserable and a lonely death.
- Queer personality: This category comprises of mavericks and outliers. This type of personality is typically formed due to unusual experiences in childhood or in the formative years, and includes individuals who do not develop into geniuses or prodigies.
- Downers and goners: This category comprises of individuals who have not been able to make it in life, and appear to have little or no prospects for success. Such individuals result when the personally-development process has been severely interfered with usually through an external agency, or due to some reason, lack the foundational competencies to succeed in life.

Statistical distributions of the individuals conditioned by the above factors are also more culture-neutral than those of mind-orientations, and these would occur across societies regardless of their complexity, advancement or size. However, frequency distributions may vary across societies, and across time.

The Vertical-horizontal factors approach and identity-formation

We had recommended the Vertical-horizontal factors approach for its simplicity, workability and elegance. This approach involves plotting all Vertical factors, which in the common man's language refer to historical factors or historical, cultural or intellectual baggage, namely those aspects of a culture that are passed on from generation to generation and horizontal factors which refer to changes introduced from other cultures or subcultures or other dimensions of the same culture. Thus, horizontal forces may be generated from either within or outside the culture, and in modern times, they may be increasingly from the latter. Vertical factors may also be referred to as change-inhabiting factors while Horizontal factors may be referred to as change-inducing factors. The key advantage of the Vertical-Horizontal Factors approach is its simplicity and its power. This analysis can be carried out at the level of a culture, sub-culture a dimension, or an individual, and a root cause analysis can be done to identify the causes of slow or rapid change. In the case of most primitive and closed societies, horizontal factors are limited to those emanating from within the group, and these are in turn shaped by the culture's norms. Thus, in extreme cases, changes may be non-existent.

The effects of Vertical factors can also be minimized through proactive measures such as suitable changes to the education system and better social infrastructure, and is at the core of our approach. This will reduce the quantum of pain typically associated with social and cultural change, and expedite the process of social change.

Vertical-horizontal analysis can also be performed using a lifecycle approach. In this case, all the vertical and horizontal forces an individual is subjected to during his lifetime are identified and the impact on his psyche and mind-orientation assessed. Another potentially useful tool may be Generational analysis which analyzes how cultural traits or attributes are transmitted from generation to generation, and modified through horizontal forces.

The Vertical-horizontal approach can also be used for a multi-directional study of society, mind-orientations and thought worlds, and in the study of personality development, individuation and identity-formation, either at group or an individual level.

It is generally assumed that the strength of vertical forces will decrease with the passage of time, and become irrelevant. This is not necessarily the case. People may often choose to make themselves immune to cultural influences, and this phenomenon must be studied in various contexts. For example, even third-generation British Muslims often are oblivious to the larger British culture around them and choose to immerse themselves in Islamic activities all year long, and this approach is encouraged in the name of multi-culturalism. They simply do not integrate. The case of Shamima Begum, an ISIS recruit

from the UK, must be told here. She was brought up in the UK, educated in a prestigious, secular institution, with practically no roots to her native Bangladesh, but even as a female, became a radical Islamist at the age of fifteen, while her father, raised in Bangladesh, was moderate. It is the rising trend of fascism amidst growing modernity that is a cause for worry, and must be investigated with the attention it demands. This may stem from the implicit belief that one's own culture is superior and better. General Reginald Dyer and Rudyard Kipling who were born in British India in 1864 and 1865 respectively, only developed a minimal sense of belonging or affection towards India, and largely remained racist throughout their lives. Racism of this kind has whittled down now, but is rapidly being replaced by other forms of fascism.

Cultural Taxonomy and Identity-formation

Culture and its components should be should be arranged in the form of a hierarchy, and this would constitute a Cultural Taxonomy much in the manner of Carl Linnaeus' taxonomy of species. This is only one form of ordering: there could be several others, and the list of subcultures, sub-categories and sub-classes is itself left to interpretation. No one proposal would fit the bill entirely, and would be influenced by the scholar in question's own biases, prejudices and limitations of knowledge and approach.

Each culture has sub-cultures

Subcultures may be defined on the basis of ethnicity, social classes, occupation, religion, geography etc, or on a combination of one or more of these factors. These are sometimes referred to as dimensions of culture, a term which we have used very often in our paper.

Each Culture or sub-culture has subcategories or sub-classes

A list of standard subcategories or subclasses can be constructed and can be attempted to be used across cultures. This list of subsystems can be expanded as more and more cultures are analyzed, and the expanded list can then be used for a restudy of previously assessed cultures. This will eventually and ideally generate a list of standard and universal subclasses.

Examples of subcategories within a culture include language, symbols, religion, music, art, drama, cinema, folklore, marriage, cuisine, other aspects of tradition etc. Culture also typically consists of material items such as cars, trucks which etc. form an inalienable part of every culture. While building a taxonomy, all dimensions of a culture such as values, norms, philosophies, principles, dogmas, ideas, beliefs, attitudes, symbols, traditions, ideologies, and artifacts should be included. We cannot offer any standard recommendation or a full-fledged list at this point. This approach is deliberately kept as generic as possible. Furthermore, the approach to be adopted may vary drastically for each sub-category. For examples, specialized approaches may be warranted for the enculturation of language, the role of religion in society, of the habituation of individuals to different types of cuisine, but these are deliberately kept out of our purview.

Each subsystem has components

For a meaningful and a structured taxonomy, we propose that sub-categories or dimensions be further sub-divided into components, though the same components will be applicable across sub-categories in most cases. These will be analogous to various classes under each subcategory. For example, we can have a multitude of components under language such as language policy, teaching methods, teacher competence, student evaluation etc. Under cuisine, we can have focus on health, focus on hygiene, nutritional balance etc. Material items may include cars, trucks, tractors, locomotives, aero planes, rockets, computers, telephones, mobile phones etc. Under kinship, we can have subcategories such as attitudes towards consanguine marriages, attitudes towards class, caste and village endogamous or exogamous marriages, attitudes towards premarital sex, attitudes towards dowry, attitudes towards relatives, attitudes towards child-rearing etc. While identifying components, both comprehensiveness and atomicity need to be taken into account. In other words, components should be defined in such a way that no further division is possible.

Each component has attributes

Each component can have a list of attributes. Each attribute should be capable of being assessed either quantitatively or qualitatively. Attributes for our purpose, may also be known as qualities or characteristics. Attributes can be adjudged through suitably-designed questionnaires or other evaluation methods such as self-assessment or third-party evaluation. Attributes can also be rated in absolute or relative terms which will result either in absolute ratings or rankings. Attributes may also include intangible and unquantifiable attributes, or those that cannot be quantified with precision or certainty. As per our approach, an analysis of attributes leads to the identification of 'Cultural traits' which are assemblages or aggregations of sentiments or manifested actions. Traits can be combined to form patterns, and patterns may be further classified into ideal patterns or actual patterns.

Comparative methods can also be used as such methods have been common in Anthropological studies from the time of E B Tylor in 1889. The 'Salient features' associated with each culture can also be identified before carrying out a more detailed exercise as this will have a bearing of the taxonomy arrived at, and will throw hints on what areas to focus on. A high level assessment of the Strengths, Weaknesses and constraints of a given culture may be carried out before a more detailed assessment is conducted. Preliminary and unstructured 'gut feel' approaches may also have some validity, but must be subsequently verified with empirical data. Carrying out fieldwork to experience a culture first-hand would also be an essential pre-requisite in most cases.

Researchers have also attempted to break up cultures into traits and assign these developmental sequences, or develop generalized heuristic techniques that could be used to study other cultures. Attempts were also made by George Peter Murdock, Emile Durkheim, Claude Levi Strauss, Donald Brown and others to analyze common universals across cultures. Murdock also set up the Human Relations Area Files or HRAF in which common categories of cultures were filed together. The objective of this was to collect ethnographic information from all over the world. Murdock and Douglas R. White

also introduced the concept of “Standard cross-cultural sample” by analyzing 186 sample cultures from North America, South America, Africa, the Circum-Mediterranean, East Eurasia, the Insular Pacific that could be used as a benchmark for studying other cultures and their different aspects. These efforts eventually led to the compilation of the ‘World Ethnographic Sample’.

Another pre-eminent approach recommends breaking up a culture into trait-complexes, and further into traits. Ruth Benedict believed that culture was made of many patterns which were bound together into a logical and harmonious whole. Such patterns are also known as cultural patterns, and bestow upon cultures a distinct individuality. M.E Opler also recommended summative principles in culture called themes. Themes are general motivations responsible for behavioural patterns of members of a society, are similar to, but more elastic than Ruth Benedict’s cultural patterns and are crucial to understanding cultural structure. Claude Levi Strauss broke up words and cultural sections into phonemes, morphemes, etc. in the search for the underlying reality of the human mind. Another more recent but popular idea is that of Memetics which is used to represent the different units of a culture which can aid in cultural transmission e.g. ways of dressing, cooking etc. This idea was popularized by Richard Dawkins in the 1970’s. Memetics proposes that ideas, skills, practices, and so on, are entities that replicate themselves and are used to propagate cultural traits, much like genes in evolutionary biology. Memetics involves breaking down of a culture or a sub-culture into discrete and manageable units, and is used to construct the broad framework and the superstructure of a given culture by breaking it down into logical and inter-related sub-components.

Personality attributes or traits

In addition, we may also attempt to identify personality attributes or traits in relation to a given culture. These would represent either the mean or most common i.e. modal values of people in a specific culture. Various types of meaningful analyses are possible including the computation of mean values for a particular culture, analysis of value distributions, dimensional analyses, computation of metrics such as standard deviations, assessment of outliers, and an analysis of drift over a period in time. Such an analysis must also capture cultural attitudes and the popular sentiment of a culture, particularly those geared towards cultural adaptation and assimilation of new traits, and express them in relatively tangible terms. Analysis across dimensions such as age would also constitute another useful analysis, with major downstream benefits. A combination of these two approaches would, in our view, ensure that the Anthropologist has a grip of any particular culture. This is a seemingly innocuous yet powerful multi-pronged strategy that seeks to map a culture completely. For greater efficacy, taxonomies must be constructed correctly and attributes and traits comprehensively laid out. ^{38 39}

³⁸ Ember, Melvin, Evolution of the Human Relations Area Files in Cross-Cultural Research, 1997

³⁹ Divale, William, Pre-Coded Variables for the Standard Cross-Cultural Sample from World Cultures. Volumes I & II. York College, CUNY, Spring 2000.

Positive attributes or traits may include:

- Honesty - Sincerity - Truthfulness - Capability for hard-work - Obedience - Optimism - Creativity - Dynamism - Future-orientation - Discipline - Methodical approach - Punctuality - Perfectionism - Affection towards others - <<This is an open list>>

Negative attributes or traits may include

- Pessimism - Cynicism - Jealousy - Ego - Snobbishness - Greed - Past-orientation - Contempt or derision toward others - <<This is an open list>>

Integration of a Cultural Taxonomy with the process of Identity-formation

We recommend that every item in a cultural taxonomy must be linked to Identity-formation eventually. This is desirable in the interests of robust scholarship, but is by no means easy and the ends shall be left untied for the moment. The co-relation between various items in a cultural taxonomy and the process of identity-formation or the lack of it must be rated. We proposed that the degrees of co-relation be rated as very high, high, moderate, low, very low or non-existent. For example, the co-relation between religion and identity formation is typically high, the co-relationship between language and identity formation high, the co-relationship between socio-economic landscape and political landscape, moderate, while the co-relationship between foods, music, dress and identity formation is low. In the case of a few hypothetical examples, a co-relation may even be non-existent. In many cases, the relationship may be uni-directional: for example, a rigid religion may impact culture uni-directionally with little leeway for feedback; but in the case of less rigid ideologies, this may not be so. This kind of a mapping must be carried out in its entirety by future generations of scholars, and in different cultures or contexts so that the process of identity-formation may be properly understood. Positive and negative attributes or traits can likewise be associated with cultures, and these can likewise have a bearing on the process of identity-formation.

Levels of identity formation

We propose that identity formation can be analyzed and studied at the following levels. This could also be construed as a nested hierarchy, and each level can be understood as an aggregation of a lower level and its constituents. However, in reality, influences are multi-directional across levels. Furthermore, they will also always be subjected to external and outside influences. Thus, personal and social identity are a part of a grand overarching framework, and two sides of the same coin:

1. At the level of the Global socio-cultural landscape (Globalized human): The idea of a globalized human is a relatively recent construct, and one that has been made possible due to globalization in the contemporary, and not archaic sense of the term. Even scholars such as Samuel P Huntington define the idea of 'cultural civilizations', and a conflict between these 'cultural civilizations' posing a threat to world peace. His idea of a multi-polar and a multi-civilizational world, may be somewhat

outdated now, and at odds with the notion of rapid socio-cultural convergence. We thus presume, that this will not be a primary area of focus, or a primary unit of study, but one that will need to be studied as an outcome of several other inter-related and under-lying processes.⁴⁰

2. At the level of a group of Cultural units also often known as a cultural region or a cultural sphere based ideas developed by Clark Wissler and A L Kroeber: Identity formation can also be analyzed and studied at the level of an inter-related group of cultures, possessing common traits or attributes (akin to Ratzel's study of cultures, or the idea of cultural cattle complexes of Africa), but this may seldom form an important criteria of study, because attributes can be studied more granularly at a cultural level. The Cultural Areas of the world were mapped by Whitten and Hunter, those in Africa by Melville J. Herskovits, and those in the United States by Clark Wissler. Joel Garreau, for example, proposed in 1981 that North America could be sub-divided into nine units based on distinctive cultural and economic features. Divisions can however be much smaller or much more specialized or contextual (i.e. linguistic isoglosses, heteroglosses or isographs) as demonstrated between the Brunig-Napf-Reuss line in Switzerland or the Grote-rivieren boundary between Dutch and Flemish culture, and the Anthropologist must choose his units of analysis with utmost care, and based on the realities of the situation. Another related concept is that of a macro-culture, and examples for this can include the Muslim world which is spread across continents, or what Jurgen Habermas refers to as Euro-patriotism. In some cases, this kind of an identity may not be relevant in ordinary circumstances or course of events, but comes to play under special or extraordinary circumstances especially in non in situ contexts. They are therefore, usually shallow, ephemeral and transient. For example, Indians may don a Pan-Asian identity in the USA to emphasize their collective identity. Likewise, adherents of Shia-Sunni sects may feign an artificial unity in the USA especially when their identity is under threat. This may be done through the use of standard identity markers. Other examples include empathy by denizens of developing countries for those living in other developing countries and empathy amongst non-whites for their brethren. Likewise, the ill-treatment meted out to Rohingya Muslims in Myanmar bred sympathy from Indian Muslims but relatively less sympathy from Indian Hindus, who were more concerned with the massacre of Rohingya Hindus by Rohingya Muslims.
3. At the level of a Cultural unit: Analysis can also be carried out at the level of a cultural unit, which is often understood by its most popular manifestation or connotation viz. Germany, or a linguistic state in India. This may often represent the most logical or sensible way of performing an analysis, and one that must be recommended for its simplicity alone.
4. At the level of a cultural dimension: Analysis can also be carried out at the level of sex, socio-economic group or age bracket, though this would seldom constitute a primary level of analysis. It would be carried out in conjunction with some other primary basis of analysis to ratify or refine concepts.
5. At an individual level: This would constitute the most meaningful units of analysis in most cases, though it could often be tedious and cumbersome if it involves a large number of subjects, and must always be preceded by proper bucketing, compartmentalization and statistical sampling.

⁴⁰ The Clash of Civilizations and the remaking of world order by Samuel P. Huntington, Simon and Shuster, 1996

6. In addition to standard groups or categories, we also have the concept of self-categorization, and these solely exist in the mind of an individual based on cognitive, emotional and behavioural outcomes, and may overlap fully or partly with other categories.

Equilibrium and non-equilibrium

Insular non-equilibrium

Insular non-equilibrium from a strictly cultural perspective may occur in insular cultures. Inhabitants of such cultures may have ratings of attributes that are at wide variance with that of the outside world. Thus, they may have uniformly high or low ratings for specific attributes – for example, members of a tribe may be humble and docile, while members of a tribe may be greedy, aggressive and suspicious. This is typically ascribed to a lack of horizontal factors, and a lack of exposure to outside forces and influences. Furthermore, members of such tribes are likely to possess similar attributes and traits, with very little variation among the members of the group. An extreme example of this are the Sentinelese of North Sentinel Island of the Andaman and Nicobar Islands in India, a pre-Neolithic tribe which has lived in complete isolation for tens of thousands of years, shunning contact with the outside world, often violently. This has also impacted their biological identity, leading to insular dwarfism.

Hypothetical or ideal equilibrium

Hypothetical or ideal equilibrium is a hypothetical state of equilibrium that is likely to be accomplished if the cultures of the world interact with one another on a free and an unhindered basis, and if the likely cultural remediation strategies such as suitable changes to educational systems are implemented. This is a purely hypothetical state and may be achieved over several generations, if all barriers to globalization are removed. It may be by and large achieved in some cultures, and not achieved in some. This is akin to a mythical modal person, or a hypothetical ideal culture. Hypothetical, ideal or terminal values for different attributes and traits can be worked out using judgmental techniques, and there may be little scope for individual or cultural variation in such scenarios. A simple average cannot be taken because some cultures could be expected to change more than some others to achieve a harmonious or a near-harmonious equilibrium. Such an enhanced or modified state will therefore inevitably result in changes to individual cultures in general but these changes may vary in degree and nature. This concept is based on the concept of the Psychic unity of Mankind or the innate equality of all humans which states that humans are driven by the same urges and restrained by the same inhibitions.

Achievable state of near-equilibrium

The Achievable state of near-equilibrium is a state that can be practically achieved under real-world conditions and constraints, and one that must consciously worked towards through cultural remediation techniques while keeping in mind the ethics of such an issue. This will also take into account the limitations of global ethno-convergence while studying the innate tendencies of each culture to merge or stay aloof separately.

Accomplished or attained equilibrium

Accomplished or attained equilibrium refers to a state of equilibrium within and across cultures that has been fully or partly been accomplished due to an enhanced state of mutual interaction. This would require a periodic analysis of the existing state of affairs with a roadmap for further cultural remediation. In typical scenarios, 'low-hanging fruits' would be more amenable to change, while some aspects of culture would not change more rapidly or easily. Accomplished self-equilibrium can be measured by assessing the attributes and traits of the base culture with the present culture and ideal culture, and charting a course trajectory. This is based on the principle that the psychic unity of mankind has its own limitations, these being those of cultural inertia or environmental constraints.

The 'Ethnography of Enculturation'

We believe, as Anthropologists, that a formal and a structured study of the process of enculturation in diverse contexts is a must. This would constitute a black box approach, as opposed to a white box approach, which is seldom reliable or even possible in such cases, and is also a specialized case study approach. This would constitute another core link between Anthropology, Psychology, and the science of Human growth and development. As Anthropologists, we frown upon impractical approaches, and those which take recourse to meaningless high-sounding jargon that use such jargon for jargon's sake, but lack a human touch: we reiterate that approaches driven by human contact and analysis in multi-cultural perspectives are the only way forward. A large number of case studies over a period in time would undoubtedly help home theories and concepts to perfection. We had proposed the 'Structured and Annotated Participant-driven Appraisal' technique in Ethnography towards the universal realization of Multivocality in Ethnographic studies, and the underlying concepts and principles of this approach must be used for the 'Ethnography of Enculturation' as well. We propose that such experiments be primarily carried out by social and cultural Anthropologists who are neutral to outcomes, though other domain experts may also be involved as necessary. The requisite inputs and outcomes of such studies are then passed on to different groups as the need may be.⁴¹

Thus, the 'Ethnography of Enculturation' would encompass several distinct approaches, which can be used in combination with one another for a meaningful study for different aspects of culture. These are:

- a. Random approach: in this approach, a large number of individuals are selected randomly without any pre-conceived bias.
- b. Statistical Sampling: Statistical sampling is carried out based on meaningful parameters, and these were discussed in our paper which dealt with the 'Structured and Annotated Participant-driven Appraisal' technique in Ethnography. Studies carried out across disparate and distinct cultures reduce the risk arising from confirmation bias and cognitive bias, and lead to the formulation of comprehensive and well-grounded theories.
- c. Outcome-based approach: Per this approach, subjects are selected on the basis of what they have become in life. Examples could be mavericks, geniuses, downers, goners, queer

⁴¹ Unleashing the potential of the 'Structured and Annotated Participant-driven Appraisal' technique in Ethnography: Towards the universal realization of Multivocality in Ethnographic studies , Sujay Rao Mandavilli, ELK Asia Pacific Journal of Social Science, 2018

personalities, feral children, alcoholics, delinquents, successful men and even terrorists and extremists.

- d. Direct approaches which is based on quantitative and qualitative techniques such as direct interviewing and participant observation and indirect approaches which are based on secondary sources of information.
- e. Forward approaches and historical approaches. In the case of the former, participants are observed from a specific point in time onwards, while in the second case, their antecedents and background is traced through direct or indirect approaches.
- f. Cross-sectional study as opposed to longitudinal study: In this type of study, people of different ages are studied on one occasion.
- g. Complex pre-planned experiments: This may involve a great degree of foresight and strategizing with a goal in sight. Examples could be the swapping of toddlers of different ages cross cultures to study the outcome of cultures on the process of identity formation.

The Ethnography will also include aspects of Critical Ethnography which is based on critical theory. In other words, it considers implicit values in ethnographic studies, cognitive thought patterns and symbolic systems arising from cultural backgrounds, and the biases and errors of judgment arising therefrom. It also recognizes the ethnographers own limitations, seeks to ask 'What-if' and 'What could be' questions and attempts to perform context and role juggling. This approach would also lead to nomothetic outcomes in the long-run and the formulation of generalized rules and context-neutral principles.

We also propose the idea of 'Perpetual ethnography' or 'Ethnography in perpetuity' which can be a vital heuristic aid in cultural remediation, and will study a culture or a theme perpetually to assess long-term trends and variations. This may not be carried out by a single team, and therefore, must be accompanied by formal handovers. A variation of this may be to study enculturation across generations to assess the process of enculturation, and the changes over generations.

Human development and Identity

The earliest evidence of the study of human development in modern times dates to 1787, when a journal in Germany contained Dietrich Tiedemann's observation of his son's sensory, and cognitive development over his first two and half years. This was similar to baby biographies being maintained at the time. In 1877, Charles Darwin published notes on his son Doddy's sensory, cognitive and emotional development over his first twelve months. In the early 1900's G. Stanley Hall, undertook systematic studies of child development and senescence. Identity development is mostly impacted by cognitive development which includes learning, memory, language, intellect and emotion, and is impacted by the development of the brain, and much less by physical development which is a different field by itself. The term cognition may be defined as any activity relating to, or involving conscious, intellectual activity. (Merriam Webster dictionary) cognitive science is therefore, the inter-disciplinary, scientific study of the mind and its processes, by examining the nature and functions of cognition. The method of study often used is naturalistic, or study of a subject in its natural habitat.

The human lifespan is sub-divided into various periods, and this is largely driven by social norms. This may vary from culture to culture, and there may be variations from individual to individual. The typical classification is the pre-natal period (before birth), Infancy and toddlerhood (birth to age 3), Early Childhood (3 to 6 years), Middle Childhood (6 to 11 years), Adolescence (11 to 20 years), and Adulthood.

The process of identity formation is impacted by normative and non-normative events and influences. The former refers to events and influences experienced by all or most members of a group, while the latter refer to unusual events or influences either positive or negative experienced by one or a few members of the group. The timing of the occurrence of an event is also crucial to the process of identity-formation. A critical period is a period where events have a high impact on the process of identity formation; this concept is controversial, events may impact people greatly even later in life, though the period of influence will naturally be smaller; some other developmental psychologists prefer to use the term 'sensitive periods' instead. Thus, per Paul B. Baltes's life span developmental approach which is widely accepted today, development is lifelong, is influenced by both culture and biology, and historical aspects of a culture. (Baltes, Lindenberger & Staudinger, 1998) (Staudinger and Bluck, 2001)

John Locke proposed the idea of a Tabula Rasa, that each child was a blank slate on which thoughts could be written. This is also referred to the mechanistic model of development, which implies that people are like machines that react to environmental inputs. (Pepper, 1942,1961). On the other hand, French philosopher Jean Jacques Rousseau believed that children were born "noble savages" who would develop according to their positive tendencies unless corrupted by society. Rousseau was the precursor of the organismic model of development where people were active, growing organisms who defined their own developmental processes. Mechanists view development as a continuous process which occurs from birth to death, while Organismic theorists view development as a series of steps or stages, with each stage building upon the previous one and preparing him for the next. Psycho-analysts are deeply divided between the two approaches, and each of the schools held sway in different periods. Of late, Quasi-organismic and bi-directional approaches have become popular, with children influencing environments as well.

Human development can be understood from five major theoretical perspectives namely, the Psychoanalytic perspective which focuses on unconscious emotions and drives (Sigmund Freud and Erik H. Erikson), Learning perspective including behaviourism, operant conditioning and social learning theory which studies observable behaviour (Ivan Pavlov and John B. Watson), Cognitive perspective which analyzes thought processes and encompasses brain research (Jean Piaget), Evolutionary or Socio-biological perspective which takes into account evolutionary and biological underpinnings of behaviour (E.O.Wilson), and Contextual perspectives which emphasize on social, historical and cultural factors and the inseparability of man and his environment (Urie Bronfenbrenner).

Some early psychoanalysts had proposed that humans imitate behaviour that others perform (Baldwin (1906), (Morgan 1906) (McDougall 1908), and this from our analogy, would constitute an important building block of identity formation. In a later theory, American-Canadian psychologist Albert Bandura proposed that learned behaviours were not always performed, and proposed several pre-conditions

that would determine whether imitative behaviour would occur. These typically include retention over time including breadth and depth, motor processes, and inventive or motivational processes.

We must also mention the concept of micro-system here; this refers to a pattern of activities within a setting such as a home, school or workplace, in which a person lives on a daily basis. A mesosystem is an interaction between two or more Microsystems in which a person operates, examples being linkages between school and home, and feedback sent by the teacher. An exosystem consists of linkages between two or more settings, but one of the settings does not affect the person directly, and he does not form a part of it. The macrosystem consists of the overall cultural patterns in a society such as religion or parenting styles, and impacts the individual in a myriad different ways. Lastly, the chronosystem refers to the changes taking place in the society over a period, thus impacting him positively or negatively. These may reflect the stability of a society, or a lack of it. Another important theory of social contact is the social convoy theory. According to this theory, people move through life surrounded by social convoys. i.e., circles of close friends and family members. The social convoy determines a person's proclivities, or is in some cases, determined by a person's proclivities. This is also related to the socio-emotional selectivity theory proposed by Laura Carstensen which dictates who people associate with, and spend their time with, and is determined by the desire to maintain a sense of self, and balance this with social relationships. Needless to say, all these factors would impact the process of identity development. All these factors also lead to social reality which refers to the phenomenological perspective of a group. This leads to a common interpretation of events, and in extreme cases in group think or collective think.

Much progress has also been accomplished on the development of the brain in infancy and in childhood, and this has a major impact on the development of cognitive processes. The brain at birth only weighs 25 percent of its adult weight of 1500 grams. It reaches seventy percent of that weight at age one, and ninety percent at age three. Thus, different organs grow at different rates, with further variations by ethnicity and sex. Events that occur before the age of three are not stored in memory because the brain is not developed enough. This is referred to as Infantile Amnesia. More recent research suggests that thoughts are indeed stored in infants, but for much shorter durations. This is also known as working memory, or short term memory. Others claim that such thoughts are latent, and seldom actively recalled. However, the implication of this for our purpose is that meaningful identity formation begins only at the age of three, and anything before this is only auxiliary to a study. It is at this age that components of long-term memory such as procedural memory, semantic memory, and episodic memory begin to develop. Psychologists also differentiate between explicit memory which involves conscious or explicit recollection, and implicit memory, which deals with sub-conscious activities, habits and skills such as playing and walking. Implicit memory begins to develop much faster, and matures earlier.

Another important theory is Piaget's Theory of Cognitive development. As per this approach, the Sensorimotor stage of Cognitive development includes six sub-stages. This includes the use of reflexes (birth to one month), Primary circular reactions including repetition of pleasurable behaviours and co-ordination of sensory information (one to four months), Secondary circular reactions involving greater interest in the environment (4 to 8 months), Co-ordination of secondary schemes (8 to 12 months),

Tertiary circular reactions involving curiosity and experimentation (12 to 18 months) and Mental combinations (18 to 24 months). Children also gradually develop knowledge about objects and space, and that they exist independently of other objects and people and can relate to them in different ways. They also develop the idea of causality, and knowledge of the effect of their own actions, a number sense, categorization, representational thinking and Imitation.

Several new approaches have been proposed to study cognitive development. These include the Information processing approach which focuses on the mental processes involved in perception, knowledge and memory solving, processing of visual and auditory signals, and also studies individual differences with a view to construct general laws. The Cognitive Neuroscience approach, which is irrelevant to our approach, examines the hardware of the central nervous system, and attempts to identify what brain structures are involved in specific aspects of cognition. The Social-contextual approach examines environmental aspects of the learning process, particularly the role of parents, elders and influencers.

Cognitive development includes language development which must form a specialization by itself. This may include crying, babbling, imitation of language sounds in early years followed by linguistic speech which includes the first words, more words, and complete sentences, followed by an eventual understanding of complex grammar. B.F Skinner and others maintained that language was learnt in social contexts, and through reinforcement of caregivers. This is known as the Learning theory. On the other hand, Noam Chomsky proposed the idea of nativism which implied that the human brain had an innate capacity for language learning, and that talking was as natural as walking. In other words, humans are born with universal perceptual mechanisms that are attuned to language learning, and that no formal training is required for formal language learning. Language also plays a major role in shaping worldviews and thought processes, as per the Sapir-Whorf hypothesis and theories of Linguistic determinism. Resultantly, people speaking different languages have different thought processes. While this may be taking the idea to extreme lengths, our conservative assessment is that, different cultures attach different levels of importance to language (Linguicatures or language-centric cultures and Non language-centric cultures) Cognitive linguistics is another branch of linguistics combining knowledge from both psychology and linguistics, how language derives from, and contributes to cognitive processes, how language forms thoughts, and the evolution of language parallel with the change in mindset across time. Psycholinguistics is another field of study which analyzes the inter-relation between language and human psychology.

Basic cognition patterns such as smiles appear within the infant's first month, followed by sadness, joy, fear and emotions within the first few months. The process of self-awareness or self-consciousness may appear between 15 to 24 months, followed by self-conscious emotions such as embarrassment, empathy and envy, and self-evaluative emotions such as pride, shame and guilt. Empathy may begin to develop in the second year, along with social cognition, or the ability to gauge other people's intuition and intentions, and may only increase slowly. These factors unquestionably play a major role in individuation and identity-formation and must be studied in social and cultural contexts. William James, in the late Nineteenth century, described two different kinds of selves: the I-self and theme-self. The I-self is a subjective entity that constructs and learns about the Me-self. The Me-self is on the other hand,

what can be known about the self. The I-self therefore emerges first, usually from birth to around 15 months, followed by the Me-self, which emerges between 15 and 30 months. Another emerging and related field of study is cognitive psychology which is the study of mental processes such as attention, language use, memory, perception, problem solving and creative processes.

Individuation may also be driven by the formation of emotions. Some psychologists have classified emotions into egoistic (those related to self), ego-altruistic (those geared towards self-satisfaction), altruistic (desire to help or harm others) and personal emotions (idealistic, intellectual, moral etc). McDougall, on the other hand, has grouped emotions into three categories i.e. primary, secondary and derivative. Primary emotions refer to basic and independent instincts, while secondary emotions such as love and hatred are based on primary emotions. Derivative emotions such as expectation, anxiety and frustration are those which are derived from secondary emotion.⁴²

The term intelligence is often widely misunderstood, and poorly understood. Different psychologists have proposed different ideas about intelligence, and how to measure them. Most assume intelligence to be inborn, but that is not necessarily the case. Intelligence can often be channelized and honed to perfection through a variety of techniques. Those who show brilliance in a field may fail utterly in others; those who are perceived as being intelligent, may even underperform in academics. Terman defines intelligence as 'The capacity to do abstract thinking'. According to Wechsler, "Intelligence is the aggregate or the global capacity of the individual to act purposefully, to think rationally, and to deal effectively with his environment." Intelligence is measured using the IQ scale and is obtained by dividing mental age by the chronological age. However, differences in intelligence across individuals are a reality, as the brain is a complex organ with millions of neurons. Differences can be ascertained perhaps not by assessing basic cognitive functions by more advanced analytical abilities and the processing of complex thoughts and higher mental abilities. The genetic basis of intelligence is also poorly understood, and this may remain so for many more days to come.

Temperament, another major distinguishing factor, begins to emerge only slowly. Temperament is usually consistent within an individual across time, but may vary widely across individuals, and distribution patterns are usually neutral to ethnic or cultural groups unless modulated by social circumstances. A pioneering study in temperament was the New York Longitudinal Study which followed 133 infants into adulthood. Based on this study, children were classified into 'easy' (mild and positive moods), 'difficult' (intense and negative moods), or 'slow to warm up'. While temperament may be in-born and partially hereditary (i.e. determined genetically) as evidenced by differences in new-borns, it is not fully formed at birth, and divergences may increase with the passage of time. It however forms the basis upon which new thoughts and patterns are processed and analyzed. Differences in temperament may be exacerbated by cultural factors such as parenting and the general environment, and this was observed by Margaret Mead as well (Banks, 1989). A combination of the two will impact identity formation in different situations, and across individuals.

⁴² Developmental Psychology Prof S P Chaube, Neelkamal Publications, New Delhi, 2007

Socialization is the process through which children develop habits, skills and values to make them responsible and productive members of society. This process depends on the internalization of the society's standards, ethics, values and norms, and also impacts identity formation, but internalization is process by itself. 'Socially learned behaviour', and 'social learning' is defined as copying or acquiring behaviour observed in others. Social learning involves copying of behaviors from a model, though it may have biases, including success bias (copying from those who are better off), status bias (copying from those with higher status), homophily (copying from those most like ourselves), conformist bias (disproportionately picking up behaviors that more people are performing), etc. For example, Americans may be culturally more individualistic, and Indians less so. This will also depend on the social group, and family values and norms besides latent temperament. This lends itself to a wide variety of permutations and combinations, and a wide spectrum of behavioural traits and attributes as manifested differently in different situations.

Another new theory, the Dual inheritance theory, also known as bio-cultural evolution, was developed between the 1960s to the 1980s to explain how human behaviour may be a product of two different and interacting evolutionary processes, namely genetic evolution and cultural evolution. This approach was ratified through the research of Marcus Feldman, Cavalli-Sforza, E. O Wilson and others, and states that genes and culture continually interact with each other, and changes in genes can lead to changes in culture which can then influence genetic selection, and vice versa. Thus, culture evolves partly through a Darwinian selection process or genetic evolution, and the Dual Inheritance Theory examines cultural evolution and the interactions between cultural evolution and genetic evolution.

Other factors impacting the process of identity formation

There can be several other factors impacting identity formation in addition to biological factors, societal orientations and mind-orientations. The following is an incomplete and a sample list to which more factors may be added:

Avoidance, fear of retribution and punishment

Ideas are also reinforced through concepts such as punishment and explicit reinforcement of ideas through carrot and stick approaches or other suitable approaches. For example, the taking of Aspirin may eventually come to be associated with the removal of headache, and children may be weaned off late night movies by punishing them for staying up late. Another concept is that of avoidance, and as per this approach, dogs may be given an electric shock if they attempt to cross an electric fence. Standard theories in avoidance are the Two-factor theory (Mowrer, 1947) comprising classical conditioning or Pavlovian conditioning (pairing and involuntary stimuli) and operant conditioning which includes reinforcement (positive and negative) and punishment (positive and negative) for conscious thoughts, the One-factor theory (Sidman (1953) (Herrnstein and Hineline (1966)), and the Cognitive theory of Avoidance behavior. (Seligmann and Johnston (1973))

Choice and time allocation

Factors such as choice and time allocation also play a major role in identity formation, and this may largely be effected by the individual's mind-orientation and voluntary choice. Many theories have been proposed to deal with choice and time allocation, and these include the matching equation theory (Hernstein 1970) which implies a matching of time with the perceived value of the reinforcement. The Optimization theory is based on principles derived from the field of Microeconomics which states that income is distributed based on subjective value, optimization in relation to the environment. ⁴³

Interests, avocations and pastimes

These would depend on the cultural proclivities of a society, would also impact resource and time allocation, and would naturally have an oblique, if not direct effect on the process of identity formation. People may consciously or sub-consciously develop their personalities and identities around the interests and careers they wish to pursue including intellectual, scholastic and technical skills. People in Andhra Pradesh have typically pursued farming, and have developed their ideas and identities accordingly, even though this may now gradually be beginning to change.

Power, Power structures and role models

Power, power structures and role models also form an important part of identity formation. Humans naturally, and often sub-consciously choose role models. Power structures are usually top-down forces, and may be either prohibitive, restrictive, or empowering. Thus, power impulse has two forms: Explicit, in leaders, and implicit, in followers. Per Foucault, there has been a general shift from judicial or law-like power to normalizing or regulatory power over the past couple of centuries. Adler, in his book 'Understanding human nature', distinguishes humans into two types i.e. 'submissive type', where the submissive individual lives by the rules and laws of others, and indoctrinating himself to them. On the other hand, we have the 'impervious type', who choose to be radical and different, and seeks to put themselves above others. A third category of individuals choose to submit themselves to divine will. Such temperaments unquestionably shape the process of identity formation, but to what extent they are inborn or shaped by society is open to question. Is it because brains are wired differently? Is it primarily due to social factors? Both factors may play a role. For example, leaders can be benevolent, malevolent and dictatorial, using both physical and mental power, and their traits can be both inborn or shaped by society. ⁴⁴

Imagination and creativity

It is very difficult to define creativity. According to J P Guilford, creative thinking involves multi-dimensional analysis of a problem, ability to deal with different ideas and redefine problems. Thinking may also be classified into convergent and divergent thinking. Convergent thinking is rigidity, conformity

⁴³ Learning and Behaviour, James E. Marur, Prentice Hall of India Pvt Ltd, 1989

⁴⁴ Power: A new social analysis, Bertrand Russell, George, Allen and Unwen, London, 1938

and unquestioning acceptance of authority. Divergent thinking refers to a mindset characterized by original approaches and criticism of traditional approaches. Creativity is as much cultural as it has to do with individuality. It may depend on standard of living, economic freedom, social freedom, time for relaxation, and other attributes of culture. Creativity is associated with a high degree of ideation and may be measured in terms of IP rights, patents, copyrights etc.

Achievement Motivation

Different societies value and cherish achievement to different degrees. The desire for achievement in specific societies, and the relative lack of it in some others, was noted by Henry Murray as early as 1938. McLelland and his colleagues looked for ways to quantify this in different parts of the world in the 1950's. Needless to say, this would also be a core driver of individuation, and cultures valuing and cherishing personal achievement are bound to have many individuals with strong and distinct personalities and identities.

Patterns of enculturation and patterns of acculturation

We propose the concept of patterns of Enculturation (and as an extension patterns of acculturation), similar to the patterns of culture proposed by Ruth Benedict, to compare and contrast how the processes of enculturation operate in different cultures, and how these change with the passage of time. It also seeks to understand and explain inter-connections between different aspects of enculturation, for example how a change in one aspect of enculturation such as a change in the schooling or education system can have a ripple effect on other aspects of enculturation.⁴⁵

Process of identity formation

We now attempt to delineate the process of identity formation in brief from the time an infant is born till his identity is more or less cemented based on the concepts discussed in this paper:

Tabula Rasa

The idea of a Tabula Rasa (Latin: blank slate) is one where a human is born with no in-built mental content and ideas are shaped entirely through experience or perception. This is also related in some ways to the doctrine of empiricism which states that knowledge comes primarily from sensory experience. Some philosophers such as Immanuel Kant believe that some ideas are innate, and did not depend on previous experience. This concept is known as innatism. Most other psychologists propose a via media solution where some ideas are innate, and some learnt through association. The entire debate is sometimes referred as the nature versus nurture debate.

Basic temperaments

An individual's temperament may be defined as a person's nature which casts a permanent shadow on his personality – it begins to manifest itself only slowly in childhood. While temperament may be

⁴⁵ Patterns of Culture by Ruth Benedict, Houghton Mifflin Company, New York 1934

partially in-born and partially hereditary (i.e. determined genetically) as evidenced by differences between new-borns, it is not fully formed at birth, and divergences usually increase with the passage of time. Nonetheless, it is largely biological and is relatively independent of learning, systems of values, and attitudes. It is also the basis upon which new thoughts and patterns are processed and analyzed. Differences in temperament may also increase due to cultural factors such as parenting and the general environment, and temperament may form a basis for mind-orientation. The latter is a sub-conscious process where an individual adjusts his orientation based on his temperament and societal orientation. There is therefore, no mind-orientation at birth, even though there may be a temperament. This approach given enough leeway to accommodate the 'Great man theory', but the process of genetic transmission of traits is poorly understood.

Intelligence

The term intelligence is often widely misunderstood, but generally refers not only to the ability to acquire and apply knowledge or skills but also to the ability to reason, plan, think abstractly and deal with cognitive complexity. Different psychologists have proposed different ideas about intelligence, and how to measure them. Some psychologists assume intelligence to be inborn, but that is not always the case. Intelligence can often be channelized and honed to perfection through a variety of techniques, and must often be studied along with aptitude to measure efficacy. It may also fluctuate widely on occasion to occasion, and from context to context. Even though the idea of intelligence is controversial, it may determine perception and may greatly aid in identity formation and individuation. Highly intelligent people are often non-conformists, and have unique personalities as they channelize their energies to perform complex intellectual feats.

Socio-cultural contexts and Enculturation

The process of identity formation would also be greatly impacted by socio-cultural contexts, and the social orientation of the society he is born in. This greatly impacts the formation of new ideas and the association of ideas in socio-cultural contexts, and in most cases is a constant process of self-discovery, self-realization, and self-actualization within the constraints of a society or culture. Thus, the culture provides a frame of reference in which thoughts can be analyzed, and new ideas can be formed. The patterns of enculturation also vary widely from society to society, as do ideas on parenting and child independence. Individual identities may also be socially constructed to varying degrees and this would also largely depend on the social context, and also largely on the individual. This aspect has been pointed out by George Herbert Mead, Norbert Elias, Erving Goffmann and others. There are therefore three possibilities.

1. Individuals override and shape culture: This is often a characteristic of dynamic societies with an ever-changing culture, though normally dynamic cultures may be rigid in some respects.
2. Individuals in harmony with culture with limited possibilities for overriding cultural norms.
3. Individuals subservient to cultures: This is associated with static or rigid cultures where cultural remediation is very difficult.

The process of identity formation has also been explained by GH Mead as a constant interaction between 'me' who moves through the social world, and the 'I', which is a post hoc, self-reflexive, self-scrutinizing aspect of the self. Most other researchers have reached similar conclusions: for example, Erving Goffman distinguishes between personal identity (the unique characteristics of the person both in themselves, and in relations with others), social identity (derived from membership of social categories), and an 'ego identity' which is a subjective sense of the self. Per Norbert Elias, there is a general perception of individual identity as a black box, but individual identity is also shaped by social identity, and 'civilizing processes'; thus, selfhood and identity are produced through social relations which are used by individuals for social understanding. The French sociologist Pierre Bourdieu has likewise developed the concept of 'habitus' to explain the process of internalization of social constructs through mimesis till they become a developed habit or second nature. Habitus here may be referred to as the ingrained skills, habits and dispositions which help individuals perceive the social world around them and react to it, thereby internalizing social values. It may also be referred to as 'socialized subjectivity'. (Bourdieu and Wacquant (2002)) The underlying principles of social identity are therefore those of dependency on society, inseparability with society, satisfaction of social and emotional needs through society, and fear or retribution, retaliation and ostracism. It assesses the causes and consequences of identifying with a particular social group. On the other hand, they are always counterbalanced with individual traits such as personality, gender, and sexual orientation. The nuances and intricacies of identity formation are too complex and multi-dimensional to be presented here; new theories can come only from comprehensive ethnographic data and analyses. Indeed, something as trivial as one's own name can kickstart or retard the process of identity formation; it is impossible to list out the different kinds of possibilities without proper fieldwork in multi-cultural contexts and proper ethnographic study.

Association

Early ideas of association were proposed by Aristotle in 350 BC, and these were elementary theories of association. Association is also based on the principle of contiguity i.e. the more closely associated in time and space two objects are, the greater is likely to be the association between them. Later theories of association were also developed by British Associationists such as Thomas Hobbes, John Locke, James Mill, John Stuart Mill, and others. Association can also be irrational, and associations may be formed where none are warranted (Examples being magical thinking, delusional thinking or in extreme cases, hallucinations). Conversely, meaningful associations may be overlooked either due to lack of attention, introvertedness or dogma. Interpretations may also be carried out in socio-cultural contexts, and may vary from culture to culture.

Individual and collective experiences

The process of identity formation may also be impacted by individual experiences which may vary widely from individual to individual, and also by collective experiences. These cannot be reliably modeled or predicted, but may leave a lasting impact on individuals or a group of individuals, nonetheless. The nature of individual experiences may vary widely, and can prove to be mind-altering. It

can be a car accident, the sight of a beggar on the street, or simply a post on social media. Collective experiences can be the treatment of Jews in Nazi Germany, air raids or a Blitzkrieg in one's childhood.

Ideation

Ideation is the creative process of generating new ideas, where an idea is a basic element of thought that is visual, concrete or abstract, and can be both innate or adventitious. This word had its roots in the Greek term *idea*, which means form or pattern. The process of idea generation may be wholly random, but it may be impacted by the ethos of the governing culture. The process of Ideation may change the mind-orientation of the individual, and impact the process of identity-formation as well, though such events and situations may be relatively rare.

Suppression of identity

"The good of man must be at the heart of the science of politics", said Aristotle. A suppression of identity is usually unsustainable and is followed by an assertion or a re-assertion of identity. This has been proven time and again since time immemorial, through wars, conquests, raids, incursions and annexations. It has also been demonstrated through human rights movements in many forms either directly or obliquely: the Indian movements for independence which began long before 1857; the American civil rights movement led by Martin Luther King, anti-apartheid movements of South Africa led by Nelson Mandela and Women suffrage movements of the early twentieth century. Dalit emancipation movements or anti-caste movements in India led by Jyothiba Phule and Babasaheb Ambedkar have also been cases in point. A variant of this theme is movements led by excluded or marginalized identities who are at the fringe of or outside mainstream activity; Women's activities have also been led by Amrita Devi of Rajasthan and Gaura Devi of the Chipko movement besides Wangari Maathai, Sarojini Naidu, Menaka Gandhi and Vandana Shiva, and the idea of Eco-feminism founded by Françoise d'Eubonne and inspired by Arne Naess and Murray Bookchin is an important landmark in ecological history. The fear of suppression of identity has also spawned movements such as the Dravidian movement, the Telangana statehood movement, and the Jharkhand Mukti Morcha, all in India. The intellectual tradition also emerged due to labour movements in the UK, the rise of industrial democracies and Fabian socialism in the UK, and the rise of nationalism in Germany. Such movements are also associated with a drastic change in the fabric of society and the increase in awareness and self-consciousness. Another example in modern times is the average Indian Muslim's morbid fear for the Hindutva movement; it is the fear of loss of one's identity that can raise emotions to a fever pitch. (Castells, 1997) Needless to say, these could operate at the level of an individual as well; Helen Keller's willpower and determination due to her being born deaf, dumb and blind are well-known. She went on to scale great heights in life.

Rationalization and self-equilibrium

The individual also attempts to attain self-equilibrium through the process of rationalization. This is usually a sub-conscious process or a conscious effort, and the objective of this is to maintain internal and external harmony and consistency, and reduce cognitive dissonance.

Cognitive dissonance

Cognitive dissonance is the mental or psychological stress suffered by a person who holds two or more contradictory ideas or views. This theory was first proposed by the American social psychologist Leon Festinger. An individual attempts to reduce the cognitive dissonance either by adding new parts to the cognition or through sub-conscious avoidance of incompatible ideas or information. Relations among cognitions could be consonant relationships (two cognitions or actions consistent with one another), irrelevant relationships (two cognitions or actions unrelated to each other), and dissonant relationships (two cognitions or actions inconsistent with one another). The magnitude of cognitive dissonance may be measured by the relative importance of cognitions attached to by the individual, and the proportion of dissonant to consonant elements. According to Festinger, people reduce the level of Cognitive dissonance in four ways: i.e. by changing the behaviour or the cognition, by justifying the behaviour or the cognition, by justifying the behaviour or the cognition by adding new cognitions, or by ignoring or denying information that conflicts with existing beliefs. While our approach is consistent with Festinger's view, we propose, from a social sciences perspective, rather than from purely a psychological perspective, a threshold level that there is a threshold level, and once this is crossed, a ground-up reassessment is initiated, and the subject chooses not to live with cognitive dissonance any longer. Before this threshold which may vary by individual and by context is reached, there is an implicit acceptance of contradictory viewpoints, and new ideas, if incompatible with existing ideas, are merely sub-ordinated to them, and related concepts are cherry-picking of ideas and selective amnesia of incompatible ideas. The threshold level is akin to a Eureka point or a mini-eureka point that is arrived at after introspection, and often leads to the replacement of an existing set of ideas by a new set of ideas, that are usually either fully or more consistent with each other i.e. it leads to a higher state. The process of resolution of cognitive dissonance is also normally accompanied by a great deal of trauma, agony and turmoil.⁴⁶

Types of Cognitive Dissonance

There are several other types of cognitive dissonance experienced by an individual during his lifetime, and these must be understood in relation to various aspects of his own culture i.e. his upbringing, peer pressure, the cultural norms associated with his own culture, the cultural norms associated with other cultures etc. We propose the following types of cognitive dissonance encountered at an individual level.

- a) Individual-level cognitive dissonance: This is the simplest type of individual-level cognitive dissonance and refers to a clash between an individual's own values or value sets arising from incompatibilities in thought processes or the prevalence of other unresolved issues. This naturally leads to a dichotomized individual with a sense of frustration and listlessness.
- b) Individual-level temporal cognitive dissonance: These refer to a clash between an individual's own values or value sets arising from changes to his own thought processes over a period in time.
- c) Clash between an individual values and the values of his immediate network: parents, peers, children etc. This may occur due to varying speeds in cultural and social adaptation.

⁴⁶ A theory of Cognitive dissonance, Leon Festinger, 1957, Stanford University Press

d) Clash between an individual's values and the values of his own culture or sub-culture arising due to differences in perception or varying rates of change. In such a case, an individual may lag behind the society's norms or may be in advance of them.

e) At times, an individual's values may be at permanent deviance with the society's norms. Such individuals are typically geniuses, prodigies, misfits or outcasts. (Permanent Cognitive Dissonance). Such individual level cognitive dissonance can occur, for example, when an individual's upbringing and early peer-influences are at odds with the expectations of society.

f) Multilevel cognitive dissonance: Multilevel cognitive dissonance may occur when a person is exposed to paradoxes repeatedly in various phases of his life. This may often be "personality-altering" or "belief-altering" after a flash-point is reached. This may on one hand lead to depression or suicidal tendencies but on the other hand, it may also be the springboard to creative thinking. However, cognitive dissonance within a limit (known as a threshold) may not only be inevitable, but also desirable. Cognitive dissonance within a limit may be inevitable because perfection may often be a far-fetched fantasy, and there are still too many paradoxes in science and society. It may be necessary to comply with societal norms.

g) Multilevel cognitive dissonance leading to mass mobilization and social change: Multilevel cognitive dissonance may also lead to disenchantment with the current state of affairs, inspire mass mobilization and eventually bring about the desired social change.

h) At times, cognitive dissonance can arise due to proactive (externally-induced or self-motivated) individual re-orientation arising from training or self-developmental programs as this can trigger maladjustment with the society at large when there is an incompatibility between the individual after his re-orientation and the society.

i) We also propose a categorization of individual level cognitive dissonance into structured cognitive dissonance and unstructured cognitive dissonance. In case of the former, the individual carries out some kind of a structured mental analysis of his cognitive dissonance be it in formal, informal, oral or written form. In case of the latter, a structured mental analysis may not be carried out, yet it may be adequate to induce displeasure or goad him into some kind of action.

In addition, cognitive dissonance can also be experienced at the level of a group or a culture, when a culture is exposed to contradictory sets of ideas and beliefs, or even at a global level. These can breed interesting reactions. The Christian fundamentalist movements of the 1980's for example, may have been a result of the woman's, gay and lesbian movement's of the previous decade, while Islamic terrorism may have been a result of the failure of Islamic societies to completely modernize, or bring about suitable changes to the education system. Thus, two or more distinct cultures can co-exist either within a cultural space, geographical space, or at a global level, either harmoniously or uneasily; at times they can also be perpetually in open conflict.

Conscious, sub-conscious or unconscious?

It must also be deliberated whether the process of identity formation is fully conscious, sub-conscious or unconscious. It is somewhat difficult to draw a clear distinction between the three, but may be related to the degree of awareness of one's own actions; in the field of psychoanalysis, the concept of the sub-

conscious is often dropped to leave only the concept of the conscious and the unconscious to reckon with. We can however state with a degree of confidence, subject to a satisfactory realization of the distinction between the three terms, that the process of identity-formation would straddle all three: the last layer may equate to instinct, and may include sub-conscious or semi-conscious processes driven solely by instinct. An interesting example may emanate from multi-lingual and multi-cultural India. The elites in non-Hindi speaking states have a relatively greater affinity towards English while the lower classes in Hindi speaking states are often hostile towards it. Is this driven by awareness or instinct? Probably, suitably designed Ethnographic techniques might throw up vital insights in future.⁴⁷

Cultural Mindspace

The idea of Cultural Mindspace is drawn from the idea of cultural mindset which states that each culture has its own set of innate proclivities. In other words, there is own room for a limited set of cultural proclivities in a culture which would constitute its ethos. Two conflicting value sets would come into natural conflict with each other.

An analogy can be drawn from the works of Norwegian Social Anthropologist Fredrick Barth who applied the concept of “niche” in understanding the relationship between different social groups in a geographical area. His study included three ethnic groups, namely the Pathan, Kohistani and Gujar groups of the Indus and Swat river valleys of Pakistan. He proposed that stronger groups usually replace weaker groups, but different groups can co-exist if they establish niches. Barth’s idea is that of an ecological niche, while ours it that of a “Cultural niche”, which need not be always viewed in relation to an adaption to the environment, but as an end by itself.

In other words, sub-cultures that are non-compatible with the Cultural mindset may co-exist with the dominant culture, often uneasily, but in niches. This may also be because these sub-cultures are associated with other ideologies which define and shape them. Once these cultures move out into the mainstream, there is a great deal of scope for cultural friction. E.g. Islam in India, or the Yazidis in Iraq. This may in some cases even lead to the social fabric of the society being ripped apart, or torn asunder, with civil war being a possible outcome. Hindu nationalists in India for example, have harboured a pathological fear and dislike of proselytizing religions because of the morbid fear that they would encroach onto their territory and undermine their hegemony. This fear has manifested itself in many different ways such as anti-conversion legislation prohibiting conversions through monetary inducements or any carrot and stick approaches or the voluntary ‘ghar wapsi’ or the ‘come back home’ program.

Cultural mindspace may also be broken up into different components such as religious mindspace and linguistic mindspace, and is often a reality particularly where religious groups of linguistic identities are seen to be rival, or in conflict with one another. A variant of cultural mindspace is geographical mindspace which is applied in a strictly geographical context.

⁴⁷ Personal Identity, P.K Mohapatra Decent Books New Delhi, 1983

Bounded analysis and non-bounded analysis

We must also differentiate at the very outset between a bounded analysis and a non-bounded analysis of identity. A bounded analysis refers to an analysis carried out within the context of a cultural unit or a geography (or even, in some cases, a time boundary), whereas a non-bounded or an unbounded analysis is a free-form analysis that is generally performed at a global level or any other relevant level, but without any constraints. Examples of the former could include an analysis of Hindu-Muslim relations in India, while an example of the latter could include any analysis carried out without any constraints.

Identities in opposition

Thus, from our perspective, Identities are always in latent opposition within a cultural unit, or even at a global level, but the degree may vary depending on the Ideological distance between two identities is usually composite and may be assessed either on a judgmental basis, based on a set of parameters or computed mathematically. For example, Jainism is too close to Hinduism in the view of most Anthropologists to breed any serious conflicts. On the other hand, Islam and Hinduism may be potentially at conflict with one another. This issue is complex indeed; progressive Muslim women may be far removed from conservative clerics; Bohra Muslims closer to Hindus than Sunnis; and Sinhala Buddhists farther ideologically from Hindus than Indian Buddhists. Thus, this issue is complex and multi-faceted indeed.

Thus, an Identity may not be in manifest opposition until the occurrence of a specific event, though the ideological distance will play a major role in the occurrence of such events, and such occurrences can also be used to compute ideological distances in reverse. In addition, Identities can also be in perceived or popular opposition based on people's perception, and as a rule of thumb, two strong, rival identities may not get along with one another. Differences in identity can also be exacerbated by inequality and other social and economic forces, and this has been pointed out by Joan Scott and others (Scott, 1992)

Most Anthropologists would agree that two ideologies are always in latent opposition, though the degree may vary; this is also driven in large part by the desire to protect and conserve one's own point of view, and may often lead to putting-down of other cultures or a feigned or an artificial manifestation of one's identity to identity with a group: this can even be accomplished by putting up artificial pretences. As Oscar Wilde once stated, "Most people are other people. Their thoughts are someone else's opinions, their lives a mimicry, their passions, a quotation."⁴⁸

Rubert de Ventos (Ventos, 1994) likewise proposes a complex theory of identity, that may be extended to cover all types of identity, and may also be co-related to our perspective. He states that national identity is derived from four series of factors i.e. primary factors (ethnicity, territory, language, religion), generative factors (communication and technology), induced factors (language and education), and reactive factors (reaction against imposition of identities).

Estranged identities, transformation of identities and emergence of new identities

⁴⁸ Identity and violence: The illusion of destiny, Amartya Sen, Penguin books, 2006

Estranged identities refer to formerly unestranged identities that have gotten estranged from one another over a period. These may have however been in latent opposition to one another over a period. The process of estrangement and divergence may throw up salutary lessons for use in diverse disciplines, and is very interesting by itself. A classic case in point is the emergence of Islam in India. Many locals converted to Islam during the period of the Delhi Sultanate and the Mughal Empire, either voluntarily due to the constraints of the Hindu caste system, or under duress. In many cases, the allure of the Mughal Raj was responsible, and conversion under duress followed by a change in heart is also recorded. This process was apparently enough in many cases to break away completely from the parent identity, or even become antagonistic towards it. Allama Mohammed Iqbal is widely considered to be the spiritual father of Pakistan, an inspired the Pakistan movement to a great degree. Even though his family was originally of Kashmiri Brahmin Sapru lineage, he appears to have jettisoned his Hindu Brahminical identity for his Islamic identity, having even turned against it. This can happen at an individual or a group level: Bhimrao Ambedkar and Kancha Ilaiah ere converts out of Hinduism, while Wafa Sultan and Ayaan Hirsi Ali abandoned Islam, citing personal experiences. A growing trend by intellectuals to abandon Islam altogether, or reform it from within is also noteworthy, much on the lines of the protestant movement half a millennium ago. This would depend largely on the nature and the strength of identities –some inconvenience may be thrown up due to the aggressiveness and intransigence of the parties in question.

The Khalistan movement was born only due to the Indian government's woolly-headed, over-centralized policies; the Sikhs had unanimously rejected Mohammed Ali Jinnah's overtures even before the drawing of the Radcliffe line in favour of India, and their sudden change of heart by the 1970's and 1980's was an indicator that something was wrong. The strength of an identity is different from the idea of Great tradition and little tradition introduced by Robert Redfield, and ratified by MacKim Marriot and others. An example of the former per this categorization was the greater Hindu tradition, while an example of the latter was Indian village tradition. In our view however, the strength of an identity is composite, and can be assessed based on a variety of factors. This is extremely important from our perspective, and in the study of formation of new identities. For example, the tribal religions of the North-East of India have all but vanished, as they reflect a weak identity. Hinduism is several notches above this, as Tripura is a Hindu stronghold, but Islam is even stronger than Hinduism due to several factors as converts from Islam to Hinduism are a few in number.

Telugu speakers and migrants to Tamilnadu, many of whom speak a basilect of Telugu, and are at the bottom of the socio-economic pyramid, choose to abandon their native language within as quickly as a generation, and adopt Tamil. They are sometimes in a state of confusion, unable to decide which identity to latch on to. However, once the process of latching on to their chosen identity, old or new, is accomplished (often driven by a sub-conscious weighing of benefits, a pain-gain analysis, and an analysis of social circles), there is often no going back, as it would be quite impossible for individuals to maintain two potentially-conflicting identities either internally or externally, as it would not only cause internal trauma, but also a confused social identity. This is known as deculturation, or loss of one's original identity. As usual, the Yoyo principle may apply, and converts are often hostile to their estranged identity. This was probably what happened during the conversion of Hindus to Muslims during the

Mughal rule, but needs to be properly studied with textual and contextual evidence. There could be exceptions to this rule, particularly where identities are minimally in conflict. Therefore, Hindi speakers in Suriname may maintain two different languages in different contexts, though this is rarely observed with religion. In some cases, individuals also fit themselves into pre-existing cultural slots which may be one or multiple in number, as this provides an easy outlet for emotions and an ease of operation. These may also be likened to primary and secondary groups.

Therefore, mapping identity strength and understanding the determinants of mindspace and cultural space, are some, but not the only factors that could be useful in identity modelling, and predicting cultural changes leading to identity shifts. Strong identities often come with distinct ideologies which act as differentiators; these in turn create differentiations which may call for more differentiators. This process may snowball until such a time till equilibrium is reached. This is a grand reconciliation between two opposite forces; the desire to maintain and project a distinct identity and stand for one's own rights on one hand, and the desire for meaningful and mutually beneficial relations and peaceful co-existence on the other within a cultural space. Strong identities also come with their own infrastructure and vested interests that weak ideologies may not possess. The fact however remains that identities have estranged from one another quite successfully; and events in history such as the Moplah rebellion of 1920, and the Noakhali riots of 1946, which were essentially anti-Hindu, would attest to this. A new identity may have gradually emerged due to various factors discussed in this paper, but may have been reinforced over time by various factors such as the desire to maintain and project individual and group identity or a feeling of righteous conduct. These differences were exacerbated by external agents such as the British, but these differences did originally exist. Why did Tipu Sultan, who had obvious Hindu ancestry, discriminate against the Hindus, and persecute them mindlessly in some cases? Why did Akbaruddin Owaisi, also of Hindu ancestry, make hate speeches against the Hindus in 2013, even threatening to exterminate them? Thus, identity is obviously used as an anchor and a frame of reference, and ethnic rivalry also plays a key role in strengthening identity. This may also impact the formation of a greater identity in some cases, making it in some cases impossible. For example, the idea of a pan South Asian identity may be a myth if Pakistan always sees itself in opposition to India.

Identity is also strongly influenced by perceptions of history, and historical or pseudo-historical constructs. Hindutva nationalists hate the idea that the "Aryans" arrived from India either as invaders or peaceful migrants, while the Dalits readily warm up to this concept. Hindus and Muslims have their own sets of heroes and villains, and often see each other in unfavourable light. For the archetypal Hindu, the Mughal rule was a dark age associated with the loss of Hindu culture, while for the Muslim, it was undoubtedly a golden age where the arts, literature and architecture flourished. This differentiation spills over to art, literature, music, and subaltern history, all of which are seen as differentiators and identity reinforcers. The Muslims of Telangana state speak Urdu at home, and almost never Telugu. Given that Urdu was alien to the region, the shift came about due to the association of the language with their religious identity.

Thus, ethnogenesis leads to ethnoperpetuation and ethnomaintenance. This can be maintained in steady state, or brought down through a series of pro-active measures. Other types of identity changes include 'flippant identity changes' which are not born out of one's heart, but stem from the

arrangements of convenience such as marriage, or reward and retribution. These must naturally be left out from the purview of serious Anthropological enquiry, and included only if this subsequently leads to a genuine change in identity.

Identities in conflict

Thus, identities may be in conflict both within an individual and at the level of a culture or a society.

For example, conflicts within an individual may be likened to the quest for one's own true identity, and may be a constant battle in some cases, particularly where the individual is exposed to different kinds of forces throughout his life. He may choose to live with cognitive dissonance, or choose which identity gets the upper hand. Such battles can arise out of a quest for one's linguistic, religious, racial, national or economic identity, or more than one of these. These may also take place as an individual grows up in his own rapidly changing environment, or in a culturally alien environment. This may also lead to unresolved identity in some cases, hybrid identities where the identity is an amalgam of two or more identities, or dual identities. For example, an individual may be fluent in two languages, and associate himself strongly with both. Identities may also be in conflict within the context of a culture, as evidenced by the rise of multiculturalism, particularly in the West, where cities are a melange and potpourris of distinct cultures with their own value systems and norms.

Fuzzy logic or an incomplete understanding of issues may also lead to polarization as these are sometimes used by the proponents of a particular ideology to whip up sentiment. This may also be likened to our yoyo analogy; Marxist historiography promoted Hindutva reactions in India; Western materialism and an anti-west sentiment promoted Islamic radicalism. Fears of Islamism, real or imagined and the fear of high Islamic birth rates often add fodder to the Hindutva brigade. Likewise, the flaws of capitalism gave birth to communism, and the flaws of communism re-ignited interest in capitalism. Likewise, the rise of Islamism promoted half-based and deeply flawed solutions in the west to curb it. This impact the strength and movement of identities in different ways by either bringing them together or polarizing them. Similarly, the founding of the RSS in 1925, led to the birth of rival Islamic movements in India immediately thereafter, while the growing tide of Hindu nationalism in the 1990's served to alienate and radicalize Muslim youth (as seen by ISIS recruits from India), rather than bring them into the mainstream of Indian society. The next step is radicalization, which is often a one-way road without a return ticket, and fraught with many dangers. It is a journey from a neutral stance to worldviews shaped by religious texts or mores of a specific community. Perceptions of other ethnic groups may also differ from reality with Hindus and Muslims viewing each other unfavourably, for example. To add to the complexity, a group may view another group favourably, but not the other way around.

More complex questions arise here. To what extent is the Indian Muslim's religious identity at conflict with his national identity and to what extent is the Pakistani Hindu's religious identity in conflict with his national identity? How much variation can be expected at an individual level, just as Aurangzeb's psyche varied from Akbar's? Interesting questions indeed, but this can be assessed only through identity mapping, construction of taxonomies and sound ethnographic research.

Enculturation in opposition and Acculturation in opposition

Per our view, the process of enculturation (or even acculturation for that matter) seldom happens solely on the basis of a culture's own strengths, or ethnic pride, but to a certain degree, in opposition to some other culture. This may happen not only due to lack of awareness of one's own cultures, but because several aspects of one's own culture may be flawed. Enculturation in opposition may be seen as a tempting way to instil pride in one's own identity, and often the easiest or only way out. This is also sometimes witnessed during the transformation of one's identity, i.e., an exaggerated yoyo pattern. This opposition may be at the level of a culture or cultural unit, or across cultural units. For example, Americans may look down upon Indians, or Asians in General, while Hindus may frown upon Muslims, and vice versa. This may be executed through various measures, cherry-picking or tomtomming one's own positive traits or achievements, downplaying undesirable traits of one's own culture, or selective amnesia (glossing over one's own faults), exaggerated criticism of other cultures or nitpicking, exaggerating cultural differences or downplaying cultural similarities. This is also inevitable fallout of errors of omission or commission by one of the parties in the equation, which induces a reaction in other. Thus, two cultures are seldom in perfect harmony or equilibrium. This is also a common way in which new identities are formed, and is even attempted to thwart the process of acculturation by vested interests or conservatives. The latter may be seldom successful in the long-run, as factors in favour of a cultural integration or successful acculturation may overwhelm all other factors working against them. This idea stems from the fact that each group wants to show that it is different from other groups, and this is often born through a feeling of innate (often delusional) superiority. This can be seen even in less important aspects such as family and kinship, and aspects as trivial as measurement systems which are barely seen as central to a culture; the American public have consistently opposed all meaningful moves at metrication.

Samuel P. Huntington has famously written about the clash of civilizations and the remaking of the world order with the relative decline of the West, and the re-emergence of oppressed cultures, such as the emergence of a pan-Asian culture, and an Islamic resurgence. He also wrote about a possible clash between the world's seven or eight major civilizations, namely, Western, Latin American, Islamic, Sinic or Chinese, Hindu, Orthodox, Japanese and African. This would be a reality, as identities can only change very slowly with obvious limits to ethno-convergence.⁴⁹

Nested identities and Linked identities

Nested identities refer to identities within identities, an example of this being the identity of Muslim women with Indian Islamic society, or the role of Shia Muslims in Indian culture. This is akin to a hierarchy, but the interesting factor to note here is that sub-identities or nested identities may lurch closer to their grandparent identity or great-grandparent identity, and the ideological distances may often be narrower. This has been observed in diverse contexts – Muslim women for example, have inched closer to Hindu nationalists in India to fight for the cause of liberation and emancipation, and this is true to lesser extent of Shia Muslims. Muslims in India, have likewise shown sympathy to Dalits, and vice versa. Such equations may also be tripartite, multi-dimensional and context specific, and this is akin

⁴⁹ Of Saffron flags and skullcaps: Hindutva, Muslim identity, and the idea of India, Ziya Us Salam, Sage Publications India Pvt Ltd, 2018

to the notion that an enemy's enemy becomes one friend. Thus, it would also be illustrative and illuminating to calculate ideological distances between composite identities across hierarchies through suitably devised Ethnographic techniques. We propose that a nested identity be classified into reinforcing, diluting, non-modifying, variable, and unresolved with respect to its parent. This would depend on how a nested identity modifies the strength of its parent.⁵⁰

The level of interaction between two different identities can be mapped at various levels as applicable, and these can be high, medium, low, or non-existent. Another approach could be to categorize them as continuous, intermittent, and no contact. The nature of interaction between two different identities can also be categorized into favourable, or unfavourable, and improving, deteriorating or steady. In some cases, a group may generally view another in favourable light, but not the other way around, or the level of admiration or disparagement varies. For example, Shia Muslims may view Sunni Muslims more favourably than the Sunnis do to Shias.

The concept of nested identity must be differentiated at the outset from the concept of a linked identity, where one identity is linked to another form of an identity. For example, Indian nationalism of the 1990's arose from firebrand Hindu nationalism, which eventually morphed into Indian nationalism, making religious minorities jittery and leading to events such as the Gujarat pogrom in 2001, and mob lynching which occurs from time to time. The Hindi nationalism of the 1950's in India and Kashmiri separatism may be other cases in point, where the desire to emphasize one type of identity, snowballed into greater movements. Hindus consider India to be their *punyabhoomi* and their *pavitrabhoomi* (their holy land) and tend to be more nationalistic than Muslims who only recognize *Dar-ul-Islam* and *Dar-ul-Harb* (Islamic and non-Islamic countries). Another example is that of blacks and whites in the USA where cultural identity is built on biological identity. Are Keralites more nationalistic than Tamils? Are Tamil Brahmins more nationalistic than Dravidian Tamils? Are Hindu Brahmins more nationalistic than Dalits? These questions can only be understood by studying the nature of linkages in specific contexts.

Variable interpretations of identity

Identities may also be interpreted differently by different parties, though this cannot change reality, and may be at variance from an individual's self-interpretation. For example, Dravidian nationalists may see all South Indians primarily as Dravidians who have been estranged from their Dravidian core, but Kannadigas and Telugus may not necessarily see themselves this way. Hard-core Dravidian nationalists may see Sanskrit as a corrupting and a polluting influence, but Tamil Brahmins may not. This dichotomy must be carried out only by capturing both emic and etic perspectives in all applicable cases.

In addition, identities may also perpetuate due to historical accidents. For example, the decline of the Congress party in India due to its own problems, led to the rise of Hindu nationalism, which strengthened the Hindu identity, provoking a reaction among Muslims and Christians. This is wholly outside the domain of Anthropological theory.

Components of identity

⁵⁰ Modernity: Globalization and Identity: Towards a reflective quest, Avijit Pathak, Aakar Books, 2006

The following are the chief components of identity, all of which overlap. Thus, an individual's identity is composite, often comprising of common and distinct elements, and a paradoxical combination of sameness and difference. This has been pointed out by Michael Jackson and others (Jackson (2002), and may also be referred to as contrasting and non-contrasting identities. Thus, a Bengali Hindu is a Bengali, a Hindu and an Indian at the same time. In addition, he may also distinguish himself on the basis of class, caste, or skin complexion, leading to an array of permutations and combinations. As Cohen has pointed out, (Cohen 2000), one can be a Sikh in a Gurudwara, South-Asian in the street, Asian-British in a political context, and British while travelling out of Britain.

The likeness or difference between two identities can be ascertained through quantitative and qualitative techniques, and must be aggregated based on cultural taxonomy. These can also be represented by means of Venn diagrams.

1. Biological identity

The concept of race is now considered to be widely obsolete, and has now been replaced by dynamic definitions of ethno-biological identity. Early definitions of race by Hooton (1926) or Montagu (1942) are therefore either obsolete, or not comprehensive enough.

However, genetic definitions began to take birth since the 1940's. In 1944, Dobzhansky stated "Races are defined as populations differing in the incidence of certain genes, capable of exchanging genes across boundaries that separate them." According to Boyd (1950), "Human races are populations that differ significantly from other populations with regard to the frequency of one or more genes they possess." Others such as Garn (1960), Buettner-Janusch (1969), and Hulse (1963) have defined races as breeding or Mendelian populations.

Thus, the emphasis has moved away from the Cranial Morphology, Anthropometry, and anatomical approaches of the Nineteenth century to more complex, multi-dimensional and dynamic approaches to human classification. This has been made possible due to the flowering of genetics and various blood group classifications such as the ABO system (Landsteiner 1900), the RH system, the MN system etc. Other definite and indefinite morphological traits have also been used to classify humans, and this has included criteria such as skin colour, hair colour, hair texture, hair form, eye colour, nasal index, cephalic index, facial form, facial prognathism, and many more. Other non-adaptive morphological traits such as PTC tasting ability, ABH secretory system are also used. Biologists and Anthropologists such as Ashley Montague and Julian Huxley eventually rebelled against the idea of races, and Deniker (1900), and Huxley and Huddon (1936) adopted the idea of an ethnic group.

Of late, the idea of a dynamic genetical theory of biological identity using concepts such as social selection, sexual selection, hybridization, mutation, isolation, and random genetic drift have become popular. Others such as Livingstone (Livingstone (1962)) have pointed out that the idea of race is not compatible with the dynamic concept of natural selection, and have proposed the concept of clines instead.

Thus, the idea of race is badly outdated, and irrelevant to countries such as India. It may only carry some value in countries such as the USA where blacks were culturally and genetically differentiated from whites till the 1960's, and must only be considered in situations where it is absolutely required.

Many societies are beginning to discard identity on the basis of race, and in the USA, the idea of race has greatly whittled down since the birth of the civil rights movement. As Michael Skey points out, the ethnic English majority now uses a rationalistic discourse of Englishness, preferring to shed racial constructs or the notion of racial superiority completely. This trend is only likely to accelerate with the growing trend of multi-culturalism in most societies.

2. Religious identity

Religion has been a topic of great interest to Anthropologists. The Anthropology of religion is a diverse field of study which includes a comparative study of religions, and the role of religion in society and its relation to a given culture. Cultural Anthropologists study rituals, myths, sacred texts, sacred places, institutions, belief in shamanism, ghosts, animism, animatism and the history of religions as well. Religions are categorized based on various parameters and may be Monotheistic, Polytheistic, Shamanistic etc. EB Tylor and Max Muller are among the founders of the anthropological study of religion. Most Anthropologists try to understand the content of religion and the meaning it has for man and society while also interfacing it with a society's culture. In early anthropology, studies tended to focus on religion in traditional societies. To some extent, this view still prevails. There is also an interest in comparing and contrasting primitive and modern religions. However, many modern Anthropologists specialize in contemporary religion as well and studies of relationships between practitioners of different religions and identity studies have also become commonplace.

The following are the most common Anthropological definitions of religion:

1. "Religion may be defined as the belief in Spiritual Beings" (Edward B Tylor, Primitive Culture)
2. "Religion is a propitiation or conciliation of powers superior to man which are believed to direct and control the course of nature and of human life" (James George Frazer, The Golden Bough).
3. "Religion is a system of symbols which acts to establish powerful, persuasive, and long-lasting moods and motivations by formulating conceptions of a general order of existence and clothing these conceptions with such an aura of factuality that the moods and motivations seem uniquely realistic." (Clifford Geertz, "Religion as a Cultural System")
4. "A religion is a unified system of beliefs and practices relative to sacred things, or beliefs and practices which unite into one single moral community called a Church, all those who adhere to them. It is the self-validation of a society by means of myth and ritual." (Émile Durkheim, 'The Elementary Forms of the Religious Life')

Thus religions vary widely from one another, and in the way they mould the human experience and identity. Some religions like Islam may contribute to a strong identity, while some others less so. Thus,

the effect of religion on society in general and on identity has to be assessed from context to context. It must also be borne in mind that the idea of a Godless society did not come to pass, and Atheists only constitute around fifteen percent of the world's population.

A religion is also considered to be a form of an ideology. The word "Ideology" is derived from the French word "idéologie" which was coined at the time of the French Revolution, and introduced by a philosopher, A.-L.-C. Destutt de Tracy, as a short name for what he called the "science of ideas". An ideology refers to a collection of beliefs that are usually not fully tested or lack universal applicability or acceptance and lack value-neutrality. Ideologies possess both internal and external paradoxes that tend to pre-empt their demise and bring them in conflict with other groups.

On the other hand, a cult may be defined as a system of religious veneration directed towards a figure or object and is a small religious group typically (usually fraudulent, and with a dubious moral stances). It may also be characterized by a great but irrational devotion to a person or cause, and stigmatized or looked down upon by society.

The strength of an ideology may be assessed based on various factors such as its ability to perpetuate from generation to generation, its ability to impose itself on others, ability to resist change, ability to resist influences from outside, ability to influence practitioners and mold their worldviews, ability to resist replacement ideologies, their degree of impact on an individual, ability to cater to psychological and social needs, and superimposition on cultural and biological identity.

Thus, religions are like sports. They contain different elements of good and evil, and possess similar characteristics, yet none of them are exactly the same in all respects. Religions impact the process of identity formation through sacralisation, molding thoughts and beliefs, fulfilment of emotional and social needs, and the enculturation arising due to association with people holding similar beliefs.

Religions shape thoughtworlds and worldviews in different ways. For example, pork is taboo in Islam and beef is taboo in Hinduism. Idolatry is forbidden in Islam, and relationships with specific groups of people are also dictated by religion. Thus, Shias and Sunnis are mutually antagonistic to one another, and Islam shapes the attitudes of Muslims towards Jews, Christians, Hindus and atheists differently. Islam also distinguishes between Dar-ul-Islam and Dar-ul-harb, and treats apostates unfavourably. This not only impacts the process of identity formation among Muslims and others in relation to Muslims, but also determines ideological distances as well. Thus, religious texts must be the target of intensive and critical hermeneutical study to assess their impact on practitioners, after studying the centrality of these texts to a religion, and the religiousness of practitioners in general. Thus, the Qu'ran may be more central to a Muslim's thoughtworlds and worldviews than the Bible is to the Christian's. Religious ideologies may also vary based on strength. For example, Islam is seen as a powerful entity, while most tribal religions of Andaman and Nicobar Islands as much less powerful, and may not withstand the passage of time, with most of their practitioners having already converted to Christianity. A one size fits all approach can therefore never be applied. This would be one of the inputs for any attempt towards a cultural remediation. Methods may also be devised to ascertain the strength of ideologies or the distances between them, and methods used by linguists can provide some inspiration here.

Religion can also decline only very slowly, as it is linked to culture and social norms in many cases, and is seen to provide mental succour to its followers. As Durkheim states, one of the functions of religion is to unite their followers in a social solidarity. (Durkheim 1915) Therefore, many prophecies predicting the end of religion have not come to pass, and religion remains entrenched in most societies as strongly as ever before with religion-based conflicts on the rise in many parts of the world. Enculturation also begins early, and abandoning a religion is associated with social stigma, and conflicts with societal and family norms and values. In spite of all this, the centrality of religion has declined in many societies, and movements for religious reform have indeed proven successful, and these will provide a role model for other societies to follow suit. Major changes to religion or religious shifts cannot happen easily or quickly, may be largely a result of historical accidents, and cannot be accurately predicted or statistically modelled. Cultural remediation cannot also guarantee changes to religion or religious shifts, as the latter may be well-entrenched. However, strength and nature of religious identities and human behaviour can be modelled with a fair degree of reliability, and can be used to assess identity changes and downstream changes. It may be prudent to initiate changes and reform and wait for results to manifest themselves slowly, given that religions, cults and ideologies are currently major cultural differentiators and obstacles to socio-cultural convergence. Solutions may also lie in identifying what functions of religion can be replaced and what cannot, creation of alternative framework in the long-run, and emphasizing other aspects of identity to dilute religious identity.

3. Linguistic identity

A language is a mode of communication that is common to all human societies around the globe, advanced or undeveloped. A language is usually specific to a community and is a mode of communication with a diction and formal set of rules which are formalized over a period in time. Noam Chomsky provides the following definition of language, "A language is either a finite or infinite set of sentences, each finite in length and constructed out of a finite set of elements." According to Edward Sapir, language, may be defined as "A purely human and non-instinctive method of communicating ideas, emotions and desires by means of voluntarily produced symbols." (Sapir 1921:8) According to Hall, "Language is an institution whereby humans communicate and interact with each other by means of habitually and oral-auditory arbitrary symbols." (Hall 1968:158) Bloch and Trager state, "A language is a system of arbitrary vocal symbols by means of which a social group co-operates." (1942:5) According to the Danish linguist Otto Jespersen (Jespersen, 1946) and Fasold (Fasold, 1984) language is mainly a social tool, and even defines the social identity of the speaker. This view is reaffirmed by Trudgill (Trudgill, 1974) and Thornborrow (Thornborrow, 2004) as well. The study of culture through language and the relationship between language and culture is studied under Anthropological Linguistics or Linguistic Anthropology, and this field of study was set in motion by Franz Boas and other Anthropologists such as R.G.Latham.

Most researchers now believe that spoken languages may be 40,000 years old, though it is only the written word that marks the birth of history five thousand years ago. Language is indispensable and is often the only means of communication and expression. The fear of the possible loss of this mode of communication can raise emotions to a fever-pitch. Although language is vital in a manner that religion and other aspects of culture are not, linguistic identity may be subservient to religious and other

identities in many cultures. In some cases, linguistic identity has proven to be surprisingly strong, a case in point being the Bangladesh Liberation Movement of 1971, where Bengali linguistic pride overrode a pan-Islamic identity, and feelings of suppression of the Bengalis by the West Pakistani elite and military government led to the bloody birth of Bangladesh.⁵¹ There may be between five to seven thousand languages in the world today, many of which are unlikely to be full-blown or independent languages in their own right, or accompanied by scripts and literary traditions. The count of languages varies widely from source to source, and depends on the methodology used for considering languages as full-fledged ones. According to a survey carried out by the Academie francaise, there were only 2,796 full-blown languages in the world towards the end of the Twentieth century, with many having disappeared. On the other hand, 'The Ethnologue', lists the total number of languages in the world as 6,809.

The strength of linguistic identity may vary from context to context. In most cases it may be subservient to religious identity, especially where religion is the primary marker of personal identity or cultural pride. This is true of most Muslim communities around the world, and many linguistic groups in India, who primarily associate themselves with the Hindu or the greater Indian identity. In the case of the Tamil community, identity based on language is particularly seen to be strong, and language is more than just a means of communication. It is a great source of pride to people in the state, and is even worshipped a God (Tamil Thai, or Mother Tamil) to some extent even among Christians and Muslims, who are just as proud of the Tamil identity as the Hindu brethren.

This issue is undoubtedly magnified by political and ideological factors many of which go hand in hand to determine the strength of the linguistic identity as a whole. The opposition of Dravidian parties to the imposition of Hindi was not just logical or analysis-driven; it was also largely ideology-driven. The Dravidian parties projected themselves as Anti-North Indian, Anti-Aryan, Anti-Brahminical and Anti-Hindu too. Another movement of the era was the Thani Thamizh Iyakkam movement or the Pure Tamil movement which sought to eliminate Sanskrit loan words from the Tamil language which were considered impure. Thus linguistic identity almost always overrides religious, caste or national identity in Tamilnadu, and this may be the case with many other societies as well.

We would also like to introduce the term 'linguiculture' here; this kind of a culture may also be referred to as a language-centric culture, and no other culture epitomizes it better than that of France. Linguistic pride is often a key driver of French identity, and is an inalienable part of high culture. It is something that France deems it worthwhile to spend millions on at the expense of other economic needs; this kind of linguistic pride is seen to be declining only very slowly. Language fluency, proficiency, correct idiomatic usage are highly cherished social assets; while in another culture like that of Andhra Pradesh, this may not be the case; although there is some Telugu pride, language is largely seen as a tool of communication to serve greater social and economic ends. The historical causes of this can be assessed as a part of globalized approaches to a study of science, and likewise, its downstream implications, both direct, and indirect, can also be assessed. Is linguistic or cultural pride, even a cause of France's relative

⁵¹ Linguistic foundations of identity: Readings in language, literature and contemporary cultures Edited by Om Prakash and Rajesh Kumar, Aakar, 2018

high birth rates vis-a-vis that of the rest of Europe? Only proper ethnographic studies will throw up vital clues here, while all other methods will fail.⁵²

Languages also reflect social status. The difference between the high and low variety of language is called *diaglossia*, and this term was coined by the linguist Charles Ferguson. (Hymes 1964). High, mid-level and low dialects are also referred to as *acrolects*, *mesolects* and *basilects*. High-end language may have an elaborate honorific system, and may also reflect politeness and respect though nuances. In addition, there are variations by individual known as *idiolects*. These concepts are a part of the emerging discipline of *socio-linguistics*, a field which investigates the co-relation between society, social status and language, its expression in art and literature, and how social factors cause linguistic change. (Tannen 1990)

Measures of linguistic distance are crucial to our analysis because difficulty of learning language is largely relative and not absolute, and this can provide some measure of cultural differences as well. A common measure is *Levenshtein distance* which measures the distance between two languages. Various measures have also been proposed to assess the speed and efficacy of second language acquisition, such as the *Input hypothesis* and *monitor model* of Stephen Krashen, Michael Long's *interaction hypothesis*, Merrill Swain's *output hypothesis*, Richard Smith's *noticing hypothesis*, Elizabeth Bate's *competition model*, and these can be used for the development of suitable metrics and indices.

is known as *sociolinguistics*, and this has become an important field of study in linguistics. (Tannen 1990)

4. National or territorial identity

National identity is a person's identity of sense of belonging to one's state or one's nation, and is driven by the subjective feeling one shares with a group of people about a nation, regardless of the legal citizenship. This also stems from *ethnic pride*, which is seen as a positive feeling about one's own culture. *Patriotism*, or *national pride*, on the other hand, is the feeling of love, devotion, and sense of attachment to one's country. Patriotism is seen as a great virtue in some circles. On the other hand, Karl Marx once famously stated that the working class could have no country. With the rising tide of globalization, patriotism is beginning to be seen in rather less favourable light. Others have dismissed nationalism and patriotism completely. In the words of Voltaire, "It is lamentable that to be a good patriot, one must become the enemy of the rest of mankind." "Patriotism is the last refuge of scoundrels", said Samuel Johnson. Nonetheless, national identity remains a reality even today, and in most cases it is a function or an expression of the strength of different elements of culture. The concept of *territorial identity* is similar to the concept of national identity, and the idea of a territory may vary in size from a village to a continent. *Territorial feeling* may often cut across religious and ethnic lines to forge a feeling of solidarity amongst the people of a geographical territory, but may be compromised by *ghettoization* or *balkanization*. The idea of territorial identity may be consciously constructed either based on its own strengths or in opposition to some other identity; states have successfully done this, examples being the *Sovetskii Narod* of the erstwhile USSR, or the *Dravidian identity* of Tamilnadu which

⁵² A general introduction to linguistics, Tariq Rahman, Orient Blackswan Pvt Ltd, 2010

was sought to be applied to Non-Tamils as well. German nationalist movements were very strong in the 1930's, but have whittled down ever since. Indian nationalism riding piggy-back on Hindu nationalism has been a particularly strong force to reckon with representing a kind of a linked identity.

5. Cultural identity

A pride in various aspects of one's own culture enhances an individual's feel-good factor. This varies in extent from culture to culture, and can manifest itself in different forms, often bordering on irrational exuberance. For example, pride one's food and gastronomic tradition is seen among many Indian cultures and French culture in general. This is often referred to as haute cuisine in France. This is often seen as a metric or yardstick of the strength of a culture, though not always. Cultural identity also fluctuates, and the nature of cultural pride may change over a period. For example, religion, or liturgical tradition occupied a pride of place in most ancient of traditional societies, though this may no longer be the case today. Technological pride, not the advancement of technology itself, is often seen as the crowning glory of achievement in contemporary cultures. For example the moon landing of 1969 was projected in some circles as an American achievement, and not as an achievement of science. Similarly, Indians take great cultural and nationalistic pride in their space programme, and the average Indian trumpets it on social media. Thus, while the specifics of cultural identity, and the direction of change can vary, cultural pride, by itself can never be obliterated, the reason being that, in the eyes of most Anthropologists, forms a part of human nature. It also promotes, in the view of Robert Putnam and others, "social capital" which can serve to make the lives of people in a community better by fostering bonds.

6. Social identity

Social identity stems also from ethnic pride but more specifically from a pride in one's own social identity. A degree of social identity is pre-requisite for progress and is a key to emancipatory movements, though others Anthropologists have looked at ethnic pride derisively, citing that it may interfere with a desire for personal accomplishment. Thus, per APA dictionary of Psychology, the concept of identity is summarized aptly as "An individual's sense of self defined by a set of physical and psychological characteristics that is not wholly shared with any other person, and comprises a range of social and interpersonal affiliations (e.g. Ethnicity) and social roles. "Thus, this definition not only includes a personal component, but also emphasizes a social component. This is also emphasized by Oyserman (Oyserman 2012) who emphasizes social relations, social roles and social group memberships as driving forces of identity, and Erving Goffman who sees identity as an image of approved social attributes. (Goffman 1955)

Many important social movements were spurred by identity, and were in reality identity movements. The Dalit emancipation movement of the 1800's was first spearheaded by Jothiba Phule who famously set up educational institutions for the downtrodden and the underprivileged, and was followed up by Bhimrao Ambedkar, Kancha Ilaiah and others, and is today politically represented by Mayawati and others. It has also spawned a new genre of literature, many of whom have chosen to write in English.

Examples of Dalit literary figures have included Madira Chennaiah of the eleventh century, to modern Dalit writers such as Baburao Bagul, N D Rajkumar, Daya Pawar and others.

However, the idea of social classes is widely considered to be obsolete in some societies, such as the United Kingdom and the USA, as observed by Janet Zandy and others. Indeed, this process is characteristic of most advanced, industrial societies, and is characterized by the rapid emergence of large middle classes with no barrier to socio-economic ascendancy. However, there are exceptions to this rule in advanced societies as well, with small millionaire and marginalized classes, in addition to elites and royal classes in some cases. Differences by age, education level and gender are also likely to persist into the foreseeable future. For example, women may construct their identities differently from men, and this aspect may never change. This realization may have given birth to the earliest organized feminist movements in 1848 in the USA, the likes of which manifested themselves in different parts of the world in the 1960's and the 1970's, including poorer ones. Socio-cultural and socio-economic integration can also be measured and monitored over a period, much like the GINI co-efficient and the Lorenz curve.

7. Economic identity

Any society may be categorized into economically privileged groups and economically less privileged groups the distances between which are calculated by means of suitably devised metrics or techniques such as the Gini Coefficient and the Lorenz curve. From our perspective, Economic identity is relevant only to the extent it alters social or cultural behaviour, and strengthens and weakens individual or group identity in general. Social and Cultural Distances between groups may depend on economic equality or inequality, and this when coupled along with educational and other factors, may determine mind-orientation as well, which will in turn determine social and cultural behaviour, and learning. Economic distances between groups may either strengthen or weaken with the passage of time, and the trickle down of wealth may operate differently in different sets of circumstances. Distances may be bridged through various techniques such as cultural action, which attempt to change relationships between poor people and the power elite. Socially privileged groups seek to maintain their identity through various means such as privileged education, maintenance of the caste system, and the use of the English language in India. In addition, fears of economic persecution and desire to maintain economic hegemony have bred political movements, an example being the Jharkhand Mukti Morcha of India.

8. Acquired identities (E.g. Affiliations Communist Party affiliation)

Humans also participate in primary and secondary groups, membership of which is usually voluntary, and these shape the identity of individuals or society to varying degrees. The idea of primary groups was first defined by C H Cooley in 1909, in his famous book, 'Social organization: Human nature and social order'. Primary groups are characterized by intimate relations, face-to-face interaction, co-operation, and association. Primary groups lead to better bonding among like-minded individuals, help in personality development and fulfil psychological needs. On the other hand, secondary groups are characterized by more formal and impersonal relationships, and the objectives of relationships are utilitarian. (Ogburn and Nimkoff (1966)) Primitive or simple societies typically possess only primary

groups while complex societies possess primary and secondary groups. Examples of primary groups include neighbourhood groups, while examples of secondary groups include groups of co-workers. We must also mention the concept of ingroups and outgroups here; an ingroup is a group with which an individual identifies, while an outgroup is a group with which he does not identify. Another concept relevant for our purpose is that of an Association, which include formal bodies and organizations such as trader's organizations, professional organizations and scientific organizations. According to Maclver and Page, "an association is an organization deliberately formed for the collective pursuit of the same interests or sets of interests, which its members share." (Maclver and Page (1952)). A famous over-size organization was the Communist party of the former USSR, which to a large extent succeeded in manipulating the thoughts of its citizens through groupthink. This may also impact one's intellectual or creative orientation, and the creation of intellectual or creative classes. However, these groups are not central to one's identity, and can fade away with the passage of time. The concept of Creative classes was developed by the American urban studies theorist Richard L. Florida to understand the principles of wealth creation and cultural capital (Social assets that promote social mobility) better.

Affiliations may be "hard" or "soft"; hard affiliations may denote affiliations to a rigid, formal or a bureaucratic group, such as a Communist Party, and its members' ideas may be formed in line with that of a rigid ideology. On the other hand, a soft affiliation may be affiliation with environmental movements in general or pro-natalist schools, or even a belief in the idea that capitalism is better, with or without formal memberships. Thus, organizations may influence identities to varying degrees. These provide an ideology which may affect identity formation directly or indirectly.

9. Other residual components of identity (Composite and as per cultural taxonomy)

Other residual components of identity would be those which are not covered under any of the other categories, but must be included in order to arrive at a comprehensive assessment of identity. Major components under the residual category would be food (exclusive gastronomic tradition was referred to in France as 'Haute cuisine'), clothing (referred to in France as 'Haute couture'). A reconciliation between the Cultural taxonomy and Identity Taxonomy must always be carried out to incorporate missing elements, and the identity taxonomy devised accordingly. However, it must be borne in mind that some elements of the cultural taxonomy may not impact identity, and these can be left out of the equation. We may choose to strike a fine balance here as well as adopt a flexible and a non-dogmatic approach; cars, trucks and transportation may also impact different cultures directly and indirectly to varying extents. In some cultures like the USA, their impact may be central, while in others, they may be peripheral or marginal. However, their impact on identity may be less central.

Packing order of identity and Identity taxonomy

The pecking order of identity also needs to be assessed through crude rules of thumb before an identity taxonomy can be constructed, and will identify components that are central to individual or collective identity and those which are not. For example, in France and Tamilnadu, linguistic identity may over ride everything else. Among Brahmin groups of Tamilnadu, however, linguistic identity may be sub-servient to national identity, and there may be wide variations between individual to individual. The typical or

modal hierarchy must form the basis of any analysis, though individual and unique cases will also be taken into consideration to compute the modal or typical hierarchy. The objective of this will be to model cultural behaviour, and compare and contrast cultures. It will provide crucial inputs for cultural remediation as well.

The correct way to do this is to take the strongest component of identity as the base and work upwards or downwards for a complete hierarchy (for example, it would be imprudent to choose Asia or Judeo-Christian traditions as the base). Thus, in the case of Tamilnadu, language would rank higher in the hierarchy than religion or nationality, though in Haryana or several other Indian states, this may not be the case. This would present practical difficulties in some cases, though a best judgment will still need to be used. As this will also need to be reconciled with cultural taxonomy, identity may be comprised of several parallel streams.

Metrics for identification of Identity strength

Suitable metrics may also be devised for the quantification of Identity strength, which may be at an individual level, or at a group level. These must be computed by assessing the strengths of different components of identity, at aggregating them at the level of an individual or a culture based on the proportional representation of these components in an individual or a group, and taking into consideration the complete hierarchy and cultural taxonomy. For these, suitable quantitative and qualitative techniques may be used such as participant observation, questionnaires and interviews, but the end result is usually computed mathematically. The strengths of groups may vary widely; For example, the Sunni Islamic identity may be stronger than that of the Shia Muslim, and the Brahmin Hindu identity may be stronger than that of a Kshatriya Hindu identity, but not necessarily stronger than that of a Dalit Hindu. Thus, suitable provisions must be made for aggregation and subtraction, and changes arising due to political awareness in some contexts. This will also have a bearing on ideological distances which will depend on ideological strengths and differences as well. Thus, the strength of an identity also fluctuates with the passage of time. Strengths of ideologies will depend on various factors discussed in this paper, and can also vary with remediation, and with the passage of time. Sometimes other approaches such as a historical factors approach and social relations approach can also be used, and this would take into account the occurrences of historical events and the quality of social relations between groups.

Several interesting possibilities may readily present themselves when identities of individuals are contrasted with that of groups; examples being a strong individual with a weak cultural identity, a weak individual with a strong cultural identity, and a strong individual with a strong cultural identity. Identity strength may also vary throughout the individual lifecycle, a typical case being that of the 'angry young man' who is scarcely exposed to the outside world but is imbued with a sense of indignation and rebelliousness. This may mellow down with age, or as identity crises are resolved, through introspection and the attainment of equilibrium and harmony, as self-awareness and awareness of the world increases. Mohammed Ali Jinnah, for example, initially favored the idea of a united India but jettisoned this in favour of the idea of the Islamic republic of Pakistan by around the year 1940. Likewise, Huseyn Shaheed Suhrawady preferred an Independent Muslim-dominated Bengal for some time in his career,

but mostly supported the idea of Pakistan, and never the idea of a united undivided India. Identity crises may also never be completely resolved due to a large number of unresolved issues in biology, linguistics, sociology, history and science; these are likely to be used by people with vested interests for their own benefit. Identities can of course never be completely eliminated due to biology, innate human nature, and the desire to stand up for one's own rights; they can however, be largely neutralized by providing a semblance of psychological stability and a breadth of knowledge through the education system at the right time. Identity-related factors can also be categorized into uncontrollable issues such as biology and genetic-related factors, and controllable factors such as the social ecosystem. It is however the second category that the Social Anthropologist must focus on.

Another approach could be to calculate the distribution of identity strengths and plot them using a frequency polygon, tracing them to various components and factors. This will lead to the computation of mean and modal values as well, in different contexts, and based on differentiators such as age, gender and socio-economic status. Additionally, hypothetical graphs showing differentiated strength of identity before and after remediation can also be computed, and this would be akin to dual synchronic studies.

Applications of identity studies

A generic approach like this serves as a framework to analyze new data from ethnographic studies, and to vet new theories developed in Anthropology and other allied fields such as psychology. It can serve to eventually weed out all kinds of biases and prejudices such as Eurocentrism, Islamophobia or Hinduphobia which currently mar the field. Thus, grandiose proclamations of the impending demise of Islam are misplaced, and can come only from ivory-tower scholarship; most Muslims are devout and zealous about their faith. Identity studies can also be applied in diverse contexts. For example, Identity studies can be used for devising national integration strategies after studying constituent identities, devising strategies to promote harmony between religious and ethnic groups, devising strategies for promoting global harmony, for personality studies, cultural modelling, and studying the dynamics of language spread. It can also have application in the corporate world, and in the design of organization structure, marketing, and human resources for example. This is only the tip of the iceberg, and only a sample of possible applications. Many more areas will readily suggest themselves in due course as the field of study further develops through ethnography and fieldwork in diverse situations. A grand unified theory like this can also serve as a framework to plug in and interpret data against, and a good framework must not change too much with the arrival of new data; it must be capable of being refined without disturbing its core tenets, objectives and functions.

Other approaches that can be used in Identity studies

The following are some other approaches that can be used in identity studies:

Emic and Etic perspectives

The terms emic and etic were originally developed by linguist Kenneth Pike, in the context of linguistic studies, and later extended to other contexts by other Anthropologists. An emic approach investigates how local people think, and perceive and categorize the world, imagine and explain things, and such

approaches are narratives are constructed by those belonging to the culture. (Kottak 2006) (Ager and Loughry 2004) On the other hand, an etic perspective almost always comes from outside the culture, and usually belongs to the Anthropologist or the Sociologist. Etic knowledge refers to generalizations about human behaviour that are considered to be universally true, and links cultures, or aspects of culture into a synchronized whole. Etic approaches were adopted by Carl Jung and others while emic perspectives were famously adopted by Margaret Mead. (Morris et al 1999)

Phenomenology

Phenomenology is an approach that concentrates on the study of consciousness and the objects of direct experience from the first-person's point of view, and was founded in a philosophical context by Edmund Husserl, and extended to sociology and Anthropology by Jacques Derrida, Alfred Shutz, Eric Voegelin and others. It is used to describe how human beings experience and react to certain phenomenon, and studies the perceptions, perspectives, feelings of those who have experienced a phenomenon, and is used as a tool of empirical research. It originated in various sources including Gestalt psychology, a school of thought which attempts to understand the laws behind the ability to acquire and maintain meaningful perceptions of the world and of phenomena, relationships between objects and their surroundings, perception of objects in their totality, and is based on the self-organizing tendencies of the mind called *pragnanz*. Karl Mannheim introduced a new branch of sociology called the sociology of knowledge in his work "ideology and Utopia" (1949) on the basis of earlier work by Edmund Husserl, and this provided the basis for the phenomenological sociology of Alfred Shutz and Karl Mannheim which meant that knowledge was a product of the social and cultural setting of the owner (Sjoberg and Nett 1959). Thus, identity studies can become a strong foundation of epistemology, and lead to the expansion of knowledge, by collecting viewpoints from different sources. It can be a bulwark against western-centric approaches and intellectual elitism, and promote the globalization of science. According to Berger, "Worlds are socially constructed and socially maintained, their continuing reality, both objective (as common, taken-for-granted factivity) and subjective (factivity imposing itself on the social consciousness), depends on specific social processes, namely those processes that ongoingly reconstruct and maintain the particular worlds in question."

Functionalism

The idea of Functionalism emerged from the Latin word 'fungi' which means to perform, and studies the functions served by aspects of culture, in relation to the whole of culture. It was developed by Bronislaw Malinowski, Radcliffe Brown, and others in the 1930's, but has its roots in the philosophies of Plato and Aristotle, and the idea of teleology, or purpose of things. The idea of functionalism is also related to the philosophy of Positivism by August Comte which saw society as an organism. Emile Durkheim also proposed the concept of 'sociological explanations' in this regard, which consists of two parts. (Durkheim 1895) Per Durkheim, the efficient cause which produces an aspect of culture, and the function it fulfils, must be investigated separately. Thus, causal-historical explanations are sought in the process, and present conditions are traced to the past. Many other Anthropologists have contributed to functionalism, and these have included Talcott Parsons, Robert K. Merton and others. Dissatisfaction

with functionalism led to neo-functionalism which was promoted by Niklass Luhmann and Jurgen Habermas in Germany and Jeffrey Alexander and Paul Colomy in the USA.

The premises of functionalism include:

1. As a system, society or culture consists of parts which are interconnected, interrelated and interdependent.
2. Each part performs its own functions, and makes its own contribution to the society, and functions in relationship with other parts.
3. A change in one part brings about a change in other parts.
4. The whole of society or culture is worth more than the summation of its individual parts.

Structuralism

Structuralism is the name given to a method of analyzing social relations and cultural processes, and came into existence in the 1950's. It also shares relationships with structural-functional approaches, and is concerned with the relationship between things. Claude Levi Strauss is often considered to be the founded of Structuralism in Anthropology. His is also the author of notable works such as 'The origin of table manners', 'The elementary structures of kinship' 'The savage mind' etc. In 1958, he published a collection of his essays called 'Anthropology Structurale', the English translation of which appeared in 1963. This covered the methodology of structuralism, and the concept of social structure.

Social relations analysis

Social Relation usually refers to a multitude of social interaction, regulated by social norms, between two or more people, with each having a social position, and performing a designated social role. In a sociological hierarchy, social relations is usually more advanced than behaviour, action, social behaviour, social action, social contact, and social interaction. Social relations form the basis of concepts such as social organization, social structure, social movement and social system. Interpersonal identity development is comprised of three elements, Categorizing individuals into categories, identification or associating people with groups, and comparing groups. It is also related to symbolic interactionism, and the study of the social relationships between human beings, a field of study developed by George H. Mead, Herbert Blumer, Erving Goffmann and others.

Historical Particularism

Another school of thought is the school of Historical Particularism which stands in contrast to grand and universal theories of socio-political evolution. This approach proposes that cultures develop independently based on their own set of circumstances such as climate, geography, resources and history. This approach also proposes that a culture can only be understood through an in-depth historical study. This technique was further developed by many Anthropologists such as Alfred L. Kroeber, Ruth Benedict, Robert Lowie, Paul Radin, and Edward Sapir. This approach however requires a large quantum of historical data, which may not always be possible to obtain.

Dialectical approaches

Dialectical approaches which involve a reconciliation of two contradictory viewpoints were initially propounded by Hegel and reinterpreted by Marx, and other approaches such as Rawl's reflective equilibrium, standard Devil's advocacy & Brainstorming techniques etc are also widely used. Dialectical approaches have been used in some form from the days of Plato and Aristotle, and will be necessary in arriving at via media solutions.

Neo-centrism

We had also introduced the concept of 'Neo-Centrism' (or simply, Centrism) in an earlier paper, and we reiterate the core sections of this philosophy here. 'Neo-Centrism' may be defined as a neutral and an ideology-free approach to all issues pertaining to a study of culture, social studies, historiography, economics and various other fields, (This is almost no holds-barred approach with potential widespread applicability) and an alternative and an "in-between approach" to the approaches espoused by the left and the right in specific circumstances. It is also an approach with a long-term orientation and seeks out solutions that work across the dimensions of time and space. Neo-Centrism proposes a rejection of right-wing, left-wing and other ideologically-driven interpretations of history to the extent they are anti-truth and anti-science. Neo-Centrism from this perspective is primarily based on a reconciliation and elimination of paradoxes in any form, the identification of which will be at the heart of the success of this approach. Neo-Centrism can be extended and applied to Political philosophy, religious studies, debates relating to theism versus atheism, historiography, etc many of which will have a bearing on macro-cultural environment, psychology, and identity formation.

Hermeneutical Study

Hermeneutics is the theory and method of interpretation of religious texts, philosophical texts, and wisdom literature. It also has wide applications in theology, history and law. It has spawned wide variations in the context of different religions. The Mimamsa school was popular in the context of the Vedas and led to new philosophical theories. While the original objective of hermeneutics was to acquire a meaning of religious texts, from our view hermeneutical studies have a totally different objective i.e. to study the impact of religion and religious texts on societal and cultural orientations, mindspace, mind-orientations, thoughtworlds, worldviews, and identity formation, and must be studied in conjunction with the entire religious superstructure. It must also assess the impact these texts have on their followers, and the size of the following in relation to the total population. It will also give us an idea of how easy or painful change can be, and the limits of change.

Possible alternatives to Religion

Let us now examine some possible alternatives to religion, and discuss whether these can be an antidote to current religious practices or whether they can eventually replace them. The Anthropological theorist's domain is restricted to formulating, defining and extending Anthropological methods. It is not the Anthropologists duty to speculate on the nature and direction of religious reform, nor can he have any control over historical accidents, but he can lay in place the groundwork to make that happen, and

speculate what effect that can have on individuation and identity-formation. The fact remains that these movements have failed to break the stranglehold of organized religion, and the Anthropologist can theorize on this and offer his critical insights, in the manner that we have done. He can offer theories based on valid and viable Anthropological methods and data, on how approaches in pedagogy and policy can mold religious beliefs, and serve as a neutralizing, countervailing force, while leaving aside a margin for uncontrollable factors such as historical accidents or random political movements:

1. Atheism

Atheism may be defined as the idea or belief that God or any supernatural force does not exist. This term is attested to the 5th century BCE in Ancient Greece. It had a negative connotation in early society, and was often equated with sin or an anti-establishment stance. It was only with the rise of freethinking and the spirit of rationalist enquiry associated with the enlightenment that the idea of atheism became more fashionable and mainstream. Atheism ranges in diversity from dogmatic atheism to the more reasonable position that the onus rests on theists to provide proof for the existence of God. While the Biblical theory of creation is almost certainly false, there are many definitions of God, many mutually exclusive, and some only view God as a cosmic force. Atheism may also be categorized into weak and strong atheism, and implicit or explicit atheism. The former is the absence of a theistic belief without a conscious rejection of it. Explicit atheists are outspoken in their idea of a criticism of a God, claiming that the idea of God is a pseudoscience or a primordial science offering pre-scientific explanations for inexplicable phenomena. While Richard Dawkins, Sam Harris and Christopher Hitchens are outspoken atheists and represent the new atheism movement of the 2000's, others argue that the idea of atheism is unscientific given that the idea of God is ill-defined.

Others like John Gray have also stated that science can almost never replace religion, as these serve two very different roles in society, a view that we also endorse. We cannot also resist the temptation of equating this to ivory tower intellectualism, and per the doctrine of neo-centrism, this is bound to throw up counter-reactions and reinforce belief in religious sects and new age movements. Indeed, this may have already happened. This would be vindicated by the results of Win-Gallup international studies which showed that only 13% were convinced atheists in 2012, and this declined further to 11% in 2015, and 9% in 2017, and the vast majority either believed in some supernatural force or remained neutral and non-committal. Some other studies show the percentage of atheists to be as low as two percent. The 2019 Templeton Prize winner Marcelo Gleiser has gone on to state that the idea of atheism is inconsistent with the scientific method given the fact that the concept of God is ill-defined, and that science does not automatically kill God, either conceptually or in the popular sense. As Cardinal Baronius once stated, "The intention of the holy ghost is to teach us how one goes to heaven, not how heaven goes." This idea was also reaffirmed by Galileo in his famous letter to Grand Duchess Christina in 1615.

2. Religions reform

Religious reform aims at reform of religious teaching with a view to make them more compatible with the needs of society. It may be carried out when the religious community believed that the community has deviated from the original faith, or when the circumstances have changed to such an extent that

changes in the original doctrine are inevitable. Religious reform may be driven from within or imposed from an external source. It may be deep-rooted or marginal, continuous or sporadic, intermittent or piecemeal. Examples of religious reform have included the protestant movements of the 16th century, which posed a challenge to the Roman Catholic Church. Martin Luther was the most important figure of the Protestant movement which spread to many parts of Europe. Hindu reformist movements introduced reform in Hinduism to purge it of superstition, blind faith and the caste system. This was induced by contact with Western cultures due to colonialism, and was inspired by Romanticism and esotericism. Prominent religious movements in Hinduism have included the Brahma Samaj which was founded in 1828 by Raja Ram Mohan Roy, the Arya Samaj founded in 1875 by Swami Dayananda, the Neo-Vedanta of Swami Vivekananda, etc. Islamic reformist movements have also sprung up from time to time. These include Islamic modernism which emerged in the nineteenth century and attempts to reconcile the Islamic faith with modernity. Various movements attempting to reconcile Islam with modernism and progressivism have emerged, and modern reformist movements have included the Muslim reform movement of the twenty-first century.

3. Rationalism

Rationalism represents the epistemological view that regards reason as the chief source and test for knowledge, and that truth can be arrived at through intellectual endeavour or deductive methods. The rationalist movement gathered momentum during the age of reason in the Seventeenth Century, and major figures were Descartes, Leibniz and Spinoza. However, Greek thinkers such as Pythagoras, Plato and Socrates are also considered to be rationalists. Prominent Indian rationalist have included R.P Paranjpye, Abraham Kovvur, and Sanal Edamaraku. There are a range of rationalist standpoints from the moderate position that reason has precedence over all other ways of acquiring knowledge to the extreme position that reason is the unique path to knowledge. Rationalism is often equated to, and contrasted with empiricism which relies on sense experience. On the other hand, rationalism relies on logic and reasoning. From our perspective however, rationalism is only a means and not an end by itself, and can only illuminate the path to knowledge and enlightenment. It is a way of thinking that can counterbalance religious dogma and orthodoxy, and rationalist movements have failed to dent the popularity of religion. .

4. Agnosticism

The term agnosticism is derived from the Greek word 'agnosis' which means without knowledge. Agnosticism represents the view that the existence of God or the supernatural is unprovable, and that human reason is incapable of providing rational grounds to prove or disprove the idea that God exists. This idea has found some support in thinkers such as Biologist Thomas Henry Huxley who coined the term and Austrian Philosopher Karl Popper over the ages. Many modern thinkers like Jawaharlal Nehru were also self-confessed agnostics. However, this idea is invariably associated with intellectualism, and may not appeal to broader segments of society, let alone replace formal and organized religion.

5. Religious syncretism

Syncretic religions are amalgam of more than one faith, and these have manifested themselves from time to time in different contexts. These typically arise when multiple religious practices exist in close proximity to one another, or when two different ideologies come in contact with one other. This was a feature of Hellenistic Ancient Greek tradition, and the Romans likewise merged the tradition of the Celts and the Germanic peoples into their own. Likewise, Thomas Aquinas made a brilliant attempt to synthesize Christian theology and Aristotelean philosophy in the thirteenth century. The Mughal emperor Akbar created a new faith called Din-i Ilahi or Tawhid-i-Ilahi in 1582 AD by merging Hinduism and Islam besides other religions, but it failed, and barely attracted 21 followers. It was defunct by 1606, and a revolt from the Islamic orthodoxy sealed its fate. Attempts to resurrect it a century later also failed. The Baha'i faith is also seen as syncretic, incorporating many tenets of Islam and the Babi religion, and was founded by Bahauallah in 1863. Adherents of the Baha'i faith were heavily persecuted against in Iran where the religion was founded. The Religion of Humanity was another secular religion created by the French philosopher August Comte. Even though this led to the institution of secular societies and secular humanist organizations in the West, the movement itself largely failed. Syncretic movements are often thwarted by the religious clergy, and often the most well-meaning of movements have failed.

6. Deism

Deism is an idea derived from the Latin word 'deus' meaning God, and as an idea, it is at least half a millennium old. It posits that God exists and created the universe but that He does not subsequently manifest himself in, or interact with the created world, choosing to administer it through natural laws. It also rejects divine revelation and organized religion. Thus, God was described as "The divine clockmaker", "The author of nature and scripture", and "The divine redeemer". Others such as Benedict Spinoza rejected the traditional concept of God, referring to it as the immutable structure of an impersonal cosmic order. These ideas only had some appeal among intellectuals during the enlightenment. It would imply that this approach has its limits and may not have mass appeal. Deism is considered to exist in classical and modern forms. The classical view takes a "cold" approach by asserting the non-intervention of a deity, while modern approaches can be either "warm" or "cold". Deism has had notable adherents, and Isaac Newton, who is described as a deist or a nicodemite, may have been one among them. Deism has seen a modern revival in countries such as Turkey, though it is frowned upon by the religious clergy, and is seen as a path out of Islam towards full-blown atheism. Deists also lack a religious, moral, spiritual or philosophical guide, and deist movements often fail to take into account the specifics of a culture.

7. Freethought

Freethought is an epistemological viewpoint which states that positions regarding faith should be formed only the basis of scientific inquiry, logic, reason and empiricism, and not authority, revelation, tradition and dogma. Followers of freethought are known as freethinkers. According to the Oxford English dictionary, as freethinker is "a person who forms their own ideas and opinions, rather than accepting those of other people, especially in religious teaching", and of freethinking as "The free exercise of reason in matters of religious belief, unrestrained by deference to authority, the adoption of

the principles of a freethinker.” This approach is synonymous with intellectual elitism, and may lack popular or mass appeal.

8. Skeptical enquiry

Scepticism is a questioning attitude towards ideas, opinions or beliefs that might otherwise be accepted uncritically by the layman or other untrained individuals. According to the Skeptics society, “Scepticism is a provisional approach to claims. It is the application of reason to any and all ideas—no sacred cows allowed. In other words, scepticism is a method, not a position.” Scepticism must also be differentiated from pathological over-scepticism which is also known as skeptopathy, and is harmful to the cause of science. The concept of skeptical enquiry can never be a replacement for religion given the fact that it can at best be limited to a few critical thinkers, and can never be a mass position. It must be used in conjunction with other religious or spiritual movements, existing or as yet unborn.

9. Secular humanism

Secular humanism is a philosophy that embraces human reason, ethics and philosophical naturalism while rejecting religious dogma, superstition, pseudo-science and supernaturalism as the basis of logic and decision-making. This concept can be traced to pre-Socratic writings though it took birth during the renaissance. Secular humanists believe that humans are capable of being ethical or moral without the belief in religion or God. Secular humanists subscribe to the philosophy of utilitarianism to maximize happiness and well-being for a large majority of the population, ethical or moral naturalism, evolutionary ethics, or a science of morality. In 1980, a Secular Humanist declaration was made by what is now known as the Council for Secular Humanism, and Secular humanism is a widespread movement popular among the intellectual elite in different parts of the world.

10. Positivism

Positivism is a philosophical system which accepts only concepts that can be scientifically verified, and are capable of logical or methodological proof. Thus untestable metaphysical concepts are usually rejected. Thus, information derived from sensory experience and interpreted through reason and logic forms the basis of all certain knowledge. Thus, positivism is based on empiricism. Thus introspective and intuitive knowledge is often rejected, as are Metaphysics and Theology, to the extent they cannot be validated by sense experience. The modern concept of positivism was developed by French Philosopher August Comte, though its predecessors date back to Greek times. The French sociologist Emile Durkheim also positioned sociological positivism as a foundation for sociological research. The idea that Positivism could be applied in Social science was rejected by Max Weber and Georg Simmel who founded the anti-positivist school. This proposes that Social sciences require a different epistemology, and that human biases and prejudices and tools and methods used by social researchers cloud understanding of social issues. Neo-positivists attempted to reject metaphysical speculation and reduce statements and propositions to pure logic. Later, Karl Popper, Willard van Orman Quine and Thomas Kuhn formulated the school of Post-positivism or post-empiricism which pursues objectivity by understanding the dangers of personal biases and conjectures. This approach also states that the reality can only be understood imperfectly, and probabilistically.

11. Empiricism

Empiricism is the idea that all knowledge is based on experiences derived from the senses, and that all knowledge is post priori, or derived from sensory experiences. It was stimulated by the rise of experiential sciences, and was developed in the seventeenth and eighteenth centuries, particularly by John Locke, George Berkeley, and David Hume, though many concepts are often traced to the Greeks, to the thirteenth century Italian scholar Thomas Aquinas and to the sixteenth century philosopher Sir Francis Bacon who worked on the Greek philosopher Aristotle's ideas. Aristotle is said to have famously remarked in this regard that all knowledge began with the senses, and may thus be regarded as the earliest empiricist. Hume likewise stated that all reliable human knowledge was based on sense impressions. This doctrine is contrasted with rationalism which supposes that knowledge can be built up through logic, reasoning and intuition, and the latter is more of an a priori position. However, empiricism has its obvious limits, and could be used to arrive at fallacious proposals such as geocentrism, as opposed to rationalism which could be used in the formulation of more complex theories. Nonetheless, it is an important part of the scientific method because hypotheses and theories often need to be tested through the senses to be considered accurate.

12. Liberalism

Liberalism is a political and a moral philosophy based on liberty, individual autonomy, equality of opportunity, equality before the law, difference-blind rights (Liberal egalitarianism) and the protection of individual rights. Liberalism also supports freedom of speech, racial equality, gender equality, democracy, secularism and human rights, and individual rights and freedom, taking recourse to John Stuart Mill's Harm principle which stated that action could be taken against individuals only as a last resort, and only if they harmed society or other individuals. Many have also supported capitalism, internationalism and free markets, and have frowned upon organized religion and dogma besides royal monopolies and barriers to trade. Liberalism can be traced to the Age of Enlightenment, when it became popular among Western Philosophers and Economists.

13. Spirituality

Spirituality is a science that seeks answers to philosophical questions such as the search for the meaning of life, and self-realization. It may or may not include a belief in God, a spiritual person is often caring, loving, truthful and believes more in human values than in organized religion. The term originated in the French word esprit or spirit, which in turn derived from the Latin word spiritus or soul. Non-religious spirituality can be traced to Late Antiquity, though such movements never became mass movements, like similar movements of modern times. There are wide-ranging definitions of spirituality, and McCarroll produced as many as twenty-seven distinct definitions of the term spirituality. (McCarroll 2005)

14. Morality

Morality is a system of values and principles of conduct that seek to distinguish between right and wrong, and good and bad behaviour. This usually encompasses a standard set of moral and ethics that

can be applied across contexts, and can help assess to what extent behaviour and actions are right or wrong. The term originated from the Latin word 'moralis', which means manner, character or proper behaviour. The idea of morality has spawned many religious concepts such as ethics or moral philosophy which deals with questions of morality. The codification of ethics, codes of conduct, and social mores and norms has also pre-occupied philosophers from ancient times, though these have never become mass movements or have dented the powerful impact of religion in most societies. The earliest documented code of ethics is that of Hammurabi of Ancient Babylon which dates to 1754 BC. Philosophers such as Immanuel Kant have also provided moral theories, while the Dalai Lama's and Sam Harris's attempts to provide universal ethics in recent times are also noteworthy. Ethics can also be classified as normative (rule of right and wrong) or descriptive (how people perceive ethics), but moral studies in most school systems are often patchy, and in most cases do not even exist.

15. New age movements

New Age religious or spiritual movements are religious, ethical and spiritual groups with relatively modern origins, many dating to the 1970's, or later. They are usually novel, and outside of, or on the fringes of existing religions. They often have eclectic, occult or esoteric underpinnings and are usually frowned upon by mainstream society and the religious clergy as well. There is relatively less scope for such movements in rigid religions such as Islam which frown upon Bida'h or religious innovation which is equated to heretical doctrine or heresy, though they are more common in Hinduism as fringe movements. The Christian church often refers to such movements as paganism or neo-paganism. These have usually attracted people from upper middle class or middle class background backgrounds, and the relationship of its practitioners with such movements has been ephemeral. It is highly unlikely, therefore, that these can ever check organized religion, or replace them.

Summary of Discussion and some additional Solutions

In addition to the recommendations we have provided throughout our paper, there are some additional possible solutions. These solutions are integrated with our earlier recommendations drawn from our earlier work, and will be integrated with our future papers in an ongoing process of integration. We had discussed societal or cultural orientations at great length in our previous papers, and understanding these thoroughly would form the basis of cultural remediation to make them more desirable or compatible with other contemporary societies around the world. This would naturally encompass within its purview, religious and social reform as well. This would also be linked to individual mind-orientations, thought worlds and worldviews which can be assessed through a variety of ethnographic methods and techniques, including quantitative and qualitative ones. Mindspace can be analyzed by breaking it down into compartments and linking it to cultural taxonomies; movements within a cultural element and across elements can then be understood to achieve cultural modelling, and the impact changes to environment and education can bring about. It can help us understand through the Ethnography of Mindspace, how, and in which contexts undesirable elements can be purged from the human psyche. The ethnography of enculturation will likewise help us understand how different mind-orientations came about, and how these are linked to cultural or societal orientations.

Pedagogical reform is another crucial area that may need to be taken up. We had discussed Anthropological Pedagogy as a distinct field of study in our earlier paper, and this could invariably be linked with the sociology of science, and the sociology of parasceince which can help us understand the importance and indispensability of religion in modern contexts. The nature of education is undoubtedly more important than education itself. Even educated Hindus and Muslims in India, cannot think beyond their own religion. As a matter of fact, some don't even have ideas on anything other than religion. Education has failed to stem recruitment into extremist groups, and this phenomenon can be witnessed across religions.

This may require the teaching of several aspects of Anthropology in the school curriculum, and not just Darwin's theory of evolution. This could include physical and cultural Anthropology, and indeed even identity theory. Historiography would be another medium through which cultural change can be brought about, and this is one of the core philosophies of our twenty-first century school of historiography. Indeed, the reduction of cognitive dissonance must be one of the cornerstones of any education system. Ethnography would be another core driver, and must be carried out in multicultural contexts to prevent cultural bias.

The globalization and the prevention of intellectual elitism, and ivory tower scholarship would be at the core of our approach, as we understand the limits to intellectualism. Macro-level reform, and the formulation of concepts that can be applied across geographies must be given top priority, as these will bring about cascading changes across levels. However, culture specific action plans must also be given importance. Identity dilution and neutralization in the core theme of our approach, and all remediation and action will be directed towards neutralizing and diluting identity across a variety of contexts to the extent it is achievable and desirable. Thus, an active hunt must be made for identity diluters at all times, and those who work at all levels such as global levels, the level of a culture or individual levels, while acknowledging that there are obvious limits to identity dilution and neutralization. Identity dilution or neutralization will also promote better human values, and affect the process of enculturation and acculturation positively by downplaying negative attributes such as aggressiveness, besides leading to a greater harmony and peace both within and across cultures.

Conclusion

The epitaph of religion and religious dogma has been written many times, but the demise of religion did not come to pass. Attempting to do away with organized religion in the near to midterm would be an endeavour and an exercise in futility. This has been attempted many times, but religion has always rebounded stronger than ever before. Religious dogma and religious conflicts are stronger than ever before in recent memory, even in societies formerly known for their tolerance to diversity. Thus we can make several predictions; most forms of religion will continue to exist into the foreseeable future; likewise belief in God will continue to exist into the indefinite future; scholars of all hues and colours must recognize that man is not a machine, man is a social animal; The objective of an Anthropologist would be to ensure that religious conflicts are minimized, and that man lives in harmony and tranquillity. Ideological polarization is not the way; it leads to polarization in the real world. One can see

the abuse of religion in freethinker sites. Will this impact the future of religion? While religious shifts cannot be modelled anthropologically, parallels can indeed be sought from history. This can be achieved by avoiding ivory tower scholarship, and pursuing multi-cultural scholarship, among other things. While religious shifts have happened slowly in the past, religions may not collapse like communism. If they do, it would require a grand reassessment of many theories. Science has made impressive strides in recent years, but has failed to make a dent in religion, which has emerged stronger than before. Atheism and deism can therefore only have a limited impact, and ivory-tower intellectuals must take this into account.

The issue of identity remains as deeply entrenched as ever before, and everything still boils down to identity, indicating that something is amiss. The issue of Identity is so-all encompassing that it often blinds people to reality, and overrides all sense of what is right and what is wrong. Plenty of examples abound to illustrate this. General Reginald Dyer, the butcher of Amritsar was glorified in some circles in England in the 1920's. Winston Churchill is often eulogized in the West, and his faults readily overlooked. Educated Muslim men still opposed the Muslim instant divorce bill in India in 2019, even though this concept is already illegal in most Muslim nations. Only in some cases can these rules be broken such as a friendship between Saudi Arabia and the USA, but in all such cases pragmatism and other considerations override.

Thus, a two-pronged approach may be in order. In the short term and medium term, attempts must be made to weaken the force of religion, and all identity through the methods specified above particularly the creation of morals and ethics and mandating them in schools. Of course, these must have a regional and local flavor, and must take over as many functions of the religion in question. In the long term, the stage must be set for a scenario where religion has only a minimal role to play. This may take generations, but we can multiply the number of intellectuals and influencers at least, and this would be the way forward. This recommendation is only tentative, and pending detailed ethnographic studies. New religions may again divide, and it is not within the purview of an Anthropologist to generate new ideologies. He can however set in motion a process that will ensure that new ideologies are more in tune with the good of larger segments of the population. Rational and enlightened approaches, moderate, accommodating and secular theism, spiritualism, enlightened moderation and deism must become the hallmark of all religious endeavour in the future, and the Anthropologist can play a crucial role in making this happen. Resultantly, and with the right kind of education systems and scholarly pursuits, categories such as the uninformed theist, the religious dogmatist, and the religious fanatic will be relegated to the background, and eventually left by the wayside. Languages spread in accordance with language dynamics, but linguistic ideologies can be likewise weakened by broadening people's horizons. An Anthropologist has a key role to play in all these areas.

From the age-old position that 'might is right', society must move to the more ideal modern position that 'right is might'; we save this as a catch-phrase: this should be applied in all contexts and situations that matter, and should become a guiding principle of substantial sections of the population to weigh all actions and predict outcomes; this could change the very direction and nature of society in a manner that no other philosophy can; few would deny that this would be one of true traits of intellectualism and positivism in the days to come.